

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,
Patent Owner.

IPR2018-00935
U.S. Patent No. 8,991,677

PATENT OWNER ETHICON LLC'S SUR-REPLY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	2
A. The “Operably Disconnected” Limitation Does Not Simply Mean “Disconnected”	3
B. Ethicon Properly Construed The “Selectively Receive” Terms	5
1. Petitioner’s Interpretation Disregards That The Claims Require A DLU That Includes A Motor Configured To Receive Power From A Power Source	6
2. The Specification Supports Ethicon’s Construction.....	9
3. Ethicon Is Not Limiting The Claims To An Embodiment Where The Motor And Power Source Are In The Same Housing	13
III. THE HOOVEN/HEINRICH COMBINATION DOES NOT DISCLOSE THE POWER LIMITATIONS	15
A. Hooven/Heinrich Do Not Disclose The “Operably Disconnected” Limitation of Claims 6/17.....	15
B. Hooven/Heinrich Do Not Disclose The “Selectively Receive” Limitation of Claims 1/16	16
IV. PETITIONER FAILS TO IDENTIFY ANY PERMISSIBLE MOTIVATIONS TO COMBINE HOOVEN AND HEINRICH.....	18
A. Heinrich Teaches Away From Combination With Hooven.....	19
B. Petitioner’s Sole Surviving Motivation To Combine Is Based On Impermissible Hindsight	22

V. PETITIONER OFFERS NO REASONABLE EXPECTATION OF
SUCCESS IN THE COMBINATION23

VI. DR. FISCHER HAS CONSISTENTLY FAILED TO ADDRESS
CORE FUNDAMENTAL CONCEPTS24

VII. CONCLUSION.....26

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>ATD Corp. v. Lydall, Inc.</i> , 159 F.3d 534 (Fed. Cir. 1998)	23
<i>PharmaStem Therapeutics, Inc. v. ViaCell, Inc.</i> , 491 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2007)	25

EXHIBIT LIST FOR IPR2018-00935

Ethicon Exhibit #	Description
Ex. 2001	U.S. Patent No. 5,964,394 (“Robertson”)
Ex. 2002	U.S. Patent No. 6,231,565 (“Tovey”)
Ex. 2003	Excerpts from Technology Tutorial filed in <i>Ethicon LLC, et al. v. Intuitive Surgical, Inc., et al.</i> , C.A. No. 17-871 (LPS)(CJB) (District of Delaware).
Ex. 2004	Statutory Disclaimer
Ex. 2005	Excerpts from the File History of U.S. Patent No. 8,991,677
Ex. 2006	Declaration of Dr. William Cimino
Ex. 2007	Deposition of Gregory Fischer, Ph.D., Volume 1 (February 18, 2019)
Ex. 2008	Deposition of Gregory Fischer, Ph.D., Volume 2 (February 20, 2019)
Ex. 2009	U.S. Pat. Appl. Pub. 2014/0252071 A1 (application publication of U.S. Appl. No. 14,283,729) (“the 729 Application”)
Ex. 2010	U.S. Pat. App. Pub. 2009/0206136 A1 (application publication of U.S. Appl. No. 12/031,628) (“the 628 Application”)
Ex. 2011	Reserved
Ex. 2012	Robert Glasgow et al., <i>The Benefits of a Dedicated Minimally Invasive Surgery Program to Academic General Surgery Practice</i> , <i>Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery</i> , 869-73 (Nov. 2004)
Ex. 2013	Reserved
Ex. 2014	Supplemental Declaration of Dr. William Cimino

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.