01:12:40

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

```
INGENICO, INC.,
          Plaintiff,
                         ) C.A. No. 18-826 (WCB)
V.
IOENGINE, LLC,
           Defendant.
IOENGINE LLC,
           Plaintiff,
                         ) C.A. No. 18-452 (WCB)
V.
PAYPAL HOLDINGS, INC.,
           Defendant. )
                 Monday, December 17, 2018
                 1:55 p.m.
                 Courtroom 4A
                 844 King Street
                 Wilmington, Delaware
```

BEFORE: THE HONORABLE WILLIAM C. BRYSON United States District Court Judge

APPEARANCES:

RICHARDS LAYTON & FINGER, P.A. BY: FREDERICK L. COTTRELL, III, ESQ.

-and-

SUNSTEIN KANN MURPHY & TIMBERS, LLP BY: SHARONA H. STERNBERG, ESQ.

Counsel for the Plaintiff



1	APPEARANCES CONTINUED:
2	
3	
4	SMITH KATZENSTEIN & JENKINS, LLP
5	BY: NEAL C. BELGAM, ESQ.
6	-and-
7	DECHERT LLP BY: NOAH M. LEIBOWITZ, ESQ. BY: GREGORY T. CHUEBON, ESQ.
8	
9	Counsel for the Defendant IOENGINE, LLC
10	
11	MODDIC NICHOLC ADCHE C MINNELL LID
12	MORRIS NICHOLS ARSHT & TUNNELL, LLP BY: JACK B. BLUMENFELD, ESQ.
13	-and-
14	ORRICK HERRINGTON & SUTFLIFFE, LLP BY: JARED BOBROW, ESQ.
15	Counsel for Defendant
16	PayPal Holdings, Inc.
17	
18	
19	- 000 -
20	PROCEEDINGS
21	
01:51:23 22	
01:51:23 23	THE COURT: Thank you. Please be seated. Off
01:53:21 24	the record for a moment.
01:53:22 25	I am allotted here by Amtrak no longer than



04:23:41 1

04:23:43 2

04:23:45 3

04:23:45 4

04:23:48 5

04:23:51 6

04:23:54 7

04:23:57 8

04:24:02 9

04:24:04 10

04:24:09 11

04:24:11 12

04:24:1913

04:24:26 14

04:24:30 15

04:24:37 16

04:24:42 17

04:24:47 18

04:24:52 19

04:24:5620

04:25:01 21

04:25:11 22

04:25:14 23

04:25:18 24

04:25:1925

MR. BLUMENFELD: I don't think this is any in the local rules. I think this is a Ingenico issue, so I'll let Ingenico speak to it.

MS. STERNBERG: I can speak to it. Our concern right now at least in the Ingenico case, we don't know how many claims, there are 189 potential claims that can be asserted, and we haven't received infringement contentions. We're just nervous about limiting the RFA to fifty if there are more than fifty or there are a hundred claims that are at issue because RFA's are useful for contention.

THE COURT: This is a good time to address the number of claims. One area in which I will push back is having too many claims. And 189 is way too many claims. So there are various ways that I can limit the number of claims if you don't, but I would urge you in the strongest terms to go back and weed out those claims. Otherwise -- and I'm sure your experience on this will tell you that if you have anything remotely approaching 189 claims in one case, you're going to spend most of the days, or most of the trial on the long march. And you know what I mean with an asterisk. And now on claim 167, first limitation, can I put a green check next to it? Yes, you can. And the jury is going to hate you. They're going to want to take you around the back and shoot you.

So I would suggest it's in your interest as well



04:25:22 1

04:25:31 3

04:25:35 4

04:25:38 5

04:25:46 6

04:25:53 7

04:25:55 8

04:25:58 9

04:26:00 10

04:26:06 11

04:26:08 12

04:26:09 13

04:26:10 14

04:26:11 15

04:26:14 16

04:26:18 17

04:26:22 18

04:26:28 19

04:26:31 20

04:26:33 21

04:26:34 22

04:26:3623

04:26:3924

04:26:45 25

as the jury's interest and I am going to make sure that it doesn't come to pass that we have 189 claims. I would suggest something more in the neighborhood of ten. I don't know what your experience has been in terms of what works with a jury, but my experience, limited to be sure, but is that anything more than that is just the jury loses track.

MR. CHUEBON: Yes, Your Honor, we have no intention of putting 186 claims in front of the jury.

THE COURT: Thank you. I probably should have asked first and not bore you with the speech. But that's -- I feel really strongly about this.

MR. BLUMENFELD: Your Honor, can I address that for a moment?

THE COURT: Yes.

MR. BLUMENFELD: Unlike in Ingenico, we have received preliminary first round infringement contentions from IOENGINE, and they have, in fact, in the first round asserted 96 claims. And it's less than 189, but 96 is way too many to deal with. It's not only from our point of view a jury issue.

THE COURT: I understand.

MR. BLUMENFELD: It's going to fall on your plate when we start claim construction, it's going to fall on yours when we do invalidity contentions, and yes, there will be invalidity in this case. And we would like to



04:26:47 1

04:26:51 2

04:26:55 3

04:26:59 4

04:27:00 5

04:27:04 6

04:27:12 7

04:27:17 8

04:27:26 9

04:27:30 10

04:27:36 11

04:27:41 12

04:27:46 13

04:27:50 14

04:27:55 15

04:27:59 16

04:28:05 17

04:28:10 18

04:28:11 19

04:28:12 20

04:28:14 21

04:28:1622

04:28:17 23

04:28:21 24

04:28:24 25

discuss with you getting at least a first cut down before claim construction so that we don't have to deal with terms of 96 claims and then probably after claim construction narrowing it again.

THE COURT: Yes. I absolutely think, well, 96 is way too many, way too many. So I would direct you to go back and significantly adjust the number of claims that you plan to raise. And there are -- one thing if you're absolutely adamant about proceeding with a significant number of claims, I will employ all my resources to try to persuade you that that should not be your approach. But in the end if we have to, I'll break the case up, and I'll try the case involving a smaller number of claims and we'll see where we are. That is not an option that I particularly welcome because that's burdensome on everybody, but I just am not going to see 96 claims, unless there is something about the case that's really extraordinary which I haven't seen so far.

MR. CHUEBON: Yes, Your Honor.

THE COURT: The earlier the better for the reasons that Mr. Blumenfeld has given.

MR. CHUEBON: Thank you, Your Honor. If I may, there is one reason that there are so many claims. We didn't want to raise it to Your Honor, but we did have issues with PayPal with their core technology document

