

**UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

---

**BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

---

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,  
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,  
Patent Owner

---

IPR2018-01248  
U.S. Patent No. 8,479,969

---

**PATENT OWNER ETHICON LLC'S MOTION TO TERMINATE**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
II.	STATEMENT OF PRECISE RELIEF REQUESTED .....	1
III.	STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS .....	2
IV.	STATEMENT OF REASONS FOR RELIEF REQUESTED .....	3
	A. Petitioner Reasonably Could Have Raised The Grounds Of The Present IPR In The -01247 Or -01254 IPRs.....	4
	1. The “Reasonably Could Have Raised” Language Of § 315(e)(1) Is Not Tied To Word Limits For Petitions .....	4
	2. § 315(e)(1) Makes No Exception For IPRs Filed On The Same Day .....	5
	B. The Board Must Terminate This -1248 Proceeding Before Reaching A Final Written Decision .....	7
	C. If Termination Is Deemed Discretionary, The Board Should Exercise That Discretion .....	9
V.	CONCLUSION.....	10

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

**Page(s)**

**Cases**

*Clearlamp, LLC v. LKQ Corp.*,  
2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 186028 (N.D. Ill. Mar. 18, 2016) .....5

*F’real Foods, LLC v. Hamilton Beach Brands, Inc.*,  
2019 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 62547 (D. Del. Apr. 10, 2019).....5

*IBM Corp. v. Intellectual Ventures II LLC*,  
Case No. IPR2014-01465, Paper 32 (P.T.A.B. Nov. 6, 2015) ..... 10

*Intuitive Surgical, Inc. v. Ethicon LLC*,  
Case No. IPR2018-01247, Paper 40 (P.T.A.B. Jan. 13, 2020).....3

*Intuitive Surgical, Inc. v. Ethicon LLC*,  
Case No. IPR2018-01254, Paper 43 (P.T.A.B. Jan. 13, 2020).....3

*Kingston v. SPEX*,  
IPR2018-01002, Paper No. 12 (Nov. 6, 2018) .....6

*Novartis Pharm. Corp. v. Par Pharm., Inc.*,  
2019 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 62489 (D. Del. Apr. 11, 2019).....5

*Progressive Cas. Ins. Co. v. Liberty Mut. Ins. Co.*,  
625 Fed. Appx. 552 (Fed. Cir. Aug. 24, 2015).....6, 7, 8, 9

*SAS Institute Inc. v. Iancu*,  
584 U.S. \_\_\_, Case No. 19-969, slip op. (2018).....8

*SiOnyx, LLC v. Hamamatsu Photonics K.K.*,  
330 F. Supp. 3d 574 (D. Mass. 2018).....5

*Sirona Dental Sys. v. Institut Strautmann AG*,  
892 F.3d 1349 (Fed. Cir. 2018) .....8

*SK Hynix Inc. v. Netlist Inc.*,  
Case No. IPR2018-00364, Paper 32 (P.T.A.B. August 5, 2019) .....5, 6, 7, 10

**Statutes**

35 U.S.C. § 315(e)(1).....*passim*  
35 U.S.C. § 327(a) .....9

**Other Authorities**

37 C.F.R. §42.1(b) .....10  
37 C.F.R. § 42.22(c).....2  
37 C.F.R. § 42.73(d)(1).....3  
37 C.F.R. § 42.122(a).....6

## EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit #	Description
Ex. 2001	Excerpts of a technology tutorial filed in <i>Ethicon v. Intuitive Surgical</i> , C.A. No. 1-17:cv-871 (LPS) (CJB) (D. Del. June 28, 2018)
Ex. 2002	Patent Statutory Disclaimer for U.S. Patent No. 8,479,969 filed on October 15, 2018
Ex. 2003	[Reserved]
Ex. 2004	[Reserved]
Ex. 2005	[Reserved]
Ex. 2006	[Reserved]
Ex. 2007	[Reserved]
Ex. 2008	[Reserved]
Ex. 2009	[Reserved]
Ex. 2010	[Reserved]
Ex. 2011	[Reserved]
Ex. 2012	[Reserved]
Ex. 2013	[Reserved]
Ex. 2014	[Reserved]
Ex. 2015	[Reserved]
Ex. 2016	[Reserved]
Ex. 2017	[Reserved]
Ex. 2018	[Reserved]
Ex. 2019	[Reserved]
Ex. 2020	[Reserved]
Ex. 2021	Declaration of Dr. Shorya Awtar
Ex. 2022	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Bryan Knodel, IPR2018-01248, April 4, 2019

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.