

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.
Petitioner

v.

ETHICON LLC
Patent Owner

Case IPR2018-01247
U.S. Patent No. 8,479,969

**PETITIONER'S REPLY TO
PATENT OWNER'S
RESPONSE**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	Ground 2: The Combination of Anderson and Timm Discloses Claim 24....	1
A.	Claim 24 Now Requires “A Tool Mounting Portion Operably Coupled to a Proximal End of Said Proximal Spine Portion”	1
B.	As a Backup Argument, Petitioner Established That the Tool Mounting Portion in the Prior Art was Also Coupled to the Distal End of the Proximal Spine Portion	5
C.	As Dr. Knodel Testified, a POSITA Would Have Been Motivated To Combine Anderson With Timm (Including Timm’s Lockable Articulation Joint).....	10
D.	Even if Tactile Feedback Were a Requirement, Anderson Discloses It	11
E.	Tactile Feedback Is Not a Requirement for Use of Passive Articulation with a Robotic System	12
F.	As Established in the Petition, a POSITA Would Have Had a Reasonable Expectation of Success	14
	1. Anderson Has Sufficient Transmission Members to Drive Timm	14
	2. Anderson Can Generate Sufficient Forces to Drive Timm.....	15
G.	Anderson Provides a Generic Robotic Foundation For a Variety of Tools	18
H.	The Unrelated Publications Cited by Patent Owner Fail to Address the Anderson / Timm Combination and Are Thus Irrelevant	20

III. Ground 3: The Articulation Bars of Wallace Are Compatible with the Anderson/Timm Combination22

A. In the Proposed Combination for Ground 3, the Articulation Mechanism of Timm Is Replaced with the Articulation Mechanism of Wallace22

B. Anderson Can Accommodate Additional Controls as Necessary to Operate the Wallace Articulation Mechanism22

IV. Ground 4: Claims 19 and 20 Would Have Been Obvious over Anderson and Knodel.....24

A. Petitioner Has Already Addressed Patent Owner’s “Tactile Feedback” Argument.....24

B. A POSITA Would Have Had a Reasonable Expectation of Success .25

V. Ground 5: Claims 21 and 22 Are Obvious over Anderson in view of Viola 25

VI. Conclusion27

EXHIBITS

- IS1001 U.S. Pat. No. 8,479,969 to Shelton, IV (“the ’969 Patent”)
- IS1002 Prosecution History of the ’969 Patent (Serial No. 13/369,609)
- IS1003 Reserved
- IS1004 Declaration of Dr. Bryan Knodel (Anderson as Primary Reference)
- IS1005 Reserved
- IS1006 Reserved
- IS1007 U.S. Patent No. 6,817,974 to Cooper et al. (“Cooper”)
- IS1008 U.S. Patent No. 6,699,235 to Wallace et al. (“Wallace”)
- IS1009 U.S. Patent No. 6,331,181 to Tierney et al. (“Tierney”)
- IS1010 U.S. Patent No. 6,783,524 to Anderson et al. (“Anderson”)
- IS1011 U.S. Patent No. 7,510,107 to Timm et al. (“Timm”)
- IS1012 U.S. Patent No. 5,465,895 to Knodel et al. (“Knodel”)
- IS1013 U.S. Patent No. 5,954,259 to Viola et al. (“Viola”)
- IS1014 U.S. Patent App. No. 2008/0167672 to Giordano et al.
 (“Giordano”)
- IS1015 Reserved
- IS1016 Reserved

...

- IS1017 Supplemental Declaration of Dr. Bryan Knodel
("Knodel Supp. Decl.")
- IS1018 Reserved
- IS1019 June 17, 2019 Deposition of Shorya Awtar for IPR2018-01247
("Awtar Dep. I")
- IS1020 U.S. Pat. No. 9,820,768 to Gee et al. ("Gee")
- IS1021 Reserved
- IS1022 Reserved
- IS1023 June 6, 2019 Deposition of Frank Fronczak for IPR2018-00936
("Fronczak Dep.")
- IS1024 Reserved
- IS1025 Reserved
- IS1026 District Court Complaint in *Ethicon LLC et al. v. Intuitive Surgical, Inc. et al.*, 1:17-cv-00871-LPS filed June 30, 2017
- IS1027 U.S. Pat. No. 7,524,320 to Tierney et al. ("Tierney 320")

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.