

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

QUALCOMM INCORPORATED,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2018-01316
Patent 8,063,674

PETITIONERS' REPLY TO PATENT OWNER RESPONSE

PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.23

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	THE BOARD’S PRECEDENT CLEARLY ARTICULATES THAT GROUND IN AN IPR MAY BE BASED ON AIPA	1
II.	EXPLICIT MOTIVATION TO COMBINE THE AIPA WITH MAJCHERCZAK, AS DESCRIBED IN THE PRIOR ART, IS NOT OBIATED BY POTENTIAL DISADVANTAGES OF THE COMBINATION ALLEGED BY PATENT OWNER	2
A.	There Exists Explicit Motivation in Majcherczak to Combine the AIPA and Majcherczak.....	3
B.	The Motivation of Gaining Hysteresis in the AIPA is Not Obviated by Patent Owner’s Allegations of Potential Disadvantage Arising from the Combination	7
III.	EXPLICIT MOTIVATION IN THE PRIOR ART TO COMBINE STEINACKER, DOYLE, AND PARK IS NOT OBIATED BY POTENTIAL DISADVANTAGES OF THE COMBINATION ALLEGED BY PATENT OWNER.....	12
A.	Explicit Teachings in Steinacker, Doyle, and Park Motivate the Combination Set Forth in the Petition.....	13
B.	Patent Owner’s Allegations of Certain Disadvantages Do Not Obviate the Prior Art’s Motivation to Combine Steinacker, Doyle, and Park	24
IV.	CONCLUSION	24

EXHIBITS

- APPLE-1001 U.S. Patent No. 8,063,674 to Kwon *et al.* (“the ’674 patent”)
- APPLE-1002 Excerpts from the Prosecution History of the ’674 Patent (“the Prosecution History”)
- APPLE-1003 Declaration of Dr. Robert Horst
- APPLE-1004 Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Robert Horst
- APPLE-1005 U.S. Patent No. 7,279,943 to Steinacker (“Steinacker”)
- APPLE-1006 U.S. Patent No. 4,717,836 to Doyle (“Doyle”)
- APPLE-1007 Jun Cheol Park and Vincent J. Mooney, *Sleepy Stack Leakage Reduction*, 14 IEEE Transactions On Very Large Scale Integration (VLSI) Systems 1251 (2006) (“Park”)
- APPLE-1008 U.S. Pat. Appl. Pub. No. 2002/0163364 to Majcherczak *et al.* (“Majcherczak”)
- APPLE-1009 U.S. Patent No. 6,646,844 to Matthews (“Matthews”)
- APPLE-1010 G. W. Griffiths, “A Review of Semiconductor Packaging and Its Role in Electronics Manufacturing,” 8th IEEE/CHMT International Conference on Electronic Manufacturing Technology Symposium (1990)
- APPLE-1011 Wang-Chang Albert Gu, “RF Front-End Modules in Cellular Handsets,” 2004 IEEE Compound Semiconductor Integrated Circuit Symposium (2005)
- APPLE-1012 Kaushik Roy *et al.*, “Leakage current mechanisms and leakage reduction techniques in deep-submicrometer CMOS circuits,” 91 Proceedings of the IEEE 2, pp. 305-327 (Apr. 2003) (“Roy”)

- APPLE-1013 Yangyang Ye *et al.*, “A new technique for standby leakage reduction in high-performance circuits,” 1998 Symposium on VLSI Circuits. Digest of Technical Papers (Cat. No.98CH36215), Honolulu, HI, USA, 1998, pp. 40-41 (“Borkar”)
- APPLE-1014 U.S. Patent No. 7,049,865 to Parker et al. (“Parker”)
- APPLE-1015 Qadeer A. Khan *et al.*, “A Sequence Independent Power-on-Reset Circuit for Multi-Voltage Systems,” 2006 IEEE International Symposium on Circuits and Systems (Sep. 2006)
- APPLE-1016 Declaration of Jacob Munford (with attachments)
- APPLE-1017 Transcript of Deposition of Dr. Massoud Pedram
- APPLE-1018 Supplemental Declaration of Dr. Robert Horst
- APPLE-1019 U. Daya Perera, *Reliability of Mobile Phones*, 1995 IEEE Proceedings Annual Reliability and Maintainability Symposium (Jan. 1995)
- APPLE-1020 *One World Technologies, Inc. v. The Chamberlain Group, Inc.*, IPR2017-00126, Paper 56 (Final Written Decision) (PTAB Oct. 24, 2018)
- APPLE-1021 *One World Technologies, Inc. v. The Chamberlain Group, Inc.*, IPR2017-00126, Paper 67 (Denial of Rehearing Request), 14-21 (PTAB Apr. 4, 2019)
- APPLE-1022 U.S. Patent No. 5,386,153 to Peer H. Voss et al. (“Voss”)
- APPLE-1023 Wikipedia Entry for “LTspice” available at <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/LTspice> (accessed on July 17, 2019)
- APPLE-1024 John F. Wakerly, *DIGITAL DESIGN PRINCIPLES AND PRACTICES* 4th Ed. (2006)

APPLE-1025

Bruce Jacob, *ENEE 359a Digital VLSI Design - Transistor Sizing & Logical Effort*, available at <https://ece.umd.edu/courses/enee359a.S2007/> (Internet Archive cached version of this address demonstrating presentation was available at least as early as July 4, 2008)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.