

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

UNIFIED PATENTS INC.  
Petitioner

v.

BRADIUM TECHNOLOGIES LLC  
Patent Owner

---

IPR2018-00952  
U.S. Patent 9,253,239

---

**PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER  
RESPONSE**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I. INTRODUCTION ..... 1

II. UNIFIED IS THE SOLE REAL PARTY-IN-INTEREST ..... 1

    A. Legal Standard ..... 2

    B. Unified Solely Directed, Funded, and Controlled this IPR ..... 4

    C. None of the Problematic Circumstances in *AIT* Are Present..... 6

    D. Bradium’s Generic Evidence Is Insufficient..... 12

III. THE BOARD SHOULD NOT EXERCISE ITS DISCRETION TO  
TERMINATE THE IPR..... 12

IV. THE BOARD HAS CONSTITUTIONAL POWER TO DECIDE THIS IPR  
PROCEEDING ..... 13

V. CLAIM 20 OF THE ’239 PATENT IS INVALID ..... 14

    A. Claim Construction ..... 14

        1. “a step for determining priority of the first request and the  
        second request” ..... 14

        2. “user-controlled image viewpoint” ..... 17

    B. The Combination of Reddy, Hornbacker, and Rosasco Renders  
    Obvious the “Determining Priority” Limitation ..... 18

        1. The Prior Art References Render Obvious Determining  
        Priority of the First Request and the Second Request..... 18

        2. The Prior Art References Render Obvious Determining  
        Priority Between the First Request and the Second Request ..  
        ..... 20

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

**Cases**

*Adobe Inc. v. RAH Color Tech. LLC*, IPR2019-00627, Paper 15 (PTAB Apr. 25, 2019) ..... 10

*Applications in Internet Time, LLC v. RPX Corp.*, 897 F.3d 1336 (Fed. Cir. 2018) .....passim

*Liebel-Flarsheim Co. v. Medrad Inc.*, 358 F.3d 898 (Fed. Cir. 2004) ..... 15, 16

*Medronic, Inc. v. Robert Bosch Healthcare Sys., Inc.*, IPR2014-00488, Paper 61 (PTAB May 22, 2015) ..... 13

*Medtronic, Inc. v. Robert Bosch Healthcare Sys., Inc.*, 839 F.3d 1382 (Fed. Cir. 2016) ..... 12, 13

*Microsoft Corp. v. Bradium Tech. LLC*, IPR2016-01897, Paper 17 (PTAB Apr. 5, 2017) ..... 6

*Phillips v. AWH Corp.*, 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005) (en banc)..... 14, 15, 16

*Riggin v. Off. of Senate Fair Emp. Prac.*, 61 F.3d 1563 (Fed. Cir. 1995) ..... 14

*Square, Inc. v. Unwired Planet LLC*, IPR2014-01165, Paper 32, 25 (PTAB Oct. 30, 2015) ..... 14

*Superguide Corp. v. DirecTV Enterprises, Inc.*, 358 F.3d 870 (Fed. Cir. 2004).....  
..... 15, 16

*Unified Patent Inc. v. Barkan Wireless IP Holdings, L.P.*, IPR2018-01186, Paper 27 (PTAB Jan. 8, 2019) .....4

*Unified Patent Inc. v. Fall Line Patents, LLC*, IPR2018-00043, Paper 34 (PTAB Apr. 4, 2019) .....4

*Unified Patents Inc. v. MOAEC Techs., LLC*, IPR2018-01758, Paper 12 (PTAB April 17, 2019)..... 14

*Unified Patents, Inc. v. Realtime Adaptive*, IPR2018-00883, Paper 36, 19 (PTAB Oct. 11, 2018) .....passim

*Unified Patents Inc. v. Uniloc 2017 LLC*, IPR2017-02148, Paper 82 (PTAB Apr. 11, 2019) .....4, 10, 11

*Unified Patents Inc. v. Universal Secure Registry LLC*, IPR2018-00067, Ex. 1045 (public version of Paper 54) (PTAB May 1, 2019) .....4

*Ventex Co. v. Columbia Sportswear N. Am., Inc.*, IPR2017-00651, Paper 152 (PTAB Jan. 24, 2019) (precedential).....3, 4, 10

*Worlds Inc. v. Bungie, Inc.*, 903 F.3d 1237 (Fed. Cir. 2018).....2

**Statutes**

35 U.S.C. § 312(a)(2) ..... 11, 12

35 U.S.C. § 314(a)..... 12

35 U.S.C. § 315(b) .....9

35 U.S.C. § 325(b) .....9, 12

37 C.F.R. § 42.71(d).....13

**Other Authorities**

Trial Practice Guide, 77 Fed. Reg. 48756 (Aug. 14, 2012) .....2, 13

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.