

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

REMBRANDT WIRELESS TECHNOLOGIES, LP,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2020-00033
U.S. Patent No. 8,023,580

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXHIBIT LIST.....	iii
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES.....	v
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. BACKGROUND	2
A. Summary of the State of Master/Slave Art Prior to the ‘580 Invention 2	
B. Summary of the Problems Identified and Solved by the Claimed Invention 5	
i. The Problems Identified in the ‘580 Patent.....	5
ii. The ‘580 Solution to These Problems in a Master/Slave Setting.....	7
III. THE PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART.....	14
IV. THE PETITION SHOULD BE DENIED BECAUSE THE MOTOROLA PATENTS ARE NOT ANALOGOUS ART	14
V. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	23
i. The Claimed “Master/Slave Relationship” Requires That Slaves Only Respond to the Master When Polled By The Master	23
ii. The Claim Limitation “Indicates An “Impending Change” In Modulation Requires A Change In Modulation That Is Imminent (or About To Happen)	28
iii. The Claimed “Indicates that Reversion from the Master to the Slave Has Reverted to the First Modulation” Requires Both an Indication and a Reversion.....	31

VI. ARGUMENT31

 A. The Petition Should be Denied Under 35 U.S.C. § 314(a).....31

 B. The Office Should Decline to Institute Under 35 U.S.C. § 325(d) ...40

 C. The Petition Should Be Denied On the Merits46

 i. Proposed Grounds 1 and 2 Fail to Present a Reasonable Likelihood
of Prevailing.....46

 ii. Proposed Ground 3 Fails to Present a Reasonable Likelihood of
Prevailing 66

VII. Conclusion76

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Title
EX2001	Declaration of Nikil Jayant
EX2002	HEWLETT-PACKARD JOURNAL, Hewlett-Packard Company, 1998
EX2003	F. Halsall, DATA COMMUNICATIONS, COMPUTER NETWORKS AND OPEN SYSTEMS, Addison-Wesley, 1996
EX2004	A. Goldsmith, WIRELESS COMMUNICATIONS, Cambridge, 2005 (Excerpts)
EX2005	THE RANDOM HOUSE COLLEGE DICTIONARY REVISED EDITION (Excerpts)
EX2006	MERRIAM WEBSTER'S COLLEGIATE DICTIONARY, Merriam-Webster Incorporated, 2012 (Excerpts)
EX2007	Opening Expert Report of Richard T. Mihran, PH.D in Case No. 2:19-CV-00025-JRG (E.D. Tex.)
EX2008	Docket Control Order in Case No. 2:19-CV-00025-JRG (E.D. Tex.)
EX2009	Claim Construction Memorandum and Order in Case No. 2:19-CV-00025-JRG (E.D. Tex.)
EX2010	Non-Confidential Petition and Appendix for Writ of Mandamus in Case 20-112 (Fed. Cir.)
EX2011	Apple's Invalidity Contentions in Case No. 2:19-CV-00025-JRG (E.D. Tex.)

EX2012	<i>Ex Parte</i> Reexamination of U.S. Patent No. 8,457,228 (Reexamination Control No. 90/013809)
EX2013	RESERVED
EX2014	Decision Denying Institution of <i>Inter Partes</i> Review in IPR2015-00555
EX2015	Decision Denying Institution of <i>Inter Partes</i> Review in IPR2014-00889
EX2016	U.S. Patent No. 5,537,398 to Siwiak
EX2017	U.S. Patent No. 5,793,756 to Ayerst
EX2018	U.S. Patent No. 5,649,294 to Ayerst
EX2019	U.S. Patent No. 5,875,387 to Ayerst
EX2020	U.S. Patent No. 5,168,493 to Nelson et al.
EX2021	G. Held, DICTIONARY OF COMMUNICATIONS TECHNOLOGY, Wiley, 1998 (Excerpts)
EX2022	A. Kamerman, THROUGHPUT DENSITY CONSTRAINTS FOR WIRELESS LANS BASED ON DSSS, IEEE, 1996
EX2023	U.S. Patent No. 4,814,984 to Thompson
EX2024	U.S. Patent No. 6,640,268 to Kumar

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.