

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

PROLLENIUM US INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ALLERGAN INDUSTRIE, SAS,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2020-00084
Patent 9,089,519

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	15
II.	PERSPECTIVE OF THE POSITA.....	17
	A. POSITAs knew about competitive products and their properties	17
	B. DeVore qualifies as a POSITA	19
	C. DeVore’s opinions are supported by the prior art, as Berkland conceded....	21
	1. Evidence corroborates DeVore’s testimony POSITAs could make the proposed modifications	21
	2. Testing something does not make it unpredictable	22
	3. DeVore articulated sufficient rationales for his opinions	24
III.	FDA DOCUMENTS ARE PRIOR ART	25
I.	GROUNDS 4 AND 5	26
	A. POSITA was motivated to add lidocaine to either Lebreton or P050047	26
	B. Ground 4: Expectation of success	29
	C. Ground 5: Expectation of success	32
	D. The totality of the art suggests success.....	33
	E. Performance features are inherent and expected.....	35
II.	GROUNDS 1-3.....	39
III.	CONCLUSION.....	41

PETITIONER'S EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Description	Filed in this case?
1001	U.S. Patent No. 9,089,519 to Lebreton (issued July 28, 2015)(the '519 patent or the challenged patent)	X
1002	Declaration of Dale Devore, Ph.D.	X
1003	CV of Dale Devore, Ph.D.	X
1004	Steven Fagien & Arnold W. Klein, <i>A Brief Overview and History of Temporary Fillers: Evolution, Advantages, and Limitations</i> , Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery, Vol. 120 Supplement 6S, 8S–16S (Nov. 2007)	X
1005	Mary P. Lupo, <i>Hyaluronic Acid Fillers in Facial Rejuvenation</i> , Seminars in Cutaneous Medicine and Surgery, Vol. 25, No. 6, 122–126 (Sept. 2006)	X
1006	Seth L. Matarraso, <i>Understanding and Using Hyaluronic Acid</i> , Aesthetic Surgery Journal Vol. 24, No. 4, 361–364 (July/August 2004)	X
1007	Rhoda S. Narins & Paul H. Bowman, <i>Injectable Skin Fillers</i> , Clinics in Plastic Surgery, Vol. 32, Issue 2, 151–162 (April 2005)	X
1008	Clifford P. Clark III, <i>Animal-Based Hyaluronic Acid Fillers: Scientific and Technical Considerations</i> , Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery, Vol. 120 Supplement 6S, 27S-32S (Nov. 2007)	X
1009	Kevin C. Smith, <i>Practical Use of Juvéderm: Early Experience</i> , Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery, Vol. 120 Supplement 6S, 67S-73S (Nov. 2007)	X
1010	Rod J. Rohrich, et al., <i>The Role of Hyaluronic Acid Fillers (Restylane) in Facial Cosmetic Surgery: Review and Technical Considerations</i> , Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery, Vol. 120 Supplement 6S, 41S-54S (Nov. 2007)	X
1011	Michael H. Gold, <i>Use of Hyaluronic Acid Fillers for the Treatment of the Aging Face</i> , Clinical Interventions in Aging, Vol. 2, Issue 3, 369-376 (Sept. 2007)	X

Exhibit No.	Description	Filed in this case?
1012	Brian M. Kinney, <i>Injecting Puragen Plus Into the Nasolabial Folds: Preliminary Observations of FDA Trial</i> , <i>Aesthetic Surgery Journal</i> , Vol. 26, Issue 6, 741-748 (Nov. 2006), also available at https://academic.oup.com/asj/article/26/6/741/238376	X
1013	U.S. Provisional App. Serial No. 61/085,956 (filed Aug. 4, 2008) (priority document for challenged patent)	X
1014	Gary D. Monheit & Chad L. Prather, <i>Juvéderm: A Hyaluronic Acid Dermal Filler</i> , <i>Journal of Drugs in Dermatology</i> , Vol. 6, Issue 11, 1091-1095 (Nov. 2007)	X
1015	Leslie S. Baumann, et al., <i>Comparison of Smooth-Gel Hyaluronic Acid Dermal Fillers with Cross-linked Bovine Collagen: A Multicenter, Double-masked, Randomized, Within-Subject Study</i> , <i>Dermatologic Surgery</i> , Vol. 33 Supplement 2, S128-S135 (Dec. 2007)	X
1016	Deborah, S. Sarnoff, et al., <i>Comparison of Filling Agents for Lip Augmentation</i> , <i>Aesthetic Surgery Journal</i> , Vol. 28, Issue 5, 556-563 (September/October 2008)	X
1017	Michael S. McCracken, et al., <i>Hyaluronic Acid Gel (Restylane) Filler for Facial Rhytids: Lessons Learned From American Society of Ophthalmic Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery Member Treatment of 286 Patients</i> , <i>Ophthalmic Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery</i> , Vol. 22, Issue 3, 188-191 (May-Jun 2006)	X
1018	Barry L. Eppley & Babak Dadvand, <i>Injectable Soft-Tissue Fillers: Clinical Overview</i> , <i>Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery</i> , Vol. 118, Issue 4, 98e-106e (Sept. 15, 2006)	X
1019	M.J.A. Sapijaszko, <i>Dermal Fillers: Ever-Expanding Options for Esthetic Use</i> , <i>Skin Therapy Letter</i> , Vol. 12, No. 8, 4-7 (Oct. 2007)	X
1020	<i>Update on Drugs</i> , <i>Skin Therapy Letter</i> , Vol. 13, No. 3, 8 (Apr. 2008)	X

Exhibit No.	Description	Filed in this case?
1021	<p>Carol A. Toth, et al., <i>Preclinical evaluation of a novel hyaluronic acid 28 mg/ml lidocaine 0.3% stable combination product</i>, (abstract), Journal of the American Academy of Dermatology, Vol. 56, No. 2, AB94 (Feb. 2007), Abstract P1039</p> <p><i>and</i></p> <p>C. William Hanke, et al., <i>Effectiveness and durability of a hyaluronic acid 28 mg/ml, lidocaine 0.3% stable combination product as demonstrated in a multicenter, randomized trial</i> (abstract), Journal of the American Academy of Dermatology, Vol. 56, No. 2, AB94 (Feb. 2007), Abstract P1040</p>	X
1022	Gary D. Monheit, <i>Hyaluronic Acid Fillers: Hylaform and Captique</i> , Facial Plastic Surgery Clinics, Vol. 15, No. 1, 77 (Feb. 2007)	X
1023	Excerpts from file history of U.S. Application 12/393,884 (filed 2/26/2009)	X
1024	Lebreton Declaration	X
1025	Yu jia Cui, et al., <i>The Comparison of Physicochemical Properties of Four Cross-Linked Sodium Hyaluronate Gels with Different Cross-Linking Agents</i> , Advanced Materials Research, Vols. 396-398, 1506-1512 (2012)	X
1026	Excerpts from file history of U.S. Application 13/419,079 (filed 3/13/2012)	X
1027	Claim Construction Order, <i>Allergan USA, Inc. v. Medicis Aethetics, Inc.</i> , No. 8:13-cv-01436-AG-JPR, slip op. (C.D. Cal. Aug. 12, 2014), ECF No. 79, <i>also available at</i> 2014 WL 5488895	X
1028	U.S. Provisional App. Serial No. 61/087,934 (filed Aug. 11, 2008) (priority document for challenged patent)	X
1029	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2006/0194758 to Lebreton (Lebreton), published Aug. 31, 2006	X
1030	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2005/0136122 to Sadozai et al. (Sadozai), published June 23, 2005	X
1031	CTA Product Insert (“Label”)	X

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.