

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

AMNEAL PHARMACEUTICALS LLC,
AMNEAL PHARMACEUTICALS OF NEW YORK, LLC,
and MYLAN PHARMACEUTICALS INC.,
Petitioners

v.

ALMIRALL, LLC,
Patent Owner

Case IPR2019-00207¹
Patent 9,517,219

PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. Introduction	1
II. The Board Has Not Considered Almirall's Arguments in Prior Proceedings	3
III. Petitioners Have Not Met Their Burden to Prove Obviousness According to the Grounds	4
A. Garrett Would Not Have Motivated a POSA to Develop a Treatment with New Topical Dapsone Formulations Recited in the '219 Patent Claims	4
1. Garrett's teachings are limited to compositions with both dissolved and undissolved dapsone.....	5
2. Garrett does not teach that dapsone treats acne or rosacea	7
3. A POSA would not have been motivated to increase dapsone to the recited concentration of 7.5%	8
4. Garrett does not teach using dapsone compositions without adapalene.....	9
5. In view of the prior art as a whole, Garrett would not suggest to a POSA the recited DGME concentrations of the claims	9
B. Petitioners Failed to Show Motivation to Combine Garrett with the Other Asserted Art.....	11
1. A POSA would not have been motivated to combine Garrett with Nadau-Fourcade.....	11
2. A POSA would not have been motivated to combine Garrett with Bonacucina.....	16
C. The Claimed Dapsone and DGME Concentrations Are Not Obvious.....	18

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(Continued)

	Page
IV. Objective Indicia of Non-Obviousness Further Support Denial of the Petition	23
V. Conclusion.....	24

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>Allergan, Inc. v. Sandoz Inc.</i> , 796 F.3d 1293 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	18, 19
<i>Almirall LLC v. Taro Pharm. Indus. Ltd.</i> , C.A. No. 17-00663 (D. Del. June 6, 2018), ECF No. 87.....	2
<i>Dynamic Drinkware LLC v. Nat'l Graphics, Inc.</i> , 800 F.3d 1375 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	1
<i>E.I. DuPont de Nemours & Co. v. Synvina C.V.</i> , 904 F.3d 996 (Fed. Cir. 2018).....	19, 20, 22
<i>Galderma Labs., L.P. v. Tolmar, Inc.</i> , 737 F.3d 731 (Fed. Cir. 2013).....	22
<i>In re Baird</i> , 16 F.3d 380 (Fed. Cir. 1994).....	14
<i>In re Magnum Oil Tools Int'l, Ltd.</i> , 829 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2016).....	1, 2, 13
<i>In re Patel</i> , 566 F. App'x 1005 (Fed. Cir. 2014).....	13
<i>Inphi Corp. v. Netlist, Inc.</i> , 805 F.3d 1350 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	9
<i>Insite Vision, Inc. v. Sandoz, Inc.</i> , 783 F.3d 853 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	15
<i>Intelligent Bio-Sys., Inc. v. Illumina Cambridge Ltd.</i> , 821 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2016).....	17
<i>Pfizer, Inc. v. Apotex, Inc.</i> , 480 F.3d 1348 (Fed. Cir. 2007).....	21
<i>Warner-Jenkinson Co. v. Hilton Davis Chem. Co.</i> , 520 U.S. 17 (1997)	3

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES
(Continued)

Page(s)

STATUTES

35 U.S.C. § 316(e)..... 1

35 U.S.C. § 103(a) (2006)..... 3

OTHER AUTHORITIES

37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b)(4)..... 4

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.