

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

APOTEX INC. and APOTEX CORP.

Petitioner

v.

ALCON RESEARCH, LTD

Patent Owner

Patent No. 8,791,154

Issue Date: July 29, 2014

Title: HIGH CONCENTRATION OLOPATADINE  
OPHTHALMIC COMPOSITION

---

*Inter Partes* Review No. IPR2016-01640

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF U.S. PATENT NO. 7,791,154  
UNDER 35 U.S.C. §§ 311-319 AND 37 C.F.R. § 42.100 *ET SEQ.***

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I.	NOTICE OF LEAD AND BACKUP COUNSEL .....	1
II.	NOTICE OF SERVICE INFORMATION.....	1
III.	NOTICE OF EACH REAL-PARTY-IN-INTEREST.....	1
IV.	NOTICE OF RELATED MATTERS .....	1
V.	GROUNDS FOR STANDING.....	2
VI.	STATEMENT OF PRECISE RELIEF REQUESTED .....	2
VII.	THRESHOLD REQUIREMENT FOR <i>INTER PARTES</i> REVIEW.....	2
VIII.	STATEMENT OF REASONS FOR RELIEF REQUESTED .....	3
A.	Technical Introduction .....	3
1.	Background .....	3
2.	Alcon’s Olopatadine Evergreening Strategy.....	5
B.	The ’154 Patent .....	10
C.	Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	11
D.	Claim Construction Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b)(3) .....	13
1.	Claims 1, 4, 8, and 21 -- Preamble.....	14
2.	Claims 1, 4, 8, and 21 -- Construction of “solution comprising ... at least 0.67 w/v % olopatadine ... dissolved in the solution” .....	15
3.	Claims 1, 4, 8, 21, and 22 -- Construction of “w/v %” .....	16
E.	None of the Claims Are Entitled to the Priority Date of Provisional Application 61/487,789.....	16
F.	Claim-By-Claim Explanation of Grounds for Unpatentability.....	18
1.	Ground 1: Claims 1-4, 8, 12, 13, 21, and 22 are unpatentable under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) over Bhowmick, Yanni, and Castillo.....	18
a.	Claims 1-3.....	22
b.	Claims 4, 8, 21, and 22 .....	28
c.	Claims 12 and 13 .....	32

d. Claim Chart.....	33
2. Ground 2: Claims 1-4, 8, 12, 13, 21, and 22 are unpatentable under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) over Schneider in view of Hayakawa, Bhowmick, and Castillo.....	41
a. Claims 1-4, 8, 21, and 22.....	45
b. Claims 12 and 13 .....	49
c. Claim chart.....	50
G. Absence of Secondary Considerations.....	57
IX. CONCLUSION.....	59

**TABLE OF EXHIBITS**

<b>Ex #</b>	<b>Exhibit</b>
<b>1001</b>	U.S. Patent No. 8,791,154 B2 (“154 Patent”)
<b>1002</b>	Declaration of Dr. Erning Xia
<b>1003</b>	Declaration of Dr. Leonard Bielory
<b>1004</b>	WO 2008/015695 A2 (“Bhowmick”)
<b>1005</b>	YANNI <i>et al.</i> , “The <i>In Vitro</i> and <i>In Vivo</i> Ocular Pharmacology of Olopatadine (AL-4943A), an Effective Anti-Allergic/Antihistaminic Agent,” <i>Journal of Ocular Pharmacology and Therapeutics</i> , Volume 12, Number 4, 1996, pp. 389-400 (“Yanni”)
<b>1006</b>	U.S. Pat. No. 6,995,186 B2 (“Castillo”)
<b>1007</b>	U.S. Pat. Pub. No. 2011/0082145 A1 (“Schneider”)
<b>1008</b>	U.S. Pat. No. 5,641,805 B2 (“Hayakawa”)
<b>1009</b>	Image File Wrapper for U.S. Patent No. 8,791,154 B2
<b>1010</b>	Image File Wrapper for U.S. Provisional Appl. No. 61/487,789
<b>1011</b>	Image File Wrapper for U.S. Provisional Appl. No. 61/548,957
<b>1012</b>	WO 1999/018963 (“Lisi”)
<b>1013</b>	WO 2002/024116 A1 (“Shahinian”)
<b>1014</b>	LOFTSSON <i>et al.</i> , “Cyclodextrins in eye drop formulations: enhanced topical delivery of corticosteroids to the eye,” <i>Acta Ophthalmologica Scandinavica</i> , 2002, pp. 144-150.
<b>1015</b>	NANDI <i>et al.</i> , “Synergistic Effect of PEG-400 and Cyclodextrin to Enhance Solubility of Progesterone,” <i>AAPS PharmSciTech</i> 2003; 4 (1), pp 1-5.
<b>1016</b>	WO 2011/138801 A1 (“Khopade”)
<b>1017</b>	JANSOOK <i>et al.</i> , “CDs as solubilizers: Effects of excipients and competing drugs,” <i>International Journal of Pharmaceutics</i> , 379, 2009, pp. 32-40.
<b>1018</b>	HARADA, A., “Preparation and structures of supramolecules between cyclodextrins and polymers,” <i>Coordination Chemistry Reviews</i> , 148, 1996, pp. 115-133.

<b>1019</b>	WO 2012/159064A1 (“Gamache”)
<b>1020</b>	EP 0 799 044 B1 (“Yanni III”)
<b>1021</b>	WO 2001/054687 A1 (“Yanni II”)
<b>1022</b>	WO 2009/003199 A1 (“Pipkin”)
<b>1023</b>	WO 2000/78396 A2 (“Graff”)
<b>1024</b>	Curriculum Vitae for Dr. Erning Xia
<b>1025</b>	Curriculum Vitae for Dr. Leonard Bielory
<b>1026</b>	U.S. Pat. No. 7,687,646 B2 (“Bader”)
<b>1027</b>	U.S. Pat. No. 4,871,865 (“Lever”)
<b>1028</b>	U.S. Pat. No. 5,116,863 (“Oshima”)
<b>1029</b>	EP 0214779 B1 (“Lever”)
<b>1030</b>	Alcon Research, Ltd. v. Apotex Inc., 687 F.3d 1362 (Fed. Cir. 2012)
<b>1031</b>	Alcon Research, Ltd. v. Apotex Inc., 790 F. Supp. 2d 868 (S.D. Ind. 2011)
<b>1032</b>	EP 0 235 796 B2 (“Oshima”)
<b>1033</b>	ABELSON <i>et al.</i> , “Combined Analysis of Two Studies Using the Conjunctival Allergen Challenge Model to Evaluate Olopatadine Hydrochloride, a New Ophthalmic Antiallergic Agent With Dual Activity,” <i>American Journal of Ophthalmology</i> , Volume 126, No. 6, pp. 797-804.
<b>1034</b>	WO 2004/024126 A1 (“Thompson”)
<b>1035</b>	CHAUDHARI <i>et al.</i> , “Solubility enhancement of hydrophobic drugs using synergistically interacting cyclodextrins and cosolvent,” <i>Current Science</i> , 1586 Vol. 92, No. 11, 10 June 2007; pp. 1586-1591.
<b>1036</b>	ANSEL, Howard C., <i>Pharmaceutical Calculations</i> , 13 <sup>th</sup> Ed., Wolters Kluwer, 2010, pp. 82-83
<b>1037</b>	PATANOL® Label
<b>1038</b>	PATADAY® Label
<b>1039</b>	PATANASE® Label
<b>1040</b>	GENNARO, Alfonso R., <i>Remington: The Science and Practice of</i>

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.