

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

LENOVO HOLDING COMPANY, INC.,  
LENOVO (UNITED STATES) INC.,  
MOTOROLA MOBILITY LLC

Petitioners

v.

DODOTS LICENSING SOLUTIONS LLC

Patent Owner

---

Case IPR2019-01279  
Patent No. 8,510,407

---

**PETITIONERS' REPLY**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION .....	1
II.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....	2
III.	THE COMBINATION OF HOFF, BERG & Nazem or admitted prior art .....	9
	A. <i>Hoff and Berg</i> Disclose the NIM template.....	9
	B. <i>Berg</i> is Prior Art .....	11
IV.	THE COMBINATION OF RAZAVI & ANDERSON RENDERS THE CLAIMS OBVIOUS.....	13
	A. <i>Razavi and Anderson</i> Disclose the NIM template .....	13
	B. One of Skill in the Art Would Have Combined <i>Razavi</i> and <i>Anderson</i> .....	14
V.	PATENT OWNER DOES NOT SEPARATELY ARGUE THE DEPENDENT CLAIMS.....	15
VI.	PATENT OWNER’S EVIDENCE OF SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS IS UNAVAILING.....	16
	A. Patent Owner Failed to Show Commercial Success .....	17
	B. Patent Owner Also Failed to Show the Requisite Nexus.....	19
VII.	PATENT OWNER’S REMAINING ARGUMENTS ARE EITHER MOOT OR IRRELEVANT.....	20
	A. Institution of this Proceeding Rendered Patent Owner’s Argument Regarding Discretionary Denial Moot.....	21
	B. Patent Owner’s Complaints Regarding “Secret Prior Art” Cannot be Adjudicated by the Board .....	22

VIII. CONCLUSION.....22  
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE .....23  
CERTIFICATE OF WORD COUNT .....24

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

**Page(s)**

**Cases**

*Invitrogen Corp. v. Biocrest Mfg., L.P.*,  
327 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2003) .....5

*Amazon.com, Inc. v. Barnesandnoble.com, Inc.*,  
239 F.3d 1343 (Fed. Cir. 2001) .....9

*Amgen Inc. v. Hoechst Marion Roussel, Inc.*,  
314 F.3d 1313 (Fed. Cir. 2003) .....9

*In re Applied Materials, Inc.*,  
692 F.3d 1289 (Fed. Cir. 2012) .....18

*Atlanta Gas Light Company v. Bennett Regulator Guards, Inc.*,  
IPR2015-00826, Paper 31 .....9

*In re Baxter Travenol Labs.*,  
952 F.2d 388 (Fed. Cir. 1991) .....18

*Brand Mgmt, Inc. v. Menard, Inc.*,  
No. 97-1329, 1998 WL 15241 (Fed. Cir. Jan. 14, 1998).....17

*In re Huang*,  
100 F.3d 135 (Fed. Cir. 1996) .....18

*Innova/Pure Water, Inc. v. Safari Water Filtration Sys., Inc.*,  
381 F.3d 1111 (Fed. Cir. 2004) .....4

*KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.*,  
550 U.S. 398 (2007).....15

*Kyocera Wireless Corp. v. ITC*,  
545 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2008) .....12

*Lenovo, et al. v. DoDots Licensing Solutions*,  
IPR2019-00988, Paper 15.....11, 12

*Omega Eng’g, Inc. v. Raytek Corp.*,  
334 F.3d 1314 (Fed. Cir. 2003) .....7

<i>Ormco Corp. v. Align Tech., Inc.</i> , 463 F.3d 1299 (Fed. Cir. 2006) .....	19
<i>Palo Alto Networks, Inc. v. Finjan, Inc.</i> , IPR2015-01979, Paper 62.....	13
<i>Solder Removal Co. v. U.S. ITC</i> , 582 F.2d 628 (C.C.P.A. 1978) .....	20
<i>Telefonaktiebolaget LM Ericsson v. TCL Corp.</i> , 941 F.3d 1341 (Fed. Cir. 2019) .....	12
<i>Thorner v. Sony Computer Entm't Am. LLC</i> , 669 F.3d 1362 (Fed. Cir. 2012) .....	3
<i>Transocean Offshore Deepwater Drilling, Inc. v. Maersk Drilling USA, Inc.</i> , 699 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2012) .....	16
<i>Verizon Servs. Corp. v. Vonage Holdings Corp.</i> , 503 F.3d 1295 (Fed. Cir. 2007) .....	5
<b>Statutes</b>	
35 U.S.C. § 314(d) .....	21
35 U.S.C. § 325(d) .....	21

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.