

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

FACEBOOK, INC., INSTAGRAM, LLC, and WHATSAPP INC.,
Petitioner

v.

BLACKBERRY LIMITED,
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2019-00925
Patent No. 8,209,634

PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	OVERVIEW OF THE '634 PATENT	2
III.	OVERVIEW OF THE PRIOR ART	5
	A. Ording.....	5
	B. Abiko.....	6
	C. Crumlish.....	9
	D. Dvorak.....	10
	E. McPherson.....	11
IV.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL.....	12
V.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	12
VI.	THE PETITION FAILS TO SHOW A REQUISITE MOTIVATION FOR EACH OF THE PROPOSED LAYERS OF MODIFICATIONS TO ORDING'S COMPUTER (ALL GROUNDS 1-4).....	13
	A. Petitioner fails to satisfy its burden of demonstrating why a POSITA would have been motivated to modify Ording's computer to include Abiko's e-mail program (Elements 1[a] and 1[b]).....	17
	B. The Petition fails to show that, at the time of the invention, a POSITA would have been motivated to modify Ording's icon in the manner proposed (Element 1[c]).....	24
VII.	PETITIONERS' PROPOSED MODIFICATIONS TO ABIKO'S E-MAIL PROGRAM ARE UNSUPPORTED BY THE EVIDENCE AND CONTRARY TO THE SUGGESTIONS IN ABIKO AND CRUMLISH (ALL GROUNDS 1-4)	34
	A. The Petition's further modifications to Abiko's e-mail program based on Crumlish's description of "Pegasus mail" suffer from multiple errors (Element 1[c])	35

1.	<i>The Petition Ignores Crumlish’s Explicit Teaching to Avoid Automatically Moving E-mails to Another Folders, and Also Omits The Next Chapter of Crumlish Repeating This Same Caution</i>	36
2.	<i>The Petition Ignores That Crumlish Describes Solutions That Already Achieved the Purported Motivation Without Petitioner’s Proposed Modification</i>	39
3.	<i>The Petition’s Hindsight Proposal Ignores the Detrimental Effects Resulting From the Fourth and Fifth Modifications.....</i>	41
4.	<i>Even if Abiko was Combined with Crumlish, The Petition Fails to Show that a POSITA Would Have Been Motivated To Modify Abiko To Create the “Sender Information” Menu Using Only “Unread” Messages</i>	42
B.	<i>The Petition’s fourth and fifth proposed modifications ignore Abiko’s stated purpose for creating and displaying Abiko’s “sender selection” menus (Element 1[c]).....</i>	45
VIII.	NO PUBLICATION IN THIS PROCEEDING ACTUALLY DISCLOSES THE STEP OF VISUALLY MODIFYING A “DISPLAYED ICON” TO ACHIEVE THE SPECIFIC TYPE OF “COUNT” RECITED IN THE CLAIMS (ALL GROUNDS 1-4)	51
IX.	THE PETITION OMITTS RELEVANT PORTIONS OF MCPHERSON AND FAILS TO SHOW THAT CLAIMS 6, 12, AND 18 WERE OBVIOUS BY THE COMBINATION IN FURTHER VIEW OF MCPHERSON (GROUNDS 2 AND 4).....	58
X.	CONCLUSION	62

LIST OF EXHIBITS

- EX2001 Declaration of Rajeev Surati, Ph.D.
- EX2002 Corrected Final Ruling on Claim Construction/*Markman* Hearing, *BlackBerry Limited v. Snap Inc.*, Case Nos. CV 18-1844-GW & 18-2693-GW (C.D. Cal. April 5, 2019) (“*Markman* Order”)
- EX2003 Defendant’s Notice and Motion to Stay Pending *Inter Partes* Review, *BlackBerry Limited v. Facebook, Inc. et al.*, Case Nos. 2:18-cv-01844-GW & 2:18-cv-02693-GW (C.D. Cal. April 16, 2019)
- EX2004 Minutes of Status Conference, Initial Thoughts re Joint Report, *BlackBerry Limited v. Facebook, Inc. et al.*, Case Nos. 2:18-cv-01844-GW & 2:18-cv-02693-GW (C.D. Cal. April 22, 2019)
- EX2005 Notice Withdrawing Pre-Institution Motion to Stay In View of Court’s Guidance, *BlackBerry Limited v. Facebook, Inc. et al.*, Case Nos. 2:18-cv-01844-GW & 2:18-cv-02693-GW (C.D. Cal. April 26, 2019)
- EX2006 Minutes of Order In Chambers, Trial Schedule, *BlackBerry Limited v. Facebook, Inc. et al.*, Case Nos. 2:18-cv-01844-GW & 2:18-cv-02693-GW (C.D. Cal. May 15, 2019)
- EX2007 BlackBerry Limited’s Final Election of Asserted Claims, *BlackBerry Limited v. Facebook, Inc. et al.*, Case Nos. 2:18-cv-01844-GW & 2:18-cv-02693-GW (C.D. Cal. May 31, 2019)
- EX2008 Defendant’s Final Election of Asserted Prior Art, *BlackBerry Limited v. Facebook, Inc. et al.*, Case Nos. 2:18-cv-01844-GW & 2:18-cv-02693-GW (C.D. Cal. June 14, 2019)
- EX2009 RESERVED
- EX2010 RESERVED

- EX2011 Order Modifying Scheduling Order *BlackBerry Limited v. Facebook, Inc. et al.*, Case Nos. 2:18-cv-01844-GW & 2:18-cv-02693-GW (C.D. Cal. July 12, 2019)
- EX2012 Order Denying Renewed Motion for Stay, *The California Institute of Technology v. Broadcom Ltd. et al.*, Case No. 2:16-cv-03714-GW (C.D. Cal. October 5, 2017)
- EX2013 Second Declaration of Rajeev Surati, Ph.D.
- EX2014 Apple iMac User's Guide (2002)
- EX2015 Chapter 3 of Crumlish (missing from EX110)
- EX2016 Chapter 20 of McPherson (missing from EX1112)
- EX2017 Transcript of Deposition of Dr. Sandeep Chatterjee (February 5, 2020)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.