

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner

v.

UUSI, LLC d/b/a NARTRON,
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2019-00359
Patent No. 5,796,183

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	Claim Construction.....	1
A.	The Board’s construction of “selectively providing signal output frequencies” is correct.....	1
B.	The Samsung Appeal is not “binding precedent” on the Board	2
C.	The Samsung Appeal does not expressly construe “selectively providing signal output frequencies”	3
D.	UUSI’s construction is inconsistent with the claim language	5
E.	UUSI’s construction is inconsistent with the ’183 specification.....	8
III.	Claims 27, 83-85, and 90 are obvious over the combination of Chiu and Schwarzbach (Ground 1A)	11
A.	Claim 27 is obvious over Chiu and the combination of Chiu and Schwarzbach (Ground 1A).....	11
B.	Chiu teaches “selectively providing signal output frequencies” (Claims 27 and 83)	12
C.	Chiu teaches “providing a periodic output signal having a predefined frequency” (Claims 27 and 83)	14
D.	Chiu teaches a “closely-spaced array” (Claims 27 and 83)	16
E.	A POSITA would have been motivated to combine Chiu and Schwarzbach as described in the Petition	16
F.	Chiu and Schwarzbach teach that “a peak voltage of the signal output frequencies is greater than a supply voltage” (Claim 83).....	19
G.	Chiu and Schwarzbach teach that “the supply voltage is a battery supply voltage” (Claim 90)	21

IV. Chiu, Schwarzbach and Meadows (Ground 1B)22

 A. The Petition’s proposal to “replace” the oscillator of Chiu with the oscillator of Meadows does not require physical incorporation22

 B. The Petition sufficiently explains the operation of the combined circuit of Chiu, Schwarzbach, and Meadows23

V. Chiu, Schwarzbach and Tucker (Ground 1D)25

VI. Conclusion26

EXHIBITS

- APPLE-1001 U.S. Patent No. 5,796,183 to Hourmand (“the ’183 patent”)
- APPLE-1002 Excerpts from the Prosecution History of the ’183 Patent (“the Prosecution History”)
- APPLE-1003 Declaration of Dr. Phillip Wright
- APPLE-1004 U.S. Patent No. 5,572,205 to Caldwell (“Caldwell”)
- APPLE-1005 U.S. Patent No. 4,561,002 to Chiu (“Chiu”)
- APPLE-1006 Prosecution History of Reexamination Control No. 90/012,439
- APPLE-1007 Prosecution History of Reexamination Control No. 90/013,106
- APPLE-1008 U.S. Patent No. 4,560,954 to Leach (“Leach”)
- APPLE-1009 U.S. Patent No. 4,878,107 to Hopper (“Hopper”)
- APPLE-1010 U.S. Patent No. 5,341,036 to Wheeler (“Wheeler”)
- APPLE-1011 U.S. Patent No. 4,237,421 to Waldron (“Waldron”)
- APPLE-1012 U.S. Patent No. 5,650,597 to Redmayne (“Redmayne”)
- APPLE-1013 U.S. Patent No. 4,922,061 to Meadows (“Meadows”)

...

APPLE-1014 U.S. Patent No. 4,418,333 to Schwarzbach (“Schwarzbach”)

APPLE-1015 U.S. Patent No. 4,293,734 to Pepper (“Pepper”)

APPLE-1016 U.S. Patent No. 4,731,548 to Ingraham (“Ingraham ’548”)

APPLE-1017 U.S. Patent No. 4,758,735 to Ingraham (“Ingraham ’735”)

APPLE-1018 U.S. Patent No. 5,189,417 to Caldwell (“Caldwell ’417”)

APPLE-1019 U.S. Patent No. 4,308,443 to Tucker (“Tucker”)

APPLE-1020 U.S. Patent No. 4,290,061 to Serrano (“Serrano”)

APPLE-1021 U.S. Patent No. 4,845,630 to Stephens (“Stephens”)

APPLE-1022 U.S. Patent No. 5,048,019 to Albertsen (“Albertsen”)

APPLE-1023 U.S. Patent No. 5,632,039 to Walker (“Walker”)

APPLE-1024 U.S. Patent No. 5,508,653 to Chu (“Chu”)

APPLE-1025 U.S. Patent No. 5,087,825 to Ingraham (“Ingraham ’825”)

APPLE-1026 U.S. Patent No. 4,649,323 to Pearlman (“Pearlman”)

APPLE-1027 U.S. Patent No. 5,311,392 to Kinney (“Kinney”)

APPLE-1028 U.S. Patent No. 4,707,852 to Jahr (“Jahr”)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.