

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,
Patent Owner

IPR2018-01254
U.S. Patent No. 8,479,969

**PATENT OWNER'S
PRELIMINARY RESPONSE**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. THE 969 PATENT	5
A. Overview	5
B. Priority Date	11
III. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	11
IV. THE PRIOR ART.....	12
A. Giordano.....	12
B. Shelton.....	15
C. Wallace.....	16
D. Tierney.....	18
V. REASONS WHY THE PETITION SHOULD BE DENIED	18
A. All of Petitioner’s Grounds Fail Because Petitioner Does Not Establish a Motivation to Combine or Reasonable Expectation of Success	18
1. Grounds 1-5: Petitioner provides no explanation for how to combine the incompatible systems of Giordano’s and Shelton’s handheld instruments and Wallace’s robotic instrument base	19
2. Petitioner fails to show a reasonable expectation of success.....	23
B. The Board Should Exercise Its Discretion To Deny Institution Pursuant To § 325(d).....	25
VI. CONCLUSION.....	29

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Agrinomix, LLC v. Mitchell Ellis Prods., Inc.</i> , IPR2017-00525, Paper No. 6 (P.T.A.B. June 14, 2017)	27
<i>Arctic Cat Inc. v. Bombardier Recreational Prod. Inc.</i> , 876 F.3d 1350 (Fed. Cir. 2017)	4, 19
<i>Becton, Dickinson & Co. v. B. Braun Melsungen AG</i> , IPR2017-01586, Paper 8 (P.T.A.B. Dec. 5, 2017)	25
<i>Compass Bank v. Intellectual Ventures II</i> , IPR2014-00786, Paper 46 (P.T.A.B. Sept. 23, 2015).....	22, 23
<i>Corning Inc. v. DSM IP Assets</i> , IPR2013-00050, Paper 77 (P.T.A.B. May 1, 2014)	22, 24
<i>Cultec, Inc. v. Stormtech Inc.</i> , IPR2017-00777, Paper No. 7 (P.T.A.B. Aug. 22, 2017).....	26
<i>Institut Pasteur v. Focarino</i> , 738 F.3d 1337 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	19
<i>Kinetic Concepts, Inc. v. Smith & Nephew, Inc.</i> , 688 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	18
<i>Praxair Distrib., Inc. v. INO Therapeutic LLC</i> , IPR2015-00893, Paper 14 (P.T.A.B. Sept. 22, 2015).....	25
<i>Unified Patents Inc. v. Berman</i> , IPR2016-01571, Paper No. 10 (P.T.A.B. Dec. 14, 2016)	28
Other Authorities	
37 C.F.R. § 42.65(a).....	22, 23
37 C.F.R. § 42.100(b)	12
37 CFR § 42.6(a)(2)(ii)	30

37 CFR § 42.6(a)(2)(iii).....30
37 CFR § 42.830
37 CFR § 42.24(a)(1)(i)30
77 Fed. Reg. 48,756, 48,766 (Aug. 14, 2012)12
83 Fed. Reg. 51,340 (Oct. 11, 2018).....12

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit #	Description
2001	Excerpts of a technology tutorial filed in <i>Ethicon v. Intuitive Surgical</i> , C.A. No. 1-17:cv-871 (LPS) (CJB) (D. Del. June 28, 2018)
2002	U.S. Patent No. 7,691,098
2003	U.S. Patent No. 7,524,320
2004	U.S. Patent No. 6,783,524

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.