

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

PROLLENIUM US INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ALLERGAN INDUSTRIE, SAS,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2020-00084
Patent 9,089,519

PETITION FOR INTER PARTES REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 9,089,519

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. REQUIREMENTS FOR IPR UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.104.....	1
A. Grounds for Standing.....	1
B. Identification of Challenge and Prior Art	1
1. Weinkle and U.S. 2010/0028438	2
2. P050047/S005	2
3. Lebreton, Sadozai, and Kinney	3
4. PMA P050047	4
III. STATE OF THE ART BEFORE THE EARLIEST CLAIMED PRIORITY DATE	6
A. Background of HA Dermal Fillers.....	6
B. Four Primary Crosslinkers Used For Dermal Fillers.....	7
C. Lidocaine Used In Crosslinked HA Fillers To Mitigate Pain.....	8
IV. THE CHALLENGED PATENT	11
A. The Challenged Claims	12
B. The Prosecution History	13
C. Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	14
V. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	15
A. Sterile (claims 1, 3, and 5).....	15
B. Freely released in vivo (claims 2, 4, 8)	16
C. Stable (claims 5-7).....	17
VI. CLAIMS 1-4 ARE NOT ENTITLED TO A PRIORITY DATE BEFORE APRIL 1, 2014.....	18
A. Law of Priority Claims	19
B. Claims 1-4 Are Not Described by The Priority Documents.....	20
1. There is no literal support for the claimed features	20
2. The disclosed species do not support the claims.....	22

VII. CLAIMS 1-8 ARE UNPATENTABLE26

A. Grounds 1-3: Claims 1-4 Are Not Entitled to Their Claimed Priority Date And Are Anticipated By P050047/S005, Weinkle, And The '438 Application26

1. Ground 1: Anticipation by P050047/S00527

2. Ground 2: Anticipation by Weinkle30

3. Ground 3: Anticipation by the '438 publication33

B. Grounds 4 And 5: Claims 1-8 Are Obvious Over Lebreton In View of Sadozai, And P050047 In View Of Kinney, Regardless Of The Effective Priority Date.....34

1. Ground 4: Claims 1-8 would have been obvious over Lebreton in view of Sadozai.....35

a. Motivation to combine.....36

b. Detailed claim analysis39

(i) Claim 139

(ii) Claim 242

(iii) Claims 3-444

(iv) Claims 5-845

2. Ground 5: Claims 1-8 would have been obvious over PMA P050047 in view of Kinney.....46

a. Motivation to combine.....46

b. Detailed claim analysis47

(i) Claim 147

(ii) Claim 249

(iii) Claims 3-450

(iv) Claims 5-851

3. Allergan cannot rebut the *prima facie* case of obviousness established above.....52

a. The uncorroborated Inventor’s Declaration does not accurately characterize the state of the art53

- b. Example 4 does not provide evidence of non-obviousness.....56
- c. Cui is not relevant.....60
- 4. Summary61
- VIII. DISCRETIONARY FACTORS FAVOR INSTITUTION62
 - A. Section 325(d) factors.....63
- IX. CONCLUSION68
- X. MANDATORY NOTICES UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.8.....68
 - A. Real Parties in Interest.....68
 - B. Related Matters.....68
 - C. Lead and Back-Up Counsel and Service Information.....69

PETITIONER'S EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 9,089,519 to Lebreton (issued July 28, 2015) (the '519 patent or the challenged patent)
1002	Declaration of Dale Devore, Ph.D.
1003	CV of Dale Devore, Ph.D.
1004	Steven Fagien & Arnold W. Klein, <i>A Brief Overview and History of Temporary Fillers: Evolution, Advantages, and Limitations</i> , Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery, Vol. 120 Supplement 6S, 8S–16S (Nov. 2007)
1005	Mary P. Lupo, <i>Hyaluronic Acid Fillers in Facial Rejuvenation</i> , Seminars in Cutaneous Medicine and Surgery, Vol. 25, No. 6, 122–126 (Sept. 2006)
1006	Seth L. Matarraso, <i>Understanding and Using Hyaluronic Acid</i> , Aesthetic Surgery Journal Vol. 24, No. 4, 361–364 (July/August 2004)
1007	Rhoda S. Narins & Paul H. Bowman, <i>Injectable Skin Fillers</i> , Clinics in Plastic Surgery, Vol. 32, Issue 2, 151–162 (April 2005)
1008	Clifford P. Clark III, <i>Animal-Based Hyaluronic Acid Fillers: Scientific and Technical Considerations</i> , Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery, Vol. 120 Supplement 6S, 27S-32S (Nov. 2007)
1009	Kevin C. Smith, <i>Practical Use of Juvéderm: Early Experience</i> , Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery, Vol. 120 Supplement 6S, 67S-73S (Nov. 2007)
1010	Rod J. Rohrich, et al., <i>The Role of Hyaluronic Acid Fillers (Restylane) in Facial Cosmetic Surgery: Review and Technical Considerations</i> , Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery, Vol. 120 Supplement 6S, 41S-54S (Nov. 2007)
1011	Michael H. Gold, <i>Use of Hyaluronic Acid Fillers for the Treatment of the Aging Face</i> , Clinical Interventions in Aging, Vol. 2, Issue 3, 369-376 (Sept. 2007)
1012	Brian M. Kinney, <i>Injecting Puragen Plus Into the Nasolabial Folds: Preliminary Observations of FDA Trial</i> , Aesthetic Surgery Journal, Vol. 26, Issue 6, 741-748 (Nov. 2006), also available at https://academic.oup.com/asj/article/26/6/741/238376

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.