

**UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

---

**BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

---

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,  
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,  
Patent Owner.

---

IPR2018-00935  
U.S. Patent No. 8,991,677

---

**PATENT OWNER ETHICON LLC'S RESPONSE**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. BACKGROUND .....	5
A. Overview of the 677 Patent.....	5
B. Overview of Challenged Independent Claims 1, 6, 16 and 17 .....	13
III. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....	15
A. “stapling sub-system comprising: ... an electric motor ... wherein said electric motor is operably disconnected from a power source when said housing is not attached to the surgical instrument system, and wherein said electric motor is operably connected to the power source when said housing is attached to the surgical instrument system” (Claims 6, 17) .....	16
1. The Claim Language Confirms That This Limitation Requires That The Stapling Sub-System’s Electric Motor Is Attached To A Power Source Independent Of The Connection Between The Stapling Sub-System Housing And The Surgical Instrument System.....	18
2. The Specification Confirms That This Limitation Requires That The Stapling Sub-System’s Electric Motor Is Attached To A Power Source Independent Of The Connection Between The Stapling Sub-System Housing And The Surgical Instrument System.....	20
3. Petitioner’s Analysis Vitiates This Claim Limitation.....	25
B. “[disposable] loading unit comprising: ... a motor ... wherein said motor is configured to receive power from a power source such that said motor can only selectively receive power from said power source when said means for removably attaching said housing to the surgical instrument is operably coupled to the surgical instrument” (Claims 1, 16) .....	26

1.	The Claim Language Confirms That This Limitation Requires That The Electric Motor Is Attached To A Power Source And Configured Such That The Transfer Of Power To The Motor Is Prevented When The DLU Is Detached From The Surgical Instrument.....	28
2.	The Specification Confirms That This Limitation Requires That The Electric Motor Is Attached To A Power Source And Configured Such That The Transfer Of Power To The Motor Is Prevented When The DLU Is Detached From The Surgical Instrument.....	31
3.	Petitioner’s Analysis Vitiates This Claim Limitation.....	33
IV.	THE PRIOR ART.....	35
A.	Hooven .....	35
B.	Heinrich .....	41
C.	Milliman .....	46
V.	INTUITIVE DID NOT CARRY ITS BURDEN OF DEMONSTRATING THAT THE COMBINATION OF HOOVEN AND HEINRICH RENDERS OBVIOUS EVERY ELEMENT OF THE INDEPENDENT CLAIMS OF THE 677 PATENT .....	48
A.	Hooven In View Of Heinrich Does Not Disclose The Key Inventive Power Limitations Of Independent Claims 1, 6, 16, and 17 .....	48
1.	Claims 6 and 17: Hooven in view of Heinrich does not disclose a motor that is “operably connected” and “operably disconnected” from an attached power source.....	49
2.	Claims 1 and 16: Hooven in view of Heinrich does not disclose a motor configured to only selectively receive power from an attached power source .....	56

B.	Petitioner Does Not Establish a Motivation to Combine Hooven with Heinrich or Milliman.....	62
1.	Heinrich and Milliman Discourage a Combination With Hooven .....	64
2.	Petitioner Relies On Impermissible Hindsight To Combine Hooven And Heinrich .....	65
3.	A POSITA would not have a reasonable expectation of success in combining Hooven and Heinrich.....	67
C.	Dr. Fischer’s Testimony Is Entitled To Little Weight .....	69
VI.	CONCLUSION.....	72

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

	<b>Page(s)</b>
<b>Cases</b>	
<i>Arctic Cat Inc. v. Bombardier Recreational Prod. Inc.</i> , 876 F.3d 1350 (Fed. Cir. 2017) .....	4
<i>ATD Corp. v. Lydall, Inc.</i> , 159 F.3d 534 (Fed. Cir. 1998) .....	63
<i>Carlson v. Bioremedi Therapeutic Sys.</i> , 822 F.3d 194 (5th Cir. 2016) .....	71
<i>In re Chu</i> , 66 F.3d 292 (Fed. Cir. 1995) .....	66
<i>Compass Bank v. Intellectual Ventures II</i> , IPR2014-00786, Paper 46.....	67
<i>Corning Incorp., v. DSM IP Assets</i> , IPR2013-00050, Paper 77 .....	67
<i>Dell Inc. v. Accelaron, LLC</i> , 818 F.3d 1293 (Fed. Cir. 2016) .....	18, 31, 34
<i>Graham v. John Deere Co. of Kansas City</i> , 383 U.S. 1 (1966).....	3
<i>Honeywell Int’l Inc. v. Mexichem Amanco Holding S.A. De C.V.</i> , 865 F.3d 1348 (Fed. Cir. 2017) .....	8
<i>Kinetic Concepts, Inc. v. Smith &amp; Nephew, Inc.</i> , 688 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2012) .....	63, 64
<i>KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	3
<i>Kumho Tire Co. v. Carmichael</i> , 526 U.S. 137 (1999).....	71

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.