

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

MYLAN PHARMACEUTICALS INC., TEVA PHARMACEUTICALS USA,
INC., WATSON LABORATORIES, INC., DR. REDDY'S LABORATORIES,
INC., DR. REDDY'S LABORATORIES, LTD., and SUN
PHARMACEUTICALS INDUSTRIES LTD.¹

Petitioner,

v.

MERCK SHARP & DOHME CORP.
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2020-00040

U.S. Patent 7,326,708 B2

PETITIONERS' REPLY

¹ Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc. and Watson Laboratories, Inc. were joined as a party to this proceeding via Motion for Joinder in IPR2020-01045; Dr. Reddy's Laboratories, Inc. and Dr. Reddy's Laboratories, Ltd. were joined as a party to this proceeding via a Motion for Joinder in IPR2020-01060; and Sun Pharmaceuticals Industries Ltd. was joined as a party to this proceeding via Motion for Joinder in IPR2020-01072.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | Page |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|
| 1. Claims 1-3, 17, 19, and 21-23 Are Anticipated (Grounds 1 & 2)..... | 2 |
| a. Overview | 2 |
| b. Two Well-Defined Lists..... | 4 |
| c. The Uncontested Reproduction of WO498 Produces 1:1 Sitagliptin DHP Every Time | 5 |
| d. Dr. Matzger Avoided Reproducing the Prior Art | 8 |
| 1. Claim 3 | 10 |
| 2. Claims 17 and 19..... | 11 |
| 1. Claims 21-23 | 11 |
| 2. Claims 1-4, 17, 19, and 21-23 Would Have Been Obvious (Grounds 3-5)..... | 15 |
| a. Merck Has Failed to Antedate WO498..... | 15 |
| b. There Is No Lead Compound Requirement | 19 |
| c. Claims 1-3, 17, 19, and 21-23 (Grounds 3 and 4)..... | 21 |
| d. Claim 4 (Grounds 4 and 5)..... | 23 |
| e. No Unexpected Results | 25 |
| 1. Claims 1-3, 17, 19, and 21-23..... | 25 |
| 2. Claim 4..... | 27 |
| 3. CONCLUSION..... | 28 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

| | Page(s) |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
| Cases | |
| <i>Amgen Inc. v. Hoechst Marion Roussel, Inc.</i> , 314 F.3d 1313 (Fed. Cir. 2003) | 19 |
| <i>Biosig Instruments Inc. v. Nautilus, Inc.</i> , 783 F.3d 1374, 1381 n.3 (Fed. Cir. 2015) | 16 |
| <i>Daicel Corp. v. Celanese International Corp.</i> , IPR2015-00170, Paper 14 (PTAB, Apr. 1, 2015) | 8, 10 |
| <i>DePuy Spine, Inc. v. Medtronic Sofamor Danek, Inc.</i> , 567 F.3d 1314 (Fed. Cir. 2009) | 23 |
| <i>Dynamic Drinkware, LLC v. National Graphics, Inc.</i> , 800 F.3d 1375 (Fed. Cir. 2015) | 15 |
| <i>Ex Parte Hass</i> , Appeal 2017-011069, 2019 WL 2601860 (PTAB, June 12, 2019)..... | 20 |
| <i>Grunenthal GMBH v. Actecip Bioventures II LLC</i> , PGR2019-00027, Paper 24 (PTAB, Jul. 28 2020) | 22 |
| <i>Hospira, Inc. v. Genentech, Inc.</i> , IPR2017-00805, Paper 83 (PTAB, Oct. 3, 2018)..... | 8 |
| <i>In re Aller</i> , 220 F.2d 454 (CCPA 1955) | 25 |
| <i>In re Antor Media Corp.</i> 689 F.3d 1282 (Fed. Cir. 2012) | 19 |
| <i>In re Clarke</i> , 356 F.2d 987 (CCPA 1966) | 16 |
| <i>In re Crish</i> , 393 F.3d 1253 (Fed. Cir. 2004) | 8 |

| | |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| <i>In re De Fano</i> , 480 F.2d 895 (CCPA 1973) | 18 |
| <i>In re Huai-Hung Kao</i> , 639 F.3d 1057 (Fed. Cir. 2011) | 25 |
| <i>In re Mantell</i> , 454 F.2d 1398 (CCPA 1972) | 17 |
| <i>In re Rainer</i> , 390 F.3d 771 (CCPA 1968) | 19 |
| <i>In re Rozmus</i> , 928 F.2d 412, 1991 WL 17232 (Fed. Cir. 1991) | 18 |
| <i>Institut Pasteur v. Facarino</i> , 738 F.3d 1337 (Fed. Cir. 2013) | 24 |
| <i>Interactive Gift Express, Inc. v. Compuserve Inc.</i> , 256 F.3d 1323 (Fed. Cir. 2001) | 12 |
| <i>Merck Sharp & Dohme Corp. v. Sandoz Inc.</i> , 2015 WL 5089543 (D.N.J. Aug. 27. 2015) | 19 |
| <i>Nidec Motor Corp. v. Zhongshan Broad Ocean Motor Co.</i> , 851 F.3d 1270 (Fed. Cir. 2017) | 10 |
| <i>Otsuka Pharmaceutical Co., Ltd. v. Sandoz, Inc.</i> , 678 F.3d 1259 | 20 |
| <i>Pernix Ireland Pain DAC v. Alvogen Malta Operations Ltd.</i> , No. CV 16-cv-00139, 2018 WL 2225113 (D. Del. May 15, 2018) | 16 |
| <i>Perricone v. Medicis Pharm. Corp.</i> , 432 F.3d 1368 (Fed. Cir. 2005) | 4 |
| <i>Pfizer, Inc. v. Apotex Inc.</i> , 480 F.3d 1348 (Fed. Cir. 2007) | 22 |
| <i>Realtime Data, LLC v. Iancu</i> , 912 F.3d 1368 (Fed. Cir. 2019) | 21 |

Sandoz Inc. v. Pharmacyclics LLC,
IPR2019-00865, Paper 29 (PTAB Sept. 24, 2020).....11

Shire LLC v. Amneal Pharm., LLC,
2014 WL 2861430 (D.N.J. June 23, 2014).....5

Unified Patents Inc. v. Harry Heslop.,
IPR2016-01464, Paper 29 (PTAB, Feb. 6, 2018).....16

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.