

Transcript of Paul J. Mahoney

Date: January 9, 2020

Case: American National Manufacturing Inc. -v- Sleep Number Corporation, et al. (PTAB)

Planet Depos

Phone: 888.433.3767

Email:: transcripts@planetdepos.com

www.planetdepos.com

WORLDWIDE COURT REPORTING & LITIGATION TECHNOLOGY



		1	3
	UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE	1	APPEARANCES
	BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD	2	
		3	REPRESENTING THE PETITIONER:
	AMERICAN NATIONAL IPR2019-00497	4	Mr. Brian T. Bear
	MANUFACTURING INC., IPR2019-00500	5	Attorney at Law
	Petitioner, IPR2019-00514	6	Mr. Kyle L. Elliott (present a.m. session)
,	v.	7	Attorney at Law
3	SLEEP NUMBER CORPORATION U.S. PATENT 8,769,747	8	Spencer Fane LLP
)	f/k/a SELECT COMFORT U.S. PATENT 9,737,154	9	1000 Walnut Street, Suite 1400
0	CORPORATION, U.S. PATENT 5,904,172	10	Kansas City, MO 64106-2140
1	Patent Owner.	11	bbear@spencerfane.com
2		12	kelliott@spencerfane.com
3	VIDEO DEPOSITION OF	13	
4	PAUL J. MAHONEY	14	
5	MINNEAPOLIS, MINNESOTA	15	
6	THURSDAY, JANUARY 9, 2020	16	
7	8:07 A.M.	17	
8		18	
9		19	
0	JOB NO.: 278016	20	
21	PAGES: 1 - 181	21	
22	REPORTED BY: PATRICK J. MAHON, RMR, CRR	22	(continued)
2	VIDEO DEPOSITION OF PAUL J. MAHONEY, HELD AT THE OFFICES OF:	1 2	APPEARANCES, continued:
3		3	REPRESENTING THE PATENT OWNER:
ļ		4	Mr. Luke Toft
i	FOX ROTHSCHILD LLP	5	Attorney at Law
i	222 SOUTH 9TH STREET	6	Fox Rothschild LLP
,	MINNEAPOLIS, MINNESOTA 55402-3338	7	222 South 9th Street, Suite 2000
3		8	Minneapolis, MN 55402
)		9	ltoft@foxrothschild.com
0		10	
1			ALSO PRESENT: Kyle Stolis, Videographer
2		12	
3	Pursuant to Notice, before Patrick J.	13	* * *
	Mahon, Notary Public in and for the County of	14	
	Hennepin, State of Minnesota.	15	
6		16	
7		17	
8		18	
9		19	
0		20	
. 1	* * * *	21	
21			
1		22	

PLANET DEPOS 888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM



1	INDEX	⁵ PROCEEDINGS
2		2 WHEREUPON, the following proceedings were
EXA	MINATION:	3 duly had:
	BY MR. BEAR - PAGES 8 and 174	4 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Good morning. Here
	BY MR. TOFT - PAGE 163	5 begins Disk Number 1 in the videotaped deposition
EXH	IBITS:	c 0D 1361 1 1 1 0 04 1 37 1 1
7 NUM	BER/DESCRIPTION	·
8 Exh	ibit 1	7 Manufacturing Inc. versus Sleep Number
9	Videotape Deposition transcript	8 Corporation, et al., in the United States Patent
10	of Paul James Mahoney on 2/17/16	9 and Trademark Office before the Patent Trial and
11	(123 pages)	10 Appeal Board, case numbers IPR2019-00497, -00500
12 Exh	ibit 1001	11 and -00514.
13	Patent No.: 5,904,172	Today's date is Thursday, January 9, 2020.
14	(17 pages)	13 The time on the video monitor is 8:07 a.m.
	ibit 1001	14 The videographer today is Kyle Stolis,
16	Patent No.: US 8,769,747 B2	15 representing Planet Depos.
17	AMERICAN NATIONAL MANUFACTURING,	This video deposition is taking place at
18	INC EX 1001 - Page 1 - Page 16	17 the law office of Fox Rothschild LLP in
19		18 Minneapolis, Minnesota.
20		Would counsel please voice-identify
21	Continue	20 themselves and state whom they represent.
22	(continued)	21 MR. BEAR: Brian Bear of the Spencer Fane
		22 LLP law firm on behalf of Petitioner, American
1 EXH 2	IIBITS, continued:	 National Manufacturing, Incorporated. MR. TOFT: And Luke Toft with Fox
3 EXH	IBIT/DESCRIPTION	3 Rothschild LLP, representing Sleep Number
	ibit 2079	4 Corporation.
5	Historical FCS Timeline	5 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.
6	Sleep Number Corp. EXHIBIT 2079	6 The court reporter today is Patrick Mahon,
7	IPR2019-00514, Page 1 - Page 21	7 representing Planet Depos.
8	SN_0021013 - 33	8 Would the reporter please swear in the
	Patent No US 0. 727 154 P2	9 witness.
10	Patent No.: US 9,737,154 B2	10 (The oath was administered by the
11 12	AMERICAN NATIONAL MANUFACTURING, INC EX 1001 - Page 1 - Page 20	11 reporter.)
	ibit 2056	12 THE WITNESS RESPONSE: I do.
14	Declaration of Paul Mahoney In	13 PAUL J. MAHONEY,
15	Support Of Patent Owner's Response	14 a witness in the above-entitled proceedings, after
16	Sleep Number Corp. EXHIBIT 2056,	15 having been first duly sworn, deposed under oath
17	IPR2019-00514, Page 1 - Page 12	15 having been first duty sworn, deposed under oauf
18	-	
19		17 EXAMINATION
20		18 BY MR. BEAR:
21		19 Q Could you state your name for the record,
22		20 please.
		21 A Paul James Mahoney.
		22 Q Mr. Mahoney, where do you currently

PLANET DEPOS

888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM



9 1 reside?	1 A Fine.
2 A Stillwater, Minnesota.	2 Q First is, of course, you're under oath.
3 Q Stillwater, Minnesota.	3 That means you're swearing to tell the truth; you
4 I know from some documents in front of me	4 understand that, right, sir?
5 that you have been deposed before; is that	5 A Yes, I do.
6 correct?	6 Q Okay. And although we are videotaping
7 A That is correct.	7 this deposition, as you notice, we are also
8 Q Okay. You were deposed on or about	8 transcribing it. And so for purposes of a record,
9 March 10, 2016, in an International Trade	9 although the camera may pick up a nod or a shrug
10 Commission case; do you recall that, sir?	10 or something like that, if you can give your
11 A I recall the case, but I don't remember	11 answers in an audible form, it would be much
12 the date.	12 appreciated. Okay?
13 Q Is it approximately 2016? Would that be	13 A Yes, I will.
14 consistent with your memory?	14 Q Excellent. Excellent. From time to time,
15 A I just don't remember.	15 Mr. Toft may object. In most circumstances,
16 Q Okay. You were also deposed on or about	16 you're still going to have to answer the question,
17 February 17, 2016, in a case, Select Comfort	17 unless he instructs you otherwise. Okay?
18 versus Tempur Sealy; do you recall that, sir?	18 A Okay.
19 A Tempur Sealy?	19 Q In addition to that, feel free, if you
20 Q Yes.	20 need a break, we'll take a break as you need them.
	21 However, the one thing I'd ask is, if we've got a
	22 question pending, to answer the question first and
22 Q Do you recall a gentleman by the name	
1 of well, let's see. But you recall giving more	1 then we'll take the break. Okay?
2 than one deposition in 2016; is that correct?	2 A That sounds fine.
3 A I've given more than one deposition. I	3 Q All righty. Is there any reason why you
4 just don't remember the dates.	4 can't testify truthfully today, sir?
5 Q Okay. And those depositions, were they	5 A No.
6 regarding one of the patents that you are a named	6 Q Okay. So I am going to hand you what has
7 inventor on?	7 previously been marked as Exhibit 2056 in the -514
8 A Yes.	8 proceeding. And do you recognize this document,
9 Q Okay. Besides those two depositions, have	9 sir?
10 you given any depositions since that time and	10 A (Reviewing.) Yes, I do.
11 today?	11 Q Okay. And what is this document?
12 A Not that	12 A "Declaration of Paul Mahoney in Support of
13 MR. TOFT: Object to form.	13 Patent Owner's Response."
14 A Not that I know of.	14 Q Okay.
15 BY MR. BEAR:	15 MR. BEAR: Can we get a stipulation on the
16 Q Okay. Have you given any type of sworn	16 record that other than a different exhibit number,
17 testimony in a proceeding between that time and	17 this is the same declaration that has been filed
17 testiniony in a proceeding between that time and 18 today?	18 in the other IPR proceedings, Counsel?
•	19 MR. TOFT: Yes, that's fine. I believe
	· ·
	20 the date, the signed date is different, as well, 21 but other than that
21 ground rules, although you probably heard them	21 but other than that

PLANET DEPOS

MR. BEAR: Okay.

888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM



22 before, about the deposition. Okay?

12	16
13 1 BY MR. BEAR:	15 Q Okay. I notice, as well, in paragraph 2,
2 Q So as I ask you questions about this,	2 you talk about your educational background. You
3 although I have one of these, it would equally	3 have a BS in science in electrical engineering; is
4 apply to all three of your declarations. Okay?	4 that correct?
5 A (Witness nods in affirmative.)	5 A Yes, I do.
6 Q All righty. Did you draft this document	6 Q And you also have a master's in biomedical
7 yourself?	7 engineering from Southern Methodist; is that
8 A (Reviewing.) Which portion?	8 correct?
9 Q Any portion of the document?	9 A Yes, it is.
10 A I drafted my CV.	10 Q What is biomedical engineering?
11 Q Okay. Beyond that, any other portions did	11 A It kind of builds on engineering
12 you draft yourself?	12 principles and also biology.
13 A No, I did not.	13 Q Biology. So what are some of the
14 Q Okay. Who did prepare the draft for you?	14 applications that a biomedical engineering
15 A I think it was Liz.	15 discipline would address?
16 Q Liz, Elizabeth Patton?	16 A It all would depend on what your specialty
17 A I can't remember her last name.	17 is.
MR. TOFT: If it's the person that we were	18 Q What was your specialty?
19 just meeting with, then that is her last name.	19 A Mine was more general.
20 THE WITNESS: Okay.	20 Q So what sorts of problems would you work
21 A Yes.	21 on as a biomedical engineer?
22 BY MR. BEAR:	22 A It all depended on the company that I
14	16
1 Q Okay. And did you make any changes to the	1 would work for and what my role was in the
2 draft that she provided to you?	2 company.
3 A Yes, I did.	3 Q Okay. After you got that degree, what was
4 Q Okay. Did Ms. Patton consult you prior to	4 the first company you worked for?
5 providing a draft of this document to you, as in,	5 A I worked for a hospital.
6 like, a telephone conference or an in-person	6 Q Okay. And were you employed as an
7 meeting?	7 engineer for the hospital or in a different
8 MR. TOFT: And I'm just going to instruct	8 capacity?
9 you, to the extent you can answer the question	9 A A different capacity.
10 without revealing the content of the	10 Q What was your capacity?
11 conversations, you can answer. Please don't	11 A Respiratory therapist.
12 A Yes, I did.	12 Q Okay. And then how long did you work at
13 BY MR. BEAR:	13 that hospital for, approximately?
14 Q Okay. I'd like to talk about some of the	14 A Three or four years, I think.
15 statements you make in this document. It says	15 Q Okay. And then what did you do?
16 that you were employed, in paragraph 3, as a	16 A I worked for 3M.
17 "Senior Product Design Engineer from June 1995 to	17 Q Did you work as an engineer for 3M?
17 "Senior Product Design Engineer from June 1995 to 18 July 2011"; do you see that, sir?	17 Q Did you work as an engineer for 3M?18 A Yes, I did.
17 "Senior Product Design Engineer from June 1995 to 18 July 2011"; do you see that, sir? 19 A Yes, I do.	 17 Q Did you work as an engineer for 3M? 18 A Yes, I did. 19 Q What sorts of problems or products did you
17 "Senior Product Design Engineer from June 1995 to 18 July 2011"; do you see that, sir?	17 Q Did you work as an engineer for 3M?18 A Yes, I did.
17 "Senior Product Design Engineer from June 1995 to 18 July 2011"; do you see that, sir? 19 A Yes, I do.	 17 Q Did you work as an engineer for 3M? 18 A Yes, I did. 19 Q What sorts of problems or products did you

PLANET DEPOS

22 ventilator.

888.433.3767 | WWW.PLANETDEPOS.COM



A That is correct.

DOCKET

Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

