

PUBLIC VERSION

UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION

Washington, D.C.

In the Matter of

CERTAIN AIR MATTRESS SYSTEMS,
COMPONENTS THEREOF, AND METHODS
OF USING THE SAME

Inv. No. 337-TA-971

INITIAL DETERMINATION ON VIOLATION OF SECTION 337 AND
RECOMMENDED DETERMINATION ON REMEDY AND BOND

Chief Administrative Law Judge Charles E. Bullock

(November 18, 2016)

Appearances:

For the Complainants Select Comfort SC Corporation and Select Comfort Corporation

Kecia J. Reynolds, Esq. and Victoria L. Draper, Esq. of Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman, LLP
from Washington, DC

Barry K. Shelton, Esq. of Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman, LLP of Austin, TX

Nicole S. Cunningham, Esq.; Steven A. Moore, Esq.; and Kirsten F. Gallacher, Esq. of Pillsbury
Winthrop Shaw Pittman, LLP from San Diego, CA

Rene E. Mai, Esq. of Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman, LLP from Houston, TX

Michael K. Heins, Esq. of Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman, LLP from McLean, VA

For Respondents Sizewise Rentals LLC, American National Manufacturing, Inc., and Dires LLC

Kyle L. Elliott, Esq.; Brian Bear, Esq.; Kevin S. Tuttle, Esq.; and Mark Thornhill, Esq. of
Spencer Fane from Kansas City, MO

Michael R. Doman, Jr., Esq. and Beau Jackson, Esq. of Adduci, Mastriani & Schaumberg, LLP
from Washington, DC

For the Commission Investigative Staff

Margaret Macdonald, Esq., Director; Jeffrey Hsu, Esq., Supervisory Attorney; and Andrew Beverina, Esq., Investigative Attorney of the Office of Unfair Import Investigations, U.S. International Trade Commission from Washington, DC

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
A.	Procedural History	1
B.	The Parties	2
1.	Select Comfort	2
2.	Respondents.....	2
a)	Sizewise Rentals LLC.....	2
b)	American National Manufacturing Inc.	2
c)	Dires LLC	2
C.	Overview of the Technology	3
D.	Patents at Issue.....	3
1.	U.S. Patent No. 5,904,172.....	3
2.	U.S. Patent No. 7,389,554.....	3
II.	JURISDICTION AND IMPORTATION	3
A.	Subject Matter Jurisdiction	3
B.	Personal Jurisdiction	4
C.	<i>In Rem</i> Jurisdiction	4
III.	ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	5
IV.	RELEVANT LAW	6
A.	Infringement.....	6
1.	Literal Infringement	6
2.	Doctrine of Equivalents	6
3.	Indirect Infringement	7
a)	Induced Infringement.....	7
B.	Validity	7
1.	Anticipation.....	8
2.	Obviousness	8
3.	Indefiniteness	10
4.	Broadening During Reexamination	10
C.	Domestic Industry	10
1.	Economic Prong	11
2.	Technical Prong	11
D.	Unenforceability	12
V.	U.S. PATENT NO. 5,904,172	13
A.	Overview.....	13
1.	Asserted Claims	13
2.	Claim Construction.....	15
3.	Accused Products.....	17
B.	Infringement.....	18
1.	Claim 2.....	18

a)	“An improved valve enclosure assembly for use with an air inflatable mattress having at last one air bladder inflated by compressed air, a pump fluidly coupled to the at least one air bladder for providing compressed air thereto, and a processor for providing commands to the improved valve enclosure assembly during an inflate/deflate cycle, the improved valve enclosure assembly being fluidly coupled intermediate the pump and the at least one air bladder for controlling the inflation of the at least one air bladder, comprising”	18
i.	“Valve Enclosure Assembly”	19
ii.	Biased-Closed Valve.....	23
b)	“an enclosure defining a substantially fluidly sealed air chamber and having at least one air inlet to the air chamber being fluidly coupled to the pump, a plurality of guides and stops being disposed within the enclosure for correctly positioning components within the enclosure”	24
i.	“Guides and Stops”	25
ii.	“Within the enclosure”	28
c)	“and pressure monitor means being operably coupled to the processor and being in fluid communications with the at least one bladder for continuously monitoring the pressure in the at least one bladder”	29
2.	Claim 6.....	32
3.	Claim 9.....	32
a)	Indirect Infringement	33
4.	Claim 12.....	33
a)	“An improved valve enclosure assembly for use with an air inflatable mattress having at least one air bladder inflated by compressed air, a pump fluidly coupled to the at least one air bladder for providing compressed air thereto, and a processor for providing commands to the improved valve enclosure assembly during an inflate/deflate cycle, the improved valve assembly being fluidly coupled intermediate the pump at and the at least one air bladder for controlling the inflation of the at least one air bladder, comprising: . . .”	33
b)	“an enclosure defining a substantially fluidly sealed air chamber and having at least one air inlet to the air chamber being fluidly coupled to the pump, a plurality of guides and stops being disposed within the enclosure for correctly positioning components within the enclosure”	34
c)	At least one valve operably coupled to the enclosure being in selective fluid communication with the air chamber and being in fluid communication with the at least one air bladder for selectively fluidly coupling the air chamber to at least one air bladder;	34

	d)	“pressure monitor means being operably coupled to the processor and being in fluid communication with the at least one valve for monitoring the pressure in the at least one bladder”	34
	e)	Conclusion	36
5.	Claim 16.....		37
	a)	“An improved valve enclosure assembly for use with an air inflatable mattress having at least one air bladder inflated by compressed air, a pump fluidly coupled to the at least one air bladder for providing compressed air thereto, and a processor for providing commands to the improved valve enclosure assembly during an inflate/deflate cycle, the improved valve assembly being fluidly coupled intermediate the pump and the at least one air bladder for controlling the inflation of the at least one air bladder, comprising: . . .”	37
	b)	“an enclosure defining a substantially fluidly sealed air chamber and having at least one air inlet to the air chamber being fluidly coupled to the pump, the enclosure being formed of an enclosure portion and a rear cover portion, a flexible seal being compressively interposed between the enclosed portion and a rear cover portion to effect a substantially fluid tight seal therebetween”	37
	c)	“at least one valve operably coupled to the enclosure being in selective fluid communication with the air chamber and being in fluid communication with the at least one air bladder for selectively fluidly coupling the air chamber to at least one air bladder;	38
	d)	“pressure monitor means being operably coupled to the processor and being in fluid communication with the at least one valve for monitoring the pressure in the at least one bladder”	38
	e)	Conclusion	38
6.	Claim 20.....		38
7.	Claim 22.....		39
8.	Claim 24.....		39
C.	Domestic Industry – Technical Prong.....		39
D.	Validity		40
	1.	Written Description & Indefiniteness	40
	2.	Broadening During Reexamination	41
	3.	Anticipation.....	43
	a)	“Pressure monitor means” – Claims 2, 6, 12, 16, 20, 22, and 24.....	43
	b)	Claim 9.....	48
	4.	Obviousness	48
	a)	Vrzalik and Shafer	49
	b)	Vrzalik in combination with Shafer and Kery	50
	c)	Vrzalik and Peeler.....	52

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.