

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

GOOGLE LLC
Petitioner

v.

AGIS SOFTWARE DEVELOPMENT, LLC
Patent Owner

Case IPR2018-01081
Patent 9,445,251

**DECLARATION OF DAVID HILLIARD WILLIAMS IN SUPPORT OF
PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 9,445,251**

Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent & Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Qualifications	3
II.	My Understanding of Claim Construction.....	6
III.	My Understanding of Obviousness	7
IV.	Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	11
V.	Overview of the '251 Patent.....	11
	A. The Priority Date of the '251 Patent Cannot Be Earlier Than April 17, 2006 15	
VI.	Overview of the State of the Art at the Time of Filing.....	17
	A. Systems for Locating Wireless Devices, such as E911 systems, arrived in the 1990s.....	19
	B. Expanding Wireless Device Locators to the Creation of Ad-Hoc Networks for Emergency Responders was Known	22
	C. Utilizing Interactive Maps within the Context of Location-Based Services and Ad-Hoc Networks was known.....	29
	D. Conclusion	30
VII.	Grounds of Unpatentability	31
	A. The combination of Haney and Fumarolo teaches or suggests each feature of claims 1, 2, 4-6, 8, 10, 12, 22-24, 27, 29, 31, 32, and 35.....	31
	1. Overview of Haney	31
	2. Overview of Fumarolo	32
	3. Overview of the Combination of Haney in view of Fumarolo	33
	4. Motivation to Combine Haney and Fumarolo	34
	5. The combination of Haney in view of Fumarolo discloses or suggests each feature of claims 1, 2, 4-6, 8, 10, 12, 22-24, 27, 29, 31, 32, and 35.....	39
	B. Dependent Claims 2, 4-6, 8, 10, 12, 22, 23, 27, 29, 31, 32, and 35 Recite Nothing More Than Obvious Design Choices	86
VIII.	Conclusion	87

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 9,445,251 to Beyer, Jr. et al. (“the ’251 patent”)
1002	Prosecution History of U.S. Patent No. 9,445,251 (Application No. 14/633,804)
1003	Declaration of David Williams
1004	<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> of David Williams
1005	U.S. Patent No. 7,353,034 to Haney <i>et al.</i> (“Haney”)
1006	U.S. Patent No. 6,366,782 to Fumarolo <i>et al.</i> (“Fumarolo”)
1007	<i>Intentionally Left Blank</i>
1008	Complaint for Patent Infringement, <i>AGIS Software Development LLC v. Huawei Device USA Inc., et al.</i> , Civ. No. 2:17-cv-00513 (E.D. Tex.), filed June 21, 2017 (“Infringement Complaint”)
1009	Microsoft Word document compare of specifications between U.S. Patent No. 7,630,724 to Beyer, Jr. <i>et al.</i> and 7,031,728 to Beyer, Jr. <i>et al.</i>
1010	U.S. Patent No. 7,630,724 to Beyer, Jr. <i>et al.</i> (“’724 patent”)
1011	U.S. Patent No. 7,031,728 to Beyer, Jr. <i>et al.</i> (“’728 patent”)
1012	911 and E911 Services, Federal Communications Commission, www.fcc.gov/e911 (last visited May 7, 2018)
1013	Fact Sheet, FCC Wireless 911 Requirements (January 2001), <i>available at</i> https://transition.fcc.gov/pshs/services/911-services/enhanced911/archives/factsheet_requirements_012001.pdf
1014	Jock Christie, <i>et al.</i> , <i>Development and Deployment of GPS Wireless Devices for E911 and Location Based Services</i> (Position, Location, and Navigation Symposium, 2002) (“Christie”)

1015	Dale N. Hatfield, <i>A Report on Technical and Operational Issues Impacting The Provision of Wireless Enhanced 911 Services</i> , Federal Communications Commission (2002) (“Hatfield”)
1016	Charles E. Perkins, “Ad Hoc Networking.” Nokia Research Center (November 28, 2000) (“Perkins”)
1017	Duncan Scott Sharp, <i>Adapting Ad Hoc Network Concepts to Land Mobile Radio Systems</i> (1972 Ph.D. dissertation, University of Alberta) (on file with Simon Fraser University, December 2002) (“Duncan”)
1018	Madhavi W. Subbarao, <i>Mobile Ad Hoc Data Networks for Emergency Preparedness Telecommunications - Dynamic Power-Conscious Routing Concepts</i> (Submitted as an interim project for Contract Number DNCR086200 to the National Communications Systems, February 1, 2000) (“Subbarao”)
1019	McKinsey & Company, <i>The McKinsey Report : FDNY 9/11 Response</i> (2002) (“The McKinsey Report”)
1020	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2003/0100326 A1 to Grube <i>et al.</i> (“Grube”)
1021	<i>Intentionally Left Blank</i>
1022	U.S. Patent No. 6,182,114 to Yap <i>et al.</i> (“Yap”)
1023	U.S. Patent No. 6,700,589 to Canelones <i>et al.</i> (“Canelones”)
1024	U.S. Patent No. 6,654,683 to Jin <i>et al.</i> (“Jin”)
1025	Ching-Chien Chen, <i>et al.</i> , <i>Automatically and Accurately Conflating Satellite Imagery and Maps</i> (University of Southern California, October 2003) (“Chen”)
1026	U.S. Patent No. 5,563,931 to Bishop <i>et al.</i> (“Bishop”)
1027	Michael Trupiano, <i>A Taxonomy for Assessing Fitness of Mobile Data Services in US Consumer Markets</i> (February 1, 2001 Ph.D. dissertation, Massachusetts Institute of Technology) (on file with Massachusetts Institute of Technology) (“Trupiano”)

<p>1028</p>	<p>William K. Rashbaum, <i>Report on 9/11 Finds Flaws In Response of Police Dept.</i>, N.Y. Times (July 27, 2002), available at http://www.nytimes.com/2002/07/27/nyregion/report-on-9-11-finds-flaws-in-response-of-police-dept.html?mcubz=0</p>
<p>1029</p>	<p>Fred Durso, Jr., <i>A Decade of Difference</i>, NFPA Journal (Sept. 1, 2011), available at http://www.nfpa.org/news-and-research/publications/nfpa-journal/2011/september-october-2011/features/a-decade-of-difference</p>
<p>1030</p>	<p><i>Intentionally Left Blank</i></p>
<p>1031</p>	<p>John H. Mock <i>et al.</i>, <i>A Voice Over IP Solution for Mobile Radio Interoperability</i>, University of New Hampshire, ECE Department, IEEE 56th, Vol. 3, pp. 1338-1341 (2002)</p>
<p>1032</p>	<p>Rick Rotondo, <i>Locate-Track-Extract: Wireless Mesh Networking Allows Commanders to Keep Track of Firefighters at an Incident Scene</i>, Mission Critical Communications Magazine (March 2004)</p>

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.