

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

DELL INC.

Petitioner,

v.

ALACRITECH INC.,

Patent Owner

Case IPR2018-01307

U.S. Patent 8,805,948

**PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE
PURSUANT TO 35 U.S.C. § 313 AND 37 C.F.R. § 42.107**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. OVERVIEW OF THE '948 PATENT	2
A. The '948 Patent Specification	2
B. The '948 Patent Claims	7
III. PROSECUTION HISTORY OF THE '948 PATENT	7
IV. OVERVIEW OF THE ALLEGED PRIOR ART	8
A. Thia, A Reduced Operation Protocol Engine (ROPE) for a Multiple-layer Bypass Architecture (1995) ("Thia")	8
B. Tanenbaum, Computer Networks, 3rd ed. (1996) ("Tanenbaum")	13
C. Stevens, <i>TCP/IP Illustrated Volume 2: The Implementation</i> ("Stevens") (Ex. 1063)	16
V. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	17
VI. STEVENS IS NOT AVAILABLE AS PRIOR ART	18
VII. PETITIONER HAS NOT SUFFICIENTLY SHOWN A MOTIVATION TO COMBINE THIA WITH TANENBAUM OR STEVENS	20
VIII. PETITIONER HAS NOT SHOWN A DISCLOSURE OF <i>PACKET</i> PROCESSING FOR THE "CHECKING" LIMITATIONS OF THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS	23
IX. THE BOARD SHOULD DENY THE PETITION BECAUSE IT IS TIME BARRED UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 315(B) AND RECENT PRECEDENT	30
A. Procedural Background	33
B. Burden of Proof	37
C. Dell, CenturyLink, and Wistron Benefit From Intel's IPRs and Are Real Parties in Interest	37
D. The Established Relationships Among Intel, Dell, CenturyLink, and Wistron Justify the Finding of Real Parties-in-Interest	39

E. Finding Dell, CenturyLink, and Wistron Are Real
Parties-in-Interest Is Consistent with Legislative Intent..... 41

F. Patent Owner Is Not Able to Amend Claims Due to
Petitioner’s Late Filing..... 43

G. Intel’s Independent Interest Is Not a Defense..... 43

X. CONCLUSION 45

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	<u>Page</u>
Cases	
<i>Applications in Internet Time, LLC v. RPX Corp.</i> , 897 F.3d 1336 (Fed. Cir. 2018)	32, 35, 37, 39, 41, 44
<i>Beckman Instruments v. LKB Produkter AB</i> , 892 F.2d 1547 (Fed. Cir. 1989)	9
<i>Cisco Systems, Inc. v. C-Cation Techs., LLC</i> , IPR2014-00454 (PTAB Aug. 29, 2014)	19
<i>Coalition for Affordable Drugs IV LLC v. Pharmacyclics, Inc.</i> , IPR2015-01076, slip op. 6 (PTAB Oct.19, 2015)	19
<i>In re CSB-System International, Inc.</i> , 832 F.3d 1335	43
<i>Dynamic Drinkware LLC v. Nat’l Graphics, Inc.</i> , 800 F.3d 1375 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	20
<i>Intel v. Alacritech</i> , IPR2017-01395 (PTAB November 22, 2017)	18
<i>Symbol Techs. Inc. v. Opticon Inc.</i> , 935 F.2d 1569, 19 USPQ2d 1241 (Fed. Cir. 1991)	9
<i>Wi-Fi One, LLC v. Broadcom Corp.</i> , 878 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2018)	30
<i>Wi-Fi One, LLC v. Broadcom Corp.</i> , 887 F.3d 1329 (Fed. Cir. 2018)	32
<i>Worlds Inc. v. Bungie, Inc.</i> , Case. Nos. 2017-1481, -- F.3d -- (Fed. Cir. Sept. 7, 2018)	32
Statutory Authorities	
Fed. R. Civ. P. 24	33, 38
Rules and Regulations	
35 U.S.C. § 21	1
35 U.S.C. § 313	1
35 U.S.C. § 312(a)(2)	32
35 U.S.C. § 314(a)	45
35 U.S.C. § 315(b)	1, 30, 32, 36, 43, 45
35 U.S.C. § 315(c)	30, 33, 45
37 C.F.R. § 42.107(a)	1
37 CFR §§ 42.8(b)(1), 42.104(a)	32

Other Authorities

H.R. Rep. No. 112–98 (2011)..... 41
Office Patent Trial Practice Guide,
77 Fed. Reg. 48,756, 48,759 (Aug. 14, 2012)..... 32

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.