UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

MPH TECHNOLOGIES OY,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2019-00823
Patent 9,712,494

PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY TO PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION 2

A. Mobile Computer 2

1. The Institution Decision Correctly Held That The "Mobile Computer" Must At Least Be "Moving From One Network To Another" 3

2. Petitioner Incorrectly Argues That, Contrary To The Panel's Holding, The "Mobile Computer" Need Only Be *Capable Of* Moving Between Networks 4

a. Petitioner's Construction Is Inconsistent With The Intrinsic Evidence 4

b. Petitioner's Argument About The Background Of The Invention's Use Of The Terms Mobile Terminal/Mobile Host Misses The Point 6

c. The Evidence Provided By Dr. Goldschlag On "Mobile Terminal" Is Unreliable And Unpersuasive 7

i. Dr. Goldschlag's Testimony Is Evasive, Contradictory, And Biased 7

ii. Dr. Goldschlag Inappropriately Relies On A Generic College Dictionary 9

3. Petitioner Incorrectly Argues That, Contrary To The Panel's Holding, The "Mobile Computer" Need Only Be Capable Of Moving Between Physical Locations 10

B. Substitute/Substituting 10

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

III. GROUNDS 1 AND 2: CLAIMS 1-11 ARE PATENTABLE OVER THE COMBINATION OF RFC3104 AND GRABELSKY 11

A. The Reply Relies On Dr. Goldschlag's Obviousness Testimony, Which Applies An Erroneous Standard 11

B. RFC3104/Grabelsky Fail to Teach The Mobile Computer Of Claims 1-5 And 8-11 13

1. Petitioner Is Advancing A New Theory Of RFC3104 That Was Not Disclosed In The Petition And Should Be Disregarded 13

2. Petitioner's New Theory Is A Reimagination Of RFC3104 That Is Not Disclosed Or Remotely Suggested By The Reference 16

3. Petitioner's Effort to Support Its New Theory With Mischaracterized Deposition Testimony Fails 19

4. Petitioner's Application Of RFC3104 Using Its New Theory Fails To Meet The Limitations Of Claim 1 21

5. A POSITA Would Have No Expectation Of Success That Petitioner's Newly Theorized Modification Of The RFC3104 System Would Operate As Intended 23

C. RFC 3104/Grabelsky Fail To Teach Claim 1's Translation Table That Enables "The Intermediate Computer . . . To Find A Destination Address . . . Using the Unique Identity" Read From The Secure Message Received From The Mobile Computer 24

D. The Dependent Claims Are Separately Patentable.....27

1. Claim 2 Should Be Confirmed 27

2. RFC3104/Grabelsky Fail To Teach The Two-Part Translation Table Of Claim 4.....27

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

3. RFC3104/Grabelsky Fail To Teach The "Source Address Of The Forwarded Message Is The Same As The First Network Address" Per Claim 11 27

IV. CONCLUSION 28

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

CASES

Ex Parte Wang,
2014 WL 6789993 (Patent Tr. & App. Bd.: November 26 2014) (Appeal 2012-009481) 24

Phillips v. AWH Corp.,
415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005) 10

TQ Delta, LLC v. CISCO Sys., Inc.,
942 F.3d 1352 (Fed. Cir. 2019) 12

Wasica Fin. GmbH v. Continental Automotive Sys., Inc.,
853 F.3d 1272 (Fed. Cir. 2017) 15

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.