

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

APPLE INC.,  
Petitioner,

v.

COREPHOTONICS, LTD.,  
Patent Owner.

---

Case No. IPR2019-00030  
U.S. Patent No. 9,857,568

---

PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY TO PETITION FOR  
*INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 9,857,568

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction .....	1
II.	The Only Construction of “TTL” Consistent with the Specification Is One That Measures Distance to the Sensor.....	1
A.	The specification says how the TTL/EFL ratio is measured.....	1
B.	The specification’s teaching of how to calculate TTL/EFL controls, even under the BRI standard .....	3
C.	Apple fails to rebut Corephotonics’ evidence on the term “image plane” .....	6
D.	Apple quotes Dr. Moore’s testimony misleadingly and out of context.....	7
III.	Ogino Does Not Render the TTL/EFL Ratio Limitation Obvious.....	9
A.	Ogino does not disclose a TTL/EFL ratio less than 1.0.....	9
B.	Apple fails to establish a motivation to combine Ogino’s teaching at lines 5:65–6:2 with its configuration 6.....	13
C.	Ogino does not teach what the TTL would be if Ogino’s teachings were combined .....	15
D.	Dr. Sasián’s new Zemax analysis is untimely, and it also undercuts Apple’s arguments .....	16
E.	Dr. Moore <i>did not</i> testify that Ogino example 6 discloses the TTL/EFL ratio limitation .....	20
IV.	One Skilled in the Art Would <i>Not</i> Have Been Motivated to Build Ogino Example 6 with an L11/L1e Ratio Satisfying the Claims.....	22

Case No. IPR2019-00030  
U.S. Patent No. 9,857,568

A.	The Handbook of Optics teaches away from the combination Apple proposes.....	22
B.	Beich teaches away from the combination Apple proposes.....	23
V.	Conclusion.....	24

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### Cases

<i>In re Gordon</i> , 733 F.2d 900 (Fed. Cir. 1984) .....	14
<i>In re Schwemberger</i> , 410 Fed. Appx. 298 (Fed. Cir. 2010) .....	3
<i>Kinetic Concepts, Inc. v. Smith &amp; Nephew, Inc.</i> , 688 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2012) .....	14
<i>Phillips v. AWH Corp.</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005) .....	4
<i>SightSound Techs., LLC v. Apple Inc.</i> , 809 F.3d 1307 (Fed. Cir. 2015) .....	4
<i>Vitronics Corp. v. Conception, Inc.</i> , 90 F.3d 1576 (Fed.Cir.1996) .....	4

### Rules

37 C.F.R. § 42.100.....	3
-------------------------	---

PATENT OWNER'S EXHIBIT LIST

<i>Number</i>	<i>Description</i>
2001	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2011/0249346 “Tang”
2002	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2011/0279910 “Tang”
2003	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2011/0261470 “Chen”
2004	Declaration of Marc A. Fenster in Support of Motion to Appear <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> on Behalf of Patent Owner Corephotonics, Ltd.
2005	Declaration of Duncan Moore, Ph.D.
2006	Curriculum Vitae of Duncan Moore, Ph.D.
2007	U.S. Patent No. 8,395,851
2008	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2011/0249346
2009	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2011/0279910
2010	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2011/0261470
2011	Transcript of the February 15, 2019 Deposition of Dr. José Sasián in the IPR2018-01140 and IPR2018-01146
2012	Transcript of the July 2, 2019 Deposition of Dr. José Sasián in IPR2019-00030
2013	Declaration of José Sasián in IPR2018-01140 and IPR2018-01146
2014	Excerpts from Robert E. Fischer, Biljana Tadic-Galeb, Paul R. Yoder, OPTICAL SYSTEM DESIGN, 2nd Ed. (2008)

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.