

**UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

---

**BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

---

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,  
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,  
Patent Owner.

---

IPR2018-01248  
U.S. Patent No. 8,479,969

---

**PATENT OWNER ETHICON LLC'S SUR-REPLY**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	<b>Page</b>
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. RESPONSE TO PETITIONER’S REPLY ARGUMENTS .....	3
A. Prisco’s Cable “Pull-Pull” Embodiment Combined With Cooper’s Multi-Disk Wrist Does Not Anticipate or Render Obvious Claim 24.....	3
B. Prisco’s Drive Rod “Push-Pull” Embodiment Does Not Anticipate Claim 24.....	6
C. Prisco’s Drive Rod “Push-Pull” Embodiment Does Not Render Obvious Claim 24.....	12
III. CONCLUSION.....	15

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

	<b>Page(s)</b>
<b>Cases</b>	
<i>In re Fritch</i> , 972 F.2d 1260 (Fed. Cir. 1992) .....	15
<i>KVK-Tech, Inc. v. Silvergate Pharm., Inc.</i> , PGR2017-00039, Paper 8 (P.T.A.B. Feb. 6, 2018) .....	8
<i>Microsoft Corp. v. Biscotti</i> , 878 F.3d 1052 (Fed. Cir. 2017) .....	6
<i>Polaris Indus., Inc. v. Arctic Cat, Inc.</i> , 882 F.3d 1056 (Fed. Cir. 2018) .....	13
<i>Samsung Elecs. Co. v. Elm 3DS Innovations, LLC</i> , 925 F.3d 1373 (Fed. Cir. 2019) .....	14
<i>Tec-Air, Inc. v. Denso Mfg. Mich. Inc.</i> , 192 F.3d 1353 (Fed. Cir. 1999) .....	15

**EXHIBIT LIST FOR IPR2018-01248**

<b>Ethicon Exhibit #</b>	<b>Description</b>
Ex. 2001	Excerpts of a technology tutorial filed in <i>Ethicon v. Intuitive Surgical</i> , C.A. No. 1-17:cv-871 (LPS) (CJB) (D. Del. June 28, 2018)
Ex. 2002	Patent Statutory Disclaimer for U.S. Patent No. 8,479,969 filed on October 15, 2018
Ex. 2003	[Reserved]
Ex. 2004	[Reserved]
Ex. 2005	[Reserved]
Ex. 2006	[Reserved]
Ex. 2007	[Reserved]
Ex. 2008	[Reserved]
Ex. 2009	[Reserved]
Ex. 2010	[Reserved]
Ex. 2011	[Reserved]
Ex. 2012	[Reserved]
Ex. 2013	[Reserved]
Ex. 2014	[Reserved]
Ex. 2015	[Reserved]
Ex. 2016	[Reserved]
Ex. 2017	[Reserved]
Ex. 2018	[Reserved]

<b>Ethicon Exhibit #</b>	<b>Description</b>
Ex. 2019	[Reserved]
Ex. 2020	[Reserved]
Ex. 2021	Declaration of Dr. Shorya Awtar
Ex. 2022	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Bryan Knodel, IPR2018-01248, April 4, 2019
Ex. 2023	[Reserved]
Ex. 2024	[Reserved]
Ex. 2025	[Reserved]
Ex. 2026	[Reserved]
Ex. 2027	[Reserved]

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.