

1 Nina S. Tallon, DC Bar No. 479481, *appearing pro hac vice*
2 WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
3 1875 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
4 Washington, DC 20006
5 Phone: 202-663-6000 / Fax: 202-663-6363

6 Joseph J. Mueller, MA Bar No. 647567, *appearing pro hac vice*,
7 WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
8 60 State Street
9 Boston, MA 02109
10 Phone: 617-526-6000 / Fax: 617-526-5000

11 Juanita R. Brooks, SBN 75934, brooks@fr.com
12 Seth M. Sproul, SBN 217711, sproul@fr.com
13 FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.
14 12390 El Camino Real
15 San Diego, CA 92130
16 Phone: (858) 678-5070/ Fax: (858) 678-5099

17 Ruffin B. Cordell, DC Bar No. 445801, *pro hac vice*, cordell@fr.com
18 FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.
19 1000 Maine Avenue, Suite 1000
20 Washington, D.C. 20024
21 Phone: 202-783-5070 / Fax: 202-783-2331

22 [Additional counsel identified on signature page]

23 *Attorneys for Defendant/Counterclaim Plaintiff Apple Inc.*

24 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
25 **SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

26 QUALCOMM INCORPORATED,

27 Plaintiff,

28 v.

29 APPLE INC.,

30 Defendant.

31 AND RELATED COUNTERCLAIMS.

Case No. 3:17-cv-1375-DMS-MDD

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF
APPLE INC.'S MOTION FOR
JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW
PURSUANT TO RULE 50(a)**

TRIAL DATE: MARCH 4, 2019

JUDGE: HON. DANA SABRAW

IPR2018-01334
Intel v. Qualcomm
INTEL 1025

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. APPLE IS ENTITLED TO JUDGMENT AS MATTER OF LAW OF NON-INFRINGEMENT.....	1
A. Legal Standards	1
B. Apple Is Entitled to Judgment of Non-Infringement of the '949 Patent.....	2
C. Apple Is Entitled to Judgment of Non-Infringement of the '490 Patent.....	7
D. Apple Is Entitled to Judgment of Non-Infringement of the '936 Patent.....	11
III. APPLE IS ENTITLED TO JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW OF NO WILLFULNESS	16
IV. APPLE IS ENTITLED TO JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW ON QUALCOMM'S DAMAGES CLAIMS.....	18
V. CONCLUSION	21

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Federal Cases

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Am. Calcar, Inc. v. Am. Honda Motor Co., Inc.,
No. 06-cv-2433, 2009 WL 10672071 (S.D. Cal. Mar. 2, 2009).....16

Apple Inc. v. Samsung Elecs. Co.,
695 F.3d 1370 (Fed. Cir. 2012)4

Asetek Danmark A/S v. CMI USA Inc.,
852 F.3d 1352 (Fed. Cir. 2017)3

Asyst Techs., Inc. v. Emtrak, Inc.,
402 F.3d 1188 (Fed. Cir. 2005)2

Behne v. 3M Microtouch Sys., Inc.,
11 F. App'x 856 (9th Cir. 2001)1

Carl Zeiss Vision Intern. GMBH v. Signet Armorlite, Inc.,
No. 07-cv-0894, 2010 WL 3636180 (S.D. Cal. Sept. 13, 2010)1

Conoco, Inc. v. Energy & Envtl. Int'l, L.C.,
460 F.3d 1349 (Fed. Cir. 2006)2

CSP Techs., Inc. v. Sud-Chemie AG,
643 Fed. Appx. 953 (Fed. Cir. 2016).....2

Enfish, LLC v. Microsoft Corp.,
822 F.3d 1327 (Fed. Cir. 2016)13

Festo Corp. v. Shoketsu Kinzoku Kogyo Kabushiki Co.,
535 U.S. 722 (2002).....2

Frac Shack Inc. v. Fuel Automation Station LLC,
No. 16-cv-02275, 2018 WL 5792613 (D. Colo. Nov. 5, 2018).....13

Halo Electronics, Inc. v. Pulse Electronics, Inc.,
136 S. Ct. 1923 (2016)15

Honeywell Int'l Inc. v. Hamilton Sundstrand Corp.,
370 F.3d 1131 (Fed. Cir. 2004)2

1 *Lear Siegler, Inc. v. Sealy Mattress Co. of Mich., Inc.*,
 2 873 F.2d 1422 (Fed. Cir. 1989).....5, 14

3 *Lucent Techs. Inc. v. Gateway, Inc.*,
 4 No. 02-cv-2060, 2007 WL 925354 (S. D. Cal. Mar. 6, 2007).....14

5 *Meyer Intellectual Props. Ltd. v. Bodum, Inc.*,
 6 690 F.3d 1354 (Fed. Cir. 2012)1

7 *Plano Encryption Techs., LLC v. Alkami, Inc.*,
 8 No. 2:16-cv-1032, 2017 WL 3654122 (E.D. Tex. Aug. 23, 2017).....13

9 *Read Corp. v. Portec, Inc.*,
 10 970 F.2d 816 (Fed. Cir. 1992).....16

11 *Riles v. Shell Expl. & Prod. Co.*,
 12 298 F.3d 1302 (Fed. Cir. 2002)1

13 *Sleep Number Corp. v. Sizewise Rentals, LLC*,
 14 No. ED CV 18-00356, 2018 WL 5263065 (C.D. Cal. June 26, 2018)16

15 *State Contracting & Eng’g Corp. v. Condotte Am., Inc.*,
 16 346 F.3d 1057 (Fed. Cir. 2003)16

17 *Stickle v. Heublein, Inc.*,
 18 716 F.2d 1550 (Fed. Cir. 1983)15

19 *Torres v. City of Los Angeles*,
 20 548 F.3d 1197, 1205 (9th Cir. 2008)1

21 *In re Varma*,
 22 816 F.3d 1352 (Fed. Cir. 2016)13

23 *VirnetX, Inc. v. Cisco Sys., Inc.*,
 24 767 F.3d 1308 (Fed. Cir. 2014)1

25 *Vulcan Eng’g Co. v. Fata Aluminum, Inc.*,
 26 278 F.3d 1366 (Fed. Cir. 2002)15

27 *WesternGeco L.L.C. v. ION Geophysical Corp.*,
 28 837 F.3d 1358 (Fed. Cir. 2016)15

29 *Wordtech Sys., Inc. v. Integrated Networks Sols., Inc.*,
 30 609 F.3d 1308 (Fed. Cir. 2010)17

1 **Rules**

2 Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 50(a).....1, 17

3 Local Rule 5.4.....23

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.