



UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

In re: OXYCONTIN ANTITRUST LITIGATION

04-Md-1603 (SHS)

PURDUE PHARMA L.P.,
THE P.F. LABORATORIES, INC., and
PURDUE PHARMACEUTICALS L.P.,

Plaintiffs,

13-Cv-3372 (SHS)

-against-

AMNEAL PHARMACEUTICALS, LLC,

Defendant.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS v

PART 1. INTRODUCTION 1

I. THE RECORD AND RELEVANT PROCEEDINGS..... 1

 A. The '888 Patent and Asserted Claims..... 1

 B. The 2013 Teva Trial..... 2

 C. Claim Construction..... 2

 D. The 2014 Trial..... 3

 E. This Opinion 4

II. LEGAL STANDARDS..... 4

 A. Procedural Context and the Hatch-Waxman Act..... 4

 B. Claim Construction..... 6

 C. Claims of Patent Infringement 7

 D. The Affirmative Defense of Patent Invalidity 8

 1. Novelty and Anticipation 8

 2. Obviousness and Nonobviousness 9

 3. Definiteness..... 11

 E. Attorney's Fees 12

PART 2. FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW..... 13

I. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION..... 13

 A. Method of Testing Viscosity 14

 1. The Viscosity Test Is Not Limited to Zero Shear Viscosity and Includes, at a Minimum, Shear Rates Ranging from .01 to 100 Reciprocal Seconds. 15

 2. Tampering Temperature Is Not Limited to 25° C. and Includes Temperatures Above 45° C. 19

3. Testing Temperature Is Not Limited to 25° C. but Does Not Extend to Temperatures at or Near Boiling.....	20
4. The viscosity test is conducted after a visual inspection confirms that the soluble components of the dosage form have dissolved, although insoluble particles may remain.	23
B. The Gelling Agent as a Whole May Confer the Requisite Viscosity....	24
II. FACTUAL BACKGROUND: ABUSE OF OXYCONTIN AND PURDUE’S RESPONSE .	28
III. INFRINGEMENT	31
A. Findings of Fact	31
1. Amneal’s tablets meet the limitations of claim 1 because its gelling agents impart a viscosity of at least 10 cP.....	32
2. Amneal’s tablets meet the limitations of claim 5 because they attain a viscosity of at least about 10 cP when dissolved in water.....	33
3. Amneal’s tablets meet the limitations of claim 7 because they obtain a viscosity of at least about 60 cP.....	34
4. Amneal’s tablets meet the limitations of claim 23 because they achieve the requisite viscosity when crushed and dissolved in water....	34
5. Amneal’s tablets meet the limitations of claim 24 because they obtain the requisite viscosity when dissolved in water heated above 45° C.	35
B. Conclusions of Law.....	36
IV. INVALIDITY	36
A. Novelty Pursuant to 35 U.S.C. § 102.....	36
1. Findings of Fact	36
a) The ‘963 Patent does not disclose all the limitations of the ‘888 Patent.	36
b) The ‘591 Application does not disclose all limitations of the asserted claims of the ‘888 Patent.	38
2. Conclusions of Law	40

B.	Obviousness Pursuant to 35 U.S.C. § 103	40
1.	Findings of Fact.....	40
a)	Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	40
b)	Scope and Content of the Prior Art.....	41
(1)	The prior art teaches that gelling agents reduce abuse potential.....	41
(2)	The prior art teaches that PEO functions as both a rate controlling agent and a gelling agent.....	43
c)	Differences Between the '888 Patent and the Prior Art.....	44
(1)	The '888 Patent differs from the prior art by claiming oxycodone and requiring a quantitative level of viscosity.	44
(2)	The '888 Patent does not represent a departure from the prior art in other significant ways.	45
d)	Objective Indicia of Nonobviousness	47
(1)	There is insufficient evidence of the '888 Patent's commercial success.	47
(2)	Amneal's alleged copying of the invention is not an indication of nonobviousness.	50
(3)	The '888 Patent did not fulfill a long-felt but unmet need.....	50
(4)	Although Purdue received some acclaim for its invention, persons of skill in the art were not skeptical that the '888 Patent would work.....	51
2.	Conclusions of Law	51
a)	It would have been obvious to respond to the oxycodone abuse crisis by creating a controlled release dosage form that utilizes PEO as a gelling and rate control agent.....	51
b)	The remaining features of the claimed invention are obvious....	54
c)	All asserted claims of the '888 Patent are invalid as obvious.....	54
C.	Indefiniteness Pursuant to 35 U.S.C. § 112.....	55
1.	Findings of Fact.....	55
a)	Shear Rate	55

(1) Shear rate determines whether some accused products meet claim 5's 60 cP viscosity limitation.....	55
(2) Specifying shear rate is standard practice among ordinarily skilled artisans.....	56
b) Tampering and Testing Temperature.....	57
c) Extent of Dissolution.....	60
2. Conclusions of Law	61
PART 3. CONCLUSION AND RELIEF.....	63

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.