

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

JUBILANT DRAXIMAGE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

BRACCO DIAGNOSTICS INC.,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2018-01449
Patent 9,299,467

Patent Owner's Preliminary Response

Table of Contents

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. PETITIONER’S ASSERTED LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART AND CLAIM CONSTRUCTION2

III. FACTUAL BACKGROUND: THE CITED PRIOR ART AND PROSECUTION HISTORY OF THE ’467 PATENT.....3

A. Overview of Petitioner’s art and arguments4

B. The art at issue in the Petition and during prosecution5

 1. The “Klein” references6

 2. Petitioner’s secondary references16

 3. The “Hirschman” reference (Ex. 2001)20

C. Overview of the art and arguments relied on by the examiner during prosecution21

 1. Prosecution of pertinent members of the ’467 patent family21

 2. Prosecution of the ’467 patent22

IV. ARGUMENT25

A. Legal Standards.....26

B. The Board should exercise its discretion and deny institution28

 1. Braun Factor 1: “the similarities and material differences between the asserted art and the prior art involved during examination”28

 2. Braun Factor 2: “the cumulative nature of the asserted art and the prior art evaluated during examination”41

 3. Braun Factor 3: “the extent to which the asserted art was evaluated during examination”46

 4. Braun Factor 4: “the extent of the overlap between the arguments made during examination and the manner in which a petitioner relies on the prior art or a patent owner distinguishes the prior art”48

 5. Braun Factor 5: “whether a petitioner has pointed out sufficiently how the Office erred in evaluating the asserted prior

art”59

6. Braun Factor 6: “the extent to which additional evidence and facts presented in the petition warrant reconsideration of the prior art or arguments”61

7. Weighing the factors62

V. CONCLUSION64

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Apotex Inc. v. Celgene Corp.</i> , IPR2018-00685, Paper 8 (PTAB Sept. 27, 2018).....	64
<i>Becton Dickinson & Co. v. B. Braun Melsungen AG</i> , IPR2017-01586, Paper 8 (PTAB Dec. 15, 2017)	28
<i>Boehringer Ingelheim Int'l GMBH v. Biogen, Inc.</i> , IPR2015-00418, Paper 14 (PTAB Jul. 13, 2015).....	19
<i>Cultec, Inc. v. StormTech LLC</i> , IPR2017-00777, Paper 7 (PTAB Aug. 22, 2017).....	26
<i>In re Hall</i> , 781 F.2d 897-99 (Fed. Cir. 1986).....	18
<i>Harmonic Inc. v. Avid Tech., Inc.</i> , 815 F.3d 1356 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	26
<i>Hospira, Inc. v. Genentech, Inc.</i> , IPR2017-00739, Paper 16 (PTAB July 27, 2017).....	26
<i>Kyocera Wireless Corp. v. ITC</i> , 545 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	18
<i>In re Magnum Oil Tools Int'l, Ltd.</i> , 829 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	18
<i>Microsoft Corp. v. Corel Software, LLC</i> , IPR2016-01300, Paper 13 (PTAB Jan. 4, 2017)	18
<i>Mylan Pharm. v. Boehringer Ingelheim GMBH</i> , IPR2016-01565, Paper 23 (PTAB Aug. 1, 2017).....	19
<i>NHK Spring Co., Ltd. v. Intri-Plex Techs., Inc.</i> , IPR2018-00752, Paper 8 (PTAB Sept. 12, 2018).....	57

Statutes

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.