

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

CANON INC. and CANON U.S.A., INC., and
AXIS COMMUNICATIONS AB,

Petitioners,

v.

AVIGILON FORTRESS CORPORATION,

Patent Owner.

Case: IPR2019-00314
U.S. Patent No. 7,932,923

PETITIONERS' REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL APPLIES2

III. CLAIM CONSTRUCTIONS.....5

A. MEANS-PLUS-FUNCTION ELEMENTS (CLAIMS 9-19, 30-41) ...5

B. “ATTRIBUTES” LIMITATIONS (CLAIMS 1-41).....5

C. “NEW USER RULE” (CLAIMS 1-41)5

D. INDEPENDENCE-BASED LIMITATIONS (CLAIMS 1-41).....6

1. INDEPENDENCE ARGUMENT (1) (AVIGILON’S
“APPLYING” ARGUMENT)6

2. INDEPENDENCE ARGUMENT (3) (AVIGILON’S
“EVENT” ARGUMENT)8

3. INDEPENDENCE ARGUMENT (2) (AVIGILON’S
“INDEPENDENT” ARGUMENT)8

E. THE “ONLY” LIMITATIONS (CLAIMS 1-41)9

F. “VIDEO DEVICE”10

IV. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE UNPATENTABLE.....11

A. *DIMITROVA* IN COMBINATION WITH *BRILL* DISCLOSES
“APPLYING THE NEW USER RULE TO THE PLURALITY OF
DETECTED ATTRIBUTES” AND “APPLYING THE NEW USER
RULE TO ONLY THE PLURALITY OF DETECTED
ATTRIBUTES”11

1. *DIMITROVA* DETECTS ATTRIBUTES11

2. *DIMITROVA* DISCLOSES APPLYING THE NEW USER
RULE TO ONLY THE ATTRIBUTES13

3. AVIGILON’S ARGUMENT THAT A RESPONSE IS NOT
SHOWN MUST FAIL14

B. *DIMITROVA* DISCLOSES “THE PLURALITY OF ATTRIBUTES THAT ARE DETECTED ARE INDEPENDENT OF WHICH EVENT IS IDENTIFIED”15

C. *DIMITROVA* DISCLOSES “SELECTING THE NEW USER RULE COMPRISES SELECTING A SUBSET OF THE PLURALITY OF ATTRIBUTES FOR ANALYSIS”17

D. A POSITA WOULD HAVE BEEN MOTIVATED TO COMBINE *DIMITROVA* AND *BRILL*18

E. PATENT OWNER’S “OBJECTIVE INDICIA OF NON-OBVIOUSNESS” IS NOT CREDIBLE19

V. *DIMITROVA* AND *BRILL* ARE PRINTED PUBLICATIONS.....20

A. THE BOARD MAY CONSIDER POST-PETITION EVIDENCE CONFIRMING PUBLICATION.....21

B. THE EVIDENCE SUBMITTED WITH THE PETITION ALONE PROVES PUBLICATION23

VI. CONCLUSION25

LIST OF EXHIBITS

- Ex. 1001 U.S. Patent No. 7,932,923 (“the ’923 Patent”)
- Ex. 1002 Prosecution History of the ’923 Patent
- Ex. 1003 “Visual Memory” by Christopher James Kellogg (“*Kellogg*”)
- Ex. 1004 “Event Recognition and Reliability Improvements for the Autonomous Video Surveillance System” by Frank Brill et al. (“*Brill*”)
- Ex. 1005 Declaration of John R. Grindon, D.Sc.
- Ex. 1006 “Motion Recovery for Video Content Classification” by N. Dimitrova et al. (“*Dimitrova*”)
- Ex. 1007 Declaration of Emily R. Florio
- Ex. 1008 February 29, 2012 Request for *inter partes* Reexamination of the ’923 Patent
- Ex. 1009 May 23, 2012 Order Granting/Denying Request for *inter partes* Reexamination of the ’923 Patent
- Ex. 1010 May 23, 2012 Office Action in *inter partes* Reexamination of the ’923 Patent
- Ex. 1011 August 27, 2012 Amendment and Reply in *inter partes* Reexamination of the ’923 Patent
- Ex. 1012 February 13, 2013 Decision Granting Petition to Terminate *inter partes* Reexamination Proceeding of the ’923 Patent
- Ex. 1013 May 23, 2013 Attachment to Request for *ex parte* Reexamination of the ’923 Patent
- Ex. 1014 June 17, 2013 Order Granting/Denying Request for *ex parte* Reexamination of the ’923 Patent
- Ex. 1015 August 30, 2013 Office Action in *ex parte* Reexamination of the ’923 Patent

- Ex. 1016 October 30, 2013 Amendment and Reply in *ex parte* Reexamination of the '923 Patent
- Ex. 1017 April 4, 2014 Final Office Action in *ex parte* Reexamination of the '923 Patent
- Ex. 1018 April 16, 2014 Amendment and Reply in *ex parte* Reexamination of the '923 Patent
- Ex. 1019 April 30, 2014 Notice of Intent to Issue *ex parte* Reexamination Certificate of the '923 Patent
- Ex. 1020 May 21, 2014 *ex parte* Reexamination Certificate of the '923 Patent
- Ex. 1021 U.S. Patent No. 5,969,755 to Courtney (“*Courtney*”)
- Ex. 1022 “Object-Oriented Conceptual Modeling of Video Data” by Young Francis Day et al., (“*Day-I*”)
- Ex. 1023 Declaration of Christopher James Bailey-Kellogg in IPR2018-00138 and IPR2018-00140
- Ex. 1024 Applicant Response of June 11, 2012 in *inter partes* Reexamination of U.S. Patent No. 7,868,912 (“the '912 Patent”)
- Ex. 1025 Decision Granting Petition to Terminate *inter partes* Reexamination of the '912 Patent
- Ex. 1026 May 24, 2013 Attachment to Request for *ex parte* Reexamination of the '912 Patent
- Ex. 1027 June 20, 2013 Order Granting/Denying Request for *ex parte* Reexamination of the '912 Patent
- Ex. 1028 August 30, 2013 Office Action in *ex parte* Reexamination of the '912 Patent
- Ex. 1029 October 30, 2013 Amendment and Reply in *ex parte* Reexamination of the '912 Patent
- Ex. 1030 March 27, 2014 Final Office Action in *ex parte* Reexamination of the '912 Patent

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.