```
Case 1:14-cv-01453-LPS Document 151 Filed 01/09/17 Page 1 of 156 PageID #: 3919
   1
                          IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
   2
                          IN AND FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE
   3
        MEDA PHARMACEUTICALS, INC.,
                                         : CIVIL ACTION
        and CIPLA LTD.,
   4
   5
                    Plaintiffs,
         V.
   6
        APOTEX INC. and APOTEX CORP., :
   7
                                         : NO. 14-1453-LPS
                    Defendants.
   8
   9
                               Wilmington, Delaware
                            Tuesday, December 13, 2016
  10
                              Bench Trial - Volume A
  11
        BEFORE: HONORABLE LEONARD A. STARK, Chief Judge
  12
  13
        APPEARANCES:
  14
                     RICHARDS LAYTON & FINGER, P.A.
  15
                     BY: FREDERICK L. COTTRELL, III, ESQ., and
                          SELENA E. MOLINA, ESQ.
  16
                          and
  17
                     STERNE KESSLER GOLDSTEIN & FOX, LLP
  18
                     BY: UMA N. EVERETT, ESQ.,
                          DENNIES VARUGHESE, ESQ.,
  19
                          RAMI BARDENSTEIN, ESQ.,
                          ADAM C. LaROCK, ESQ.,
  20
                          JOSHUA I. MILLER, ESQ.,
                          JOSEPHINE J. KIM, ESQ.,
  21
                          STEPHANIE NGUYEN, ESQ., and
                          MARK FOX EVENS, ESQ.
                          (Washington, District of Columbia)
  22
  2.3
                               Counsel for Plaintiffs
  24
        Valerie Gunning
                                         Brian P. Gaffigan
```





```
1
      plaintiffs.
 2
                  MS. EVERETT: Your Honor, Uma Everett on behalf
 3
      of plaintiffs. With me this week, you will hear from my
      colleagues, Mark Evens.
 4
 5
                  MR. EVENS: Good afternoon, Your Honor.
 6
                  MS. EVERETT: Dennies Varughese.
 7
                  MR. VARUGHESE: Good afternoon, Your Honor.
                  THE COURT: Good afternoon.
 8
 9
                  MS. EVERETT: And Adam LaRock.
10
                  MR. LaROCK: Good afternoon.
11
                  THE COURT: Good afternoon.
12
                  MS. EVERETT: Your Honor, we also have client
      representatives here this week to attend trial. We have
13
14
      client represents from Meda. From your left, Your Honor we
      have Marten Osterlund from Sweden.
15
16
                  MR. OSTERLUND: Good afternoon.
17
                  MS. EVERETT: We have Gabrielle Endler from
18
      Germany.
19
                  MS. ENDLER: Good afternoon.
20
                  MS. EVERETT: We have Matthew Polley from New
21
      Jersey.
22
                  MR. POLLEY: Good afternoon.
2.3
                  MS. EVERETT: We also have representatives from
      Cipla Limited.
24
                  Again, from your left, Your Honor, we have
25
```



## Case 1:14-cv-01453-LPS Document 151 Filed 01/09/17 Page 4 of 156 PageID #: 3922

```
1
      Bhakti Patil.
 2
                  MS. PATIL: Good afternoon.
 3
                  MS. EVERETT: And we have Aarti Deodhar.
                  MS. DEODHAR: Good afternoon.
 4
 5
                  MS. EVERETT: From India.
 6
                  THE COURT: Welcome to all of you.
 7
                  All right. Mr. Cottrell, do you want to put
 8
      your appearance on the record?
 9
                  MR. COTTRELL: I'm sorry. Fred Cottrell from
10
      Richard Layton, Delaware counsel. Thank you.
11
                  THE COURT: Thank you. And now the other side
12
      of the room.
                  MR. GATTUSO: Good afternoon, Your Honor.
13
14
                  THE COURT: Good afternoon.
                  MR. GATTUSO: Dominick Gattuso from Proctor
15
16
      Heyman Enerio on behalf of Apotex.
17
                  I also have with me George Lombardi.
18
                  MR. LOMBARDI: Good afternoon.
19
                  MR. GATTUSO: Charles Klein.
20
                  MR. KLEIN: Good afternoon, Your Honor.
21
                  MR. GATTUSO: Ilan Wurman.
22
                  MR. WURMAN: Good afternoon.
2.3
                  MR. GATTUSO: Kevin Warner.
24
                  MR. WARNER: Good afternoon.
                  MR. GATTUSO: And in the back, we have Ryan
```



1 Hauer who isn't with us now but will be before Your Honor. 2 And then from the client Apotex, we have Robert 3 Shapiro, senior patent counsel. (Mr. Shapiro nods greetings.) 4 5 THE COURT: Welcome and good afternoon to all of 6 you. 7 MR. GATTUSO: Thank you. 8 THE COURT: Thank you very much. So we are here 9 for trial. As I think you all know, I have another trial 10 going on upstairs I guess that is. And so that is, 11 hopefully you're aware, moving along at the pace we 12 anticipated, meaning as of now we expect we will close the 13 evidence tomorrow some time. I'll certainly be with you by 14 3:30 tomorrow. If it turns out that I could be here sooner than 15 16 that, we'll let you know. If it works out for all of you, 17 we'll start sooner, but since that is a little bit up in the 18 air, we won't force you all to come in before 3:30 but if 19 it does work for me and it works for all of you and your 20 witnesses, we might be able to get started earlier than 21 3:30. 22 We plan to have closing argument in the jury 2.3 trial Thursday morning, and so if all goes according to 24 plan, we'll get the case to the jury by around lunchtime



Thursday, which means we could start early in the afternoon

# DOCKET

# Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

# **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### **LAW FIRMS**

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### **FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS**

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

### **E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS**

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

