

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

Canon Inc., Canon U.S.A., Inc., and Axis Communications AB,

Petitioners,

v.

Avigilon Fortress Corporation,

Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2019-00314

U.S. Patent No. 7,932,923

PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	BACKGROUND	2
	A. Proposed Grounds	2
	B. Overview of the '923 Patent.....	2
III.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	5
	A. “attributes of the object” (Claims 1-7, 9-19, 22-28, 30-41); “attributes of each of the detected first and second objects” (Claims 8, 29); “attributes of the detected objects (Claims 20, 21)	6
	B. “new user rule” (Claims 1-41)	6
	C. “applying” (Petitioners’ “Independence Argument (1)” Discussion) (Claims 1-41).....	8
	D. “event” (Petitioners’ “Independence Argument (3)” Discussion) (Claims 1-41).....	10
	E. “independent” (Petitioners’ “Independence Argument (2)” Discussion) (Claims 1-41).....	11
	F. “wherein the applying the new user rule to the plurality of detected attributes comprises applying the new user rule to only the plurality of detected attributes” (Claims 1-9, 22-29); “wherein the analysis of the combination of the attributes to detect the event comprises analyzing only the combination of the attributes” (Claims 20-21); “wherein the applying the selected new user rule to the plurality of attributes stored in memory comprises applying the selected new user rule to only the plurality of attributes stored in memory” (Claims 30-41).....	12
	G. “a video device” (Claims 9, 20, and 30)	14
	H. Means-Plus-Function Claims	15

IV. PETITIONERS HAVE NOT ESTABLISHED BY A PREPONDERANCE OF THE EVIDENCE THAT ANY OF CLAIMS 1-41 OF THE ’923 PATENT IS UNPATENTABLE16

- A. Ground 1: *Dimitrova* In Combination With *Brill* Does Not Render Claims 1-41 Obvious16
 - 1. *Dimitrova* in combination with *Brill* does not disclose “identifying an event of the object that is not one of the detected attributes of the object by applying the new user rule to the plurality of detected attributes; wherein the applying the new user rule to the plurality of detected attributes comprises applying the new user rule to only the plurality of detected attributes” (Claims 1-41)16
 - 2. *Dimitrova* in combination with *Brill* does not “the plurality of attributes that are detected are independent of which event is identified” (Claims 1-41)24
 - 3. *Dimitrova* in combination with *Brill* does not disclose “wherein selecting the new user rule comprises selecting a subset of the plurality of attributes for analysis” (Claims 2, 4, 7, 11, 12, 13, 14, 16, 23, 25, 28, 32, 33, 34, 35, 38)30
 - 4. No Motivation Exists to Combine *Dimitrova* and *Brill*32
 - 5. Objective Evidence Establishes Non-Obviousness of the ’923 Patent34

V. PETITIONERS HAVE FAILED TO DEMONSTRATE THAT DIMITROVA AND BRILL ARE PRINTED PUBLICATIONS36

- A. The Florio Declaration Is Insufficient Evidence Because Ms. Florio Does Not Have Personal Knowledge Of The Relevant Libraries’ Shelving Practices.36
- B. Petitioners’ Explanation Of The Alleged Printed Publication Status Of *Dimitrova* And *Brill* Is Deficient39
 - 1. Petitioners fail to show that *Dimitrova* was publicly accessible.41
 - 2. Petitioners fail to show that *Brill* was publicly accessible.49

C. The Deficiencies In The Petition Cannot Be Overcome With
Information Submitted As Supplemental Information.....50

VI. CONCLUSION51

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>ABS Global, Inc. v. Inguran, LLC</i> , IPR2016-00927, Paper 33 (PTAB Oct. 2, 2017).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>Acceleration Bay, LLC v. Activision Blizzard Inc.</i> , 908 F.3d 765 (Fed. Cir. 2018)	<i>passim</i>
<i>Am. Innotek, Inc. v. United States</i> , 128 Fed. Cl. 135 (2016).....	43
<i>Arista Networks, Inc. v. Cisco Sys., Inc.</i> , IPR 2016-00303	42
<i>Bruckelmyer v. Ground Heaters, Inc.</i> , 445 F.3d 1374 (Fed. Cir. 2006)	40
<i>Cisco Sys., Inc. v. C-Cation Techs., LLC</i> , IPR2014-00454, Paper 12 (PTAB Aug. 29, 2014).....	50
<i>Crystal Semiconductor Corp. v. TriTech Microelectronics Int'l, Inc.</i> , 246 F.3d 1336 (Fed. Cir. 2001)	13
<i>Ecolochem, Inc. v. S. Cal. Edison Co.</i> , 227 F.3d 1361 (Fed. Cir. 2000)	34
<i>Ford Motor Co. v. Cruise Control Techs. LLC</i> , IPR2014-00291, Paper 44 (PTAB Jun. 29, 2015)	42, 49
<i>Ford Motor v. Versata Dev. Grp.</i> , IPR2016-01019, Paper 9 (PTAB Oct. 4, 2016).....	39, 49, 50
<i>Graham v. John Deere Co. of Kansas City</i> , 383 U.S. 1 (1966).....	34
<i>In re Cronyn</i> , 890 F.2d 1158 (Fed. Cir. 1989)	40, 44, 45, 46
<i>In re Hall</i> , 781 F.2d 897 (Fed. Cir. 1986)	37, 44, 45, 46

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.