UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,

and

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC.,

Petitioners,

v.

FIRSTFACE CO., LTD.,

Patent Owner.

Case IPR2019-00612

U.S. Patent No. 8,831,557

PETITIONERS' REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION 1

A. "simultaneously" 1

B. "inactive state" and "active state" 2

C. "user identification function" 3

III. GROUND 1: THE COMBINATION OF FADELL, IOS, AND GAGNERAUD RENDERS OBVIOUS THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS 3

A. The Combination of Fadell and Gagneraud Teaches Performing the User Identification Function "Simultaneously" With Switching the Display from an Inactive State to an Active State 3

1. PO Improperly Attacks Each of Fadell and Gagneraud in Isolation 5

2. Fadell Expressly Discloses Quick and Seamless Authentication as the User Wakes the Device, Not Merely Where to Place the Authentication Mechanism 7

3. Fadell's Display Hardware Is Not a "Restricted Resource" That Turns On Only After Authentication 8

B. A POSITA Would Have Been Motivated to Combine Fadell and Gagneraud 10

1. PO Ignores the Express Motivation Taught By the References 10

2. PO's Argument that Fadell and Gagneraud "Accomplish Similar Functions by Different Means" Mischaracterizes Fadell and Ignores Its Express Disclosures 12

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

3. PO's Argument that Gagneraud's Teachings "Would Alter the Fundamental Operation of Fadell" and Render Fadell "Unsuitable for Its Intended Purpose" Mischaracterizes Fadell and Ignores Its Express Disclosures 13

4. Power Management Considerations Would Not Have Dissuaded a POSITA From Combining Fadell and Gagneraud 14

IV. GROUND 2: THE COMBINATION OF GOERTZ AND HERFET RENDERS OBVIOUS THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS 17

A. Goertz Discloses an Activation Button That Switches the Display From an Inactive State to an Active State 17

B. The Combination of Goertz and Herfet Teaches Performing the User Identification Function "Simultaneously" With Switching the Display from an Inactive State to an Active State 19

1. PO Improperly Attacks Each of Goertz and Herfet in Isolation 20

2. Herfet Teaches Waking a Device From Standby Mode Simultaneously With Performing a User Identification Function 21

C. A POSITA Would Have Been Motivated to Modify Goertz with Herfet's Teachings 22

1. PO Ignores the Express Motivation Taught by Herfet 22

2. PO's Argument that Goertz and Herfet "Accomplish Similar Functions by Different Means" Mischaracterizes the References 24

3. Herfet Does Not "Teach Away" From the Proposed Combination 25

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

V. THE COMBINATIONS OF (1) FADELL AND GAGNERAUD AND (2) GOERTZ AND HERFET DISCLOSE A DEVICE THAT PERFORMS FINGERPRINT RECOGNITION AND SIMULTANEOUSLY ACTIVATES THE DISPLAY "BY A PRESS OF THE ACTIVATION BUTTON".....26

VI. CONCLUSION.....26

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

Cardiac Pacemakers, Inc. v. St. Jude Medical, Inc.,
381 F.3d 1371 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 14

K/S HIMPP v. Hear-Wear Techs.,
751 F.3d 1362 (Fed. Cir. 2015) 7, 22

Kinetic Concepts, Inc. v. Smith & Nephew, Inc.,
688 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2012) 13, 25

In re Fulton,
391 F.3d 1195 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 25

In re Gordon,
733 F.2d 900 (Fed. Cir. 1984) 14

In re Merck & Co., Inc.,
800 F.2d 1091 (Fed. Cir. 1986) 5, 20, 21, 26

In re Mouttet,
686 F.3d 1322 (Fed. Cir. 2012) .....*passim*

Other Authorities

MPEP §2145.X.D.1 25

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.