

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,
Patent Owner.

IPR2018-00934
U.S. Patent No. 8,998,058

PATENT OWNER ETHICON LLC'S SUR-REPLY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	2
A. Petitioner’s Interpretation Disregards That The Claims Require A <i>Stapling System / DLU</i> That Includes A Motor Configured To Receive Power From A Power Source	3
B. The Specification Supports Patent Owner’s Construction.....	7
C. Patent Owner is Not Limiting the Claims to an Embodiment Where the Motor and Power Source are in the Same Housing.....	11
III. THE COMBINATION OF HOOVEN AND HEINRICH DOES NOT DISCLOSE THE POWER LIMITATIONS	14
IV. PETITIONER FAILS TO IDENTIFY ANY PERMISSIBLE MOTIVATIONS TO COMBINE HOOVEN AND HEINRICH.....	16
A. Heinrich Teaches Away From Combination With Hooven.....	17
B. Petitioner’s Sole Surviving Motivation To Combine Is Based On Impermissible Hindsight	21
V. PETITIONER OFFERS NO REASONABLE EXPECTATION OF SUCCESS IN THE COMBINATION	22
VI. DR. FISCHER HAS CONSISTENTLY FAILED TO ADDRESS CORE FUNDAMENTAL CONCEPTS	23
VII. CONCLUSION.....	26

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

ATD Corp. v. Lydall, Inc.,
159 F.3d 534 (Fed. Cir. 1998)22

PharmaStem Therapeutics, Inc. v. ViaCell, Inc.,
491 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2007)25

EXHIBIT LIST FOR IPR2018-00934

Ethicon Exhibit #	Description
Ex. 2001	U.S. Patent No. 5,964,394 (“Robertson”)
Ex. 2002	U.S. Patent No. 6,231,565 (“Tovey”)
Ex. 2003	Excerpts from Technology Tutorial filed in <i>Ethicon LLC, et al. v. Intuitive Surgical, Inc., et al.</i> , C.A. No. 17-871 (LPS)(CJB) (District of Delaware).
Ex. 2004	Statutory Disclaimer
Ex. 2005	Reserved
Ex. 2006	Declaration of Dr. William Cimino
Ex. 2007	Deposition of Gregory Fischer, Ph.D., Volume 1 (February 18, 2019)
Ex. 2008	Deposition of Gregory Fischer, Ph.D., Volume 2 (February 20, 2019)
Ex. 2009	Reserved
Ex. 2010	U.S. Pat. App. Pub. 2009/0206136 A1 (application publication of U.S. Appl. No. 12/031,628) (“the 628 Application”)
Ex. 2011	Reserved
Ex. 2012	Robert Glasgow et al., <i>The Benefits of a Dedicated Minimally Invasive Surgery Program to Academic General Surgery Practice</i> , Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery, 869-73 (Nov. 2004)
Ex. 2013	U.S. Patent Application No. 2014/0252067 A1 (application publication of U.S. Appl. No. 14/282,494 (“the 494 Application”))
Ex. 2014	Supplemental Declaration of Dr. William Cimino

Ethicon Exhibit #	Description
Ex. 2015	Excerpts of American Heritage College Dictionary 3d (1993)
Ex. 2016	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Gregory Fischer (July 11, 2019)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.