

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,
Patent Owner.

IPR2018-00934
U.S. Patent No. 8,998,058

**PATENT OWNER ETHICON LLC'S
PRELIMINARY RESPONSE**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. BACKGROUND.....	4
A. Overview Of The 058 Patent.....	4
B. Prosecution History.....	8
C. Statutory Disclaimer Of Claims 11-18.....	9
CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	10
A. “Means for removably attaching said housing to the surgical instrument” (claim 1).....	10
III. THE PRIOR ART.....	11
A. Hooven.....	11
B. Heinrich.....	13
IV. REASONS WHY THE PETITION SHOULD BE DENIED.....	20
A. Hooven In View Of Heinrich Does Not Disclose The Claimed Motor Configured To Receive Power From A Power Source.....	20
B. Petitioner Does Not Establish A Motivation To Combine Or Reasonable Expectation Of Success.....	23
1. Petitioner provides no explanation for how to combine the incompatible systems of Hooven and Heinrich.	24
2. Petitioner offers no showing of a reasonable expectation of success.....	27
3. Petitioner relies solely on impermissible hindsight.....	27
V. CONCLUSION.....	30

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Arctic Cat Inc. v. Bombardier Recreational Prod. Inc.</i> , 876 F.3d 1350 (Fed. Cir. 2017).....	27
<i>Compass Bank v. Intellectual Ventures II</i> , IPR2014-00786, Paper 46.....	26, 29
<i>Corning Incorp. v. DSM IP Assets</i> , IPR2013-00050, Paper 77.....	26, 29
<i>Graham v. John Deere Co. of Kansas City</i> , 383 U.S. 1 (1966).....	3
<i>Honeywell Int’l Inc. v. Mexichem Amanco Holding S.A. De C.V.</i> , 865 F.3d 1348 (Fed. Cir. 2017).....	23
<i>Institut Pasteur v. Focarino</i> , 738 F.3d 1337 (Fed. Cir. 2013).....	27
<i>Kinetic Concepts, Inc. v. Smith & Nephew, Inc.</i> 688 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2012).....	20, 23
<i>KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	3, 28
<i>In re Laskowski</i> , 871 F.2d 115 (Fed. Cir. 1989).....	3, 28
<i>Microsoft Corp. v. Multi-Tech Sys., Inc.</i> , 357 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2004).....	10
<i>Total Containment, Inc. v. Intelpro Corp.</i> , 217 F.3d 852 (Fed. Cir. 1999).....	3, 28
<i>In re Translogic Tech. Inc.</i> , 504 F.3d 1249 (Fed. Cir. 2007).....	10

Vectra Fitness, Inc. v. TNWK Corp.,
162 F.3d 1379 (Fed. Cir. 1998)9

Vivid Techs., Inc. v. Am. Sci. & Eng'g, Inc.,
200 F.3d 795 (Fed. Cir. 1999)10

Statutes

35 U.S.C. § 253(a)9

Other Authorities

37 C.F.R. § 1.321(a)9

37 C.F.R. § 42.24(a)31

37 C.F.R. § 42.24(d)31

37 C.F.R. § 42.100(b)10

37 C.F.R. § 42.107(e).....9

77 Fed. Reg. 48,756, 48,766 (Aug. 14, 2012).....10

EXHIBIT LIST

Ethicon Exhibit #	Description
Ex. 2001	U.S. Patent No. 5,964,394 (“Robertson”)
Ex. 2002	U.S. Patent No. 6,231,565 (“Tovey”)
Ex. 2003	Excerpts from Technology Tutorial filed in <i>Ethicon LLC, et al. v. Intuitive Surgical, Inc., et al.</i> , C.A. No. 17-871 (LPS)(CJB) (District of Delaware).
Ex. 2004	Statutory Disclaimer

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.