

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,
Patent Owner

IPR2018-01248
U.S. Patent No. 8,479,969

PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | Page |
|---|-------------|
| I. INTRODUCTION..... | 1 |
| II. THE 969 PATENT | 4 |
| III. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART | 10 |
| IV. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION | 11 |
| V. THE PRIOR ART..... | 11 |
| A. Prisco | 11 |
| 1. Prisco Discloses Two Distinct Grip Mechanisms: Cable “Pull-Pull” and Drive Rod “Push-Pull” | 15 |
| 2. Prisco’s Shaft Roll Mechanism..... | 17 |
| B. Cooper | 17 |
| C. Wallace | 21 |
| D. Tierney..... | 22 |
| VI. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE PATENTABLE | 22 |
| A. Ground 1: Prisco Does Not Disclose All Limitations Of Claim 24 Arranged As In The Claim, And A POSITA Would Not Have At Once Envisaged Such An Arrangement..... | 23 |
| 1. Prisco Does Not Disclose Combining the Drive Rod “Push-Pull” Embodiment With Cooper’s Articulating Wrist Mechanism | 26 |
| 2. Petitioner’s Alternate Theory Relying On Shaft Roll Gear 742 Does Not Disclose The Claimed Gear-Driven Portion In Operable Communication With A Selectively Movable Component And Associated Transmission Assembly..... | 31 |

B. Grounds 2-4: A POSITA Would Not Have Combined Prisco’s Drive Rod Embodiment With Cooper’s Wrist And The Combination of Prisco’s Cable Embodiment With Cooper’s Wrist Does Not Fall Within The Scope of Claim 2433

VII. CONCLUSION.....38

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

| | Page(s) |
|---|----------------|
| Cases | |
| <i>In re Arkley</i> , 455 F.2d 586 (C.P.A. 1972)..... | 24 |
| <i>Connell v. Sears, Roebuck & Co.</i> , 722 F.2d 1542 (Fed. Cir. 1983) | 23 |
| <i>General Elec. Co. v. United Techs. Corp.</i> , IPR2017-00428, Paper No. 38 (P.T.A.B. June 22, 2018) | 3, 35 |
| <i>Kinetic Concepts, Inc. v. Smith & Nephew, Inc.</i> , 688 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2012) | 33 |
| <i>Microsoft Corp. v. Biscotti, Inc.</i> , 878 F.3d 1052 (Fed. Cir. 2017) | 23, 31 |
| <i>Net MoneyIN, Inc. v. VeriSign, Inc.</i> , 545 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2008) | 23 |
| <i>Polaris Indus., Inc. v. Arctic Cat, Inc.</i> , 882 F.3d 1056 (Fed. Cir. 2018) | 3, 35, 36 |
| <i>Standard Oil Co. v. Am. Cyanamid Co.</i> , 774 F.2d 448 (Fed. Cir. 1985) | 36 |
| Other Authorities | |
| 37 C.F.R. § 42.100(b) | 11 |
| 37 CFR § 42.23(b) | 26 |
| 77 Fed. Reg. 48,756, 48,766 (Aug. 14, 2012) | 11 |

EXHIBIT LIST

| Exhibit # | Description |
|-----------|--|
| 2001 | Excerpts of a technology tutorial filed in <i>Ethicon v. Intuitive Surgical</i> , C.A. No. 1-17:cv-871 (LPS) (CJB) (D. Del. June 28, 2018) |
| 2002 | Patent Statutory Disclaimer for U.S. Patent No. 8,479,969 filed on October 15, 2018 |
| 2003 | [Reserved] |
| 2004 | [Reserved] |
| 2005 | [Reserved] |
| 2006 | [Reserved] |
| 2007 | [Reserved] |
| 2008 | [Reserved] |
| 2009 | [Reserved] |
| 2010 | [Reserved] |
| 2011 | [Reserved] |
| 2012 | [Reserved] |
| 2013 | [Reserved] |
| 2014 | [Reserved] |
| 2015 | [Reserved] |
| 2016 | [Reserved] |
| 2017 | [Reserved] |
| 2018 | [Reserved] |
| 2019 | [Reserved] |
| 2020 | [Reserved] |
| 2021 | Declaration of Shorya Awtar |
| 2022 | Deposition Transcript of Bryan Knodel, IPR2018-01248, April 4, 2019 |

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.