

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

GOOGLE LLC, ) Patent No. 8,213,970  
)  
Petitioner, )  
)  
vs. )  
)  
AGIS SOFTWARE DEVELOPMENT )  
LLC, )  
)  
Patent Owner. )

- - -

DEPOSITION OF JAIME G. CARBONELL, Ph.D.

REPRODUCTION OF THIS TRANSCRIPT IS PROHIBITED  
WITHOUT AUTHORIZATION FROM THE CERTIFYING  
AGENCY

U.S. LEGAL SUPPORT  
(877) 479-2484

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

DEPOSITION OF JAIME G.

CARBONELL, Ph.D., a witness herein, called by  
the Petitioner, for examination, by and before  
Karen A. Nickel, a Certified Realtime Reporter  
and a notary public in and for the Commonwealth  
of Pennsylvania, at The Webb Law Firm, One  
Gateway Center, 420 Fort Duquesne Boulevard,  
Suite 1200, Pittsburgh, PA 15222, on Friday,  
June 7, 2019, at 9:10 a.m.

COUNSEL PRESENT:

For the Petitioner: Jonathan Tuminaro, Ph.D.  
Karen A. Wong-Chan, MEE  
Sterne Kessler Goldstein  
& Fox  
1100 New York Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20005

Michael A. Berta, Esq.  
Arnold & Porter, LLP  
7th Floor  
Three Embarcadero Center  
San Francisco, CA 94111

For the Patent Owner: Enrique W. Iturralde,  
Esq.  
Vincent J. Rubino, III,  
Esq.  
Brown Rudnick, LLP  
Seven Times Square  
New York, NY 10036

Also Present: Jim Sherwood

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

I N D E X

WITNESS	PAGE
Dr. Carbonell	
By Mr. Tuminaro	4
By Mr. Iturralde	196

E X H I B I T S

NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	MARKED
Exhibit 1	Declaration of Jaime G. Carbonell, Ph.D.	11
Exhibit 2	U.S. Patent No. 8,213,970	19
Exhibit 3	Declaration of David Hilliard Williams	39
Exhibit 4	U.S. Patent No. 2006/0218232	41
Exhibit 5	Petition For Inter Partes Review	52
Exhibit 6	Deposition of David Hilliard Williams	59
Exhibit 7	U.S. Patent No. 5,325,310	85
Exhibit 8	U.S. Patent No. 5,742,905	85
Exhibit 9	Declaration of Dr. Jaime G. Carbonell	105
Exhibit 10	Decision	125
Exhibit 11	Declaration of Jaime G. Carbonell, Ph.D.	151
Exhibit 12	US Patent Publication (Sheha, et al)	156
Exhibit 13	U.S. Patent No. 6,366,782	156
Exhibit 14	U.S. Patent No. 9,408,055	162
Exhibit 15	Petition For Inter Partes Review	162
Exhibit 16	US Patent Publication (Lazaridis, et al)	178

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

P R O C E E D I N G S

JAIME G. CARBONELL, Ph.D., a witness  
herein, having been first duly sworn, was  
examined and testified as follows:

EXAMINATION

BY MR. TUMINARO:

Q. Good morning, sir.

A. Good morning.

Q. Would you please state your full  
name for the record?

A. It is Jaime, J-A-I-M-E, middle  
initial G, last name Carbonell,  
C-A-R-B-O-N-E-L-L.

Q. Great. I understand you have been  
deposed before; is that right?

A. That's correct.

Q. Okay. I'm going to set a couple of  
ground rules for this deposition; is that fair?

A. If the attorneys don't object, yes.

Q. Okay. So I'm going to be asking you  
questions, as you know. So I'm going to need a  
verbal answer to my questions.

Do you understand that?

A. Yes.

Q. I'm going to try to ask clear

1 questions, but if at any time you don't  
2 understand one of my questions, will you let me  
3 know?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. If you answer one of my questions,  
6 I'm going to assume that you understood it; is  
7 that fair?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. So I'm going to take periodic breaks  
10 about once every hour, but if you need a break,  
11 just let me know. Okay.

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. The one thing I'll ask, though, is  
14 if there is a pending question, I ask that you  
15 answer the question before we take a break.

16 Okay?

17 A. Okay.

18 Q. Do you understand that you are  
19 testifying under oath here today?

20 A. Yes. This is what we just did.

21 Q. Is there any reason you can't do  
22 that?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Okay. What did you do to prepare  
25 for your deposition here today?

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.