

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

NICHIA CORPORATION AND  
EVERLIGHT ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,  
Petitioners,

v.

DOCUMENT SECURITY SYSTEMS, INC.,  
Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2018-00965<sup>1</sup>  
Patent 7,919,787

---

**PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE**

---

<sup>1</sup> Everlight Electronics Co., Ltd., who filed a petition in IPR2018-01260, has been joined as a petitioner in this proceeding.

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I. THE BOARD’S IMPROPER ADDITIONS TO THE PETITION’S ANALYSIS CONFIRM THAT THE PETITION WAS DEFICIENT IN EACH OF ITS CHALLENGES .....1

II. THE ’787 PATENT CLAIMS, *INTER ALIA*, A SPECIFIC ARRANGEMENT OF THE ANODE AND CATHODE ON A SEMICONDUCTOR DIE .....4

III. THE STATUTES AND REGULATIONS GOVERNING *INTER PARTES* REVIEW REQUIRE THAT THIS PROCEEDING BE DISMISSED .....8

IV. PETITIONERS FAIL TO ACCURATELY IDENTIFY THE SCOPE OF THE CLAIMS BEING CHALLENGED .....10

    A. Disputed Claims .....10

    B. Claim Construction .....19

V. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE NOT UNPATENTABLE OVER THE ASSERTED REFERENCES .....24

    A. Grounds 1-3 Fail Because Weeks, Wirth, and Negley Do Not Disclose Anodes/Cathodes On a Bottom Major Plane of an LED Die That is Also a Bottom Surface of the LED Die’s Substrate.....24

        1. Petitioners Acknowledge that Lumbarb Does Not Disclose or Suggest the Claimed Light Emitting Semiconductor Die.....24

        2. Weeks Fails to Remedy Lumbarb’s Shortcomings.....27

        3. Wirth Also Fails to Remedy Lumbarb’s Shortcomings.....33

        4. Negley Also Fails to Remedy Lumbarb’s Shortcomings .....36

    B. Grounds 4-6 Fail Because Ishidu and the Secondary References Do Not Disclose or Suggest the Claimed Light Emitting Semiconductor Die .....40

C. Grounds 7-9 Fail Because Ogawa and the Secondary References Do Not Disclose or Suggest the Claimed Light Emitting Semiconductor Die .....43

VI. CONCLUSION.....46

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### Cases

<i>Innova/Pure Water, Inc. v. Safari Water Filtration Systems, Inc.</i> , 381 F.3d 1111 (Fed. Cir. 2004) .....	20
<i>SAS Institute Inc. v. Iancu</i> , 138 S. Ct. 1348 (2018).....	2, 3, 8, 29
<i>Sirona Dental Sys. GmbH v. Institut Straumann AG</i> , 892 F.3d 1349 (Fed. Cir. 2018) .....	2, 29

### Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 154(a)(2).....	19
35 U.S.C. § 314(a) .....	8, 10
35 U.S.C. § 316.....	8, 9, 10
35 U.S.C. § 316(e) .....	3
35 U.S.C. § 318(a) .....	10

### Rules

37 C.F.R. § 42 .....	8, 10
37 C.F.R. § 42.100(b) .....	19
37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b) .....	29
37 C.F.R. § 42.107 .....	1
37 C.F.R. § 42.108(c).....	8

### Other Authorities

Office Patent Trial Practice Guide, 77 Fed. Reg. 48679 (Aug. 14, 2012).....	8, 9
---	------

**PATENT OWNER'S LIST OF EXHIBITS**

Exhibit Number	Exhibit Description
2001-2007	Reserved
2008	Deposition Transcript of Dr. James R. Shealy
2009-2199	Reserved
2200-2202	<i>Expunged</i>

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.