

PUBLIC VERSION

UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION

Washington, D.C.

In the Matter of

CERTAIN STRONTIUM-RUBIDIUM
RADIOISOTOPE INFUSION SYSTEMS, AND
COMPONENTS THEREOF INCLUDING
GENERATORS

INV. NO. 337-TA-1110

INITIAL DETERMINATION ON VIOLATION OF SECTION 337 AND
RECOMMENDED DETERMINATION ON REMEDY AND BOND

Administrative Law Judge Clark S. Cheney

(August 1, 2019)

Appearances:

For the Complainant Bracco Diagnostics, Inc.:

Mark G. Davis, Esq., and Patrick J. McCarthy, Esq. of Goodwin Procter LLP of Washington, DC

Scott Bornstein, Esq., and Brian J. Prew, Esq. of Greenberg Traurig, LLP of New York, NY

For the Respondents Jubilant Draximage, Inc., Jubilant Pharma Limited, and Jubilant Life Sciences.:

T. Cy Walker, Esq., Robert L. Hails, Esq., Jason F. Hoffman, Esq., and Michael E. Anderson, Esq. of Baker & Hostetler LLP of Washington, DC

Jared A. Brandyberry, Esq. of Baker & Hostetler LLP of Denver, CO

Kevin P. Flynn, Esq. of Baker & Hostetler LLP of Cincinnati, OH

Lesley Grossberg, Esq. of Baker & Hostetler LLP of Philadelphia, PA

Andrew E. Samuels, Esq. of Baker & Hostetler LLP of Columbus, OH

Katrina Quicker, Esq. and Theresa M. Weisenberger, Esq. of Baker & Hostetler LLP of Atlanta, GA

PUBLIC VERSION

John T. Gallagher, Esq. and James F. Harrington, Esq. of Hoffman & Baron, LLP of Syosset,
NY

PUBLIC VERSION

Table of Contents

I.	Introduction.....	2
A.	Procedural History	2
B.	The Parties	3
1.	Complainant Bracco Diagnostics Inc.	3
2.	The Jubilant Respondents	3
C.	The Asserted Patents.....	4
1.	U.S. Patent No. 9,814,826 (JX-0001).....	5
2.	U.S. Patent No. 9,750,869 (JX-0002).....	5
3.	U.S. Patent No. 9,750,870 (JX-0003).....	5
D.	The Technology at Issue	5
E.	The Accused Products.....	7
F.	The Domestic Industry Products.....	8
II.	Jurisdiction & Importation.....	9
A.	Subject Matter Jurisdiction	9
B.	Personal Jurisdiction	9
C.	In Rem Jurisdiction	9
D.	Importation.....	9
E.	Standing	10
III.	Legal Principles	10
A.	Claim Construction	10
B.	Validity	12
1.	Anticipation	12
2.	Obviousness.....	13
C.	Assignor Estoppel	14
D.	Infringement.....	15
1.	Direct Infringement.....	16
2.	Inducement of Infringement.....	16
3.	Contributory Infringement.....	17
E.	Domestic Industry	17
1.	Economic Prong	18
2.	Technical Prong.....	18
IV.	Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	19

PUBLIC VERSION

V.	Validity	21
A.	Assignor Estoppel	21
1.	Staff Is Not Estopped.....	25
B.	Obviousness	25
1.	The Prior Art.....	26
2.	Comparing the Claims to the Prior Art.....	39
3.	Secondary Considerations Bearing on Obviousness	112
4.	Conclusion	122
C.	Anticipation.....	122
VI.	Infringement.....	125
1.	Inducement of Infringement	127
2.	Contributory Infringement.....	128
VII.	Domestic Industry	128
A.	Technical Prong	128
B.	Economic Prong.....	129
1.	The History of Bracco’s Rubidium Infusion Systems.....	129
2.	Whether FDA Approval Is Required for a Domestic Industry.....	132
3.	Plant and Equipment.....	136
4.	Labor and Capital	140
5.	Engineering, Research, and Development.....	145
C.	Status of the Industry	147
1.	A Domestic Industry Exists	147
2.	Whether the Domestic Industry Will Persist	148
VIII.	Conclusions of Law	149
IX.	Recommended Determination on Remedy & Bond	150
A.	Background Facts.....	151
1.	The CardioGen-82 Model 510.....	154
2.	The RUBY Version 3 System	157
B.	The Public Interest Factors	160
1.	Public Health and Welfare.....	160
2.	Competitive Conditions in the United States Economy	166
3.	Production of Like or Directly Competitive Products in the United States	168
4.	United States Consumers.....	169
5.	Conclusion	170

PUBLIC VERSION

C. Limited Exclusion Order..... 170

D. Cease and Desist Order 173

E. Bond During Presidential Review 175

X. Initial Determination..... 177

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.