

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

WATERS TECHNOLOGIES CORPORATION
Petitioner

v.

BIOMEDICAL DEVICE CONSULTANTS & LABORATORIES
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2018-00498
US Patent 9,186,224

PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF US PATENT NO. 9,186,224

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. CLAIMED PRIORITY DATE AND PRIOR ART	2
III. RELIEF REQUESTED	3
IV. GROUNDS FOR STANDING	3
V. OVERVIEW OF THE ‘224 PATENT	4
A. The challenged patent.....	4
B. The prosecution history of the ‘224 Patent	6
VI. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	10
A. “accelerated”	11
B. “excess volume area”	13
VII. THE SCOPE AND THE CONTENT OF THE PRIOR ART	16
A. It was known to use compliance chambers in accelerated test systems	16
B. Pickard describes the claimed method—and is not limited to any specific bpm value or range.....	19
C. Woodward evidences normal physiological heart rates of up to 270 beats per minute.....	22
D. St. Jude describes methods of operating an accelerated cyclic test system with a compliance chamber or fluid reservoir located downstream of a heart valve.....	23
VIII. THE PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	26
IX. DETAILED EXPLANATION OF GROUNDS FOR UNPATENTABILITY.....	27

A.	Ground 1a: All Claims are Rendered Obvious by Pickard in light of Woodward.....	27
B.	Ground 1b: All Claims are Rendered Obvious by Pickard in light of Woodward and St. Jude	46
C.	Ground 2a: St. Jude Anticipates Claims 1-4	50
D.	Ground 2b: Claims 3-7 are Rendered Obvious by St. Jude in light of Pickard	61
E.	Ground 2c: Claims 6 and 7 are Rendered Obvious by St. Jude in light of Iwasaki.....	66
X.	CONCLUSION	70
XI.	MANDATORY NOTICES.....	71
	Notice of Real Party-In-Interest	71
	Notice of Related Matters.....	71
	Notice of Lead and Backup Counsel and Service Information.....	72
XII.	PAYMENT OF FEES.....	73

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

	<u>Page(s)</u>
<i>Biomedical Device Consultants & Laboratories of Colorado, LLC v. TA Instruments – Waters LLC</i> , 0:17-cv-03403-DWF-SER (D.Minn.)	71
<i>DyStar Textilfarben GmbH & Co. Deutschland KG v. C.H. Patrick Co.</i> , 464 F.3d 1356, 1368, 80 USPQ2d 1641, 1651 (Fed. Cir. 2006)	49
<i>In re Smith Int’l, Inc.</i> , No. 2016-2303, slip op. at 12 (Fed. Cir. Sept. 26, 2017)	10
<i>KSR International Co. v. Teleflex Inc. (KSR)</i> , 550 U.S. 398, 417 (2007)	63
<i>Microsoft Corp. v. Proxyconn, Inc.</i> , 789 F.3d 1292, 1298 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	10

STATUTES AND RULES

35 USC 102	3, 57
35 USC 103	3, 38
37 CFR § 42.100(b)	10
37 CFR § 42.15(a)	73
MPEP 2143(G)	49

LIST OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit No.	Short Name	Description
1001	'224 Patent	US Patent No. 9,186,224 to McCloskey <i>et al.</i>
1002	Original Application	USSN 14/523,104, filed on October 24, 2014
1003	Billiar	Declaration of Prof. Billiar
1004		Curriculum Vitae of Prof. Billiar
1005	Office Action	Office Action mailed March 20, 2015
1006	Interview	Interview Summary mailed May 14, 2015
1007	Response	Amendment & Response Mailed June 17, 2015
1008	Allowance	Notice of Allowance mailed September 17, 2015
1009	Inventor Declaration	Inventor Declaration dated May 10, 2013 (and filed with Response Mailed June 15, 2015)
1010	Pickard	US Patent No. 4,682,491 to Pickard
1011	St. Jude	US Patent No. 5,916,800 to Elizondo <i>et al.</i> and assigned to St. Jude [<i>sic</i>] Medical, Inc.
1012	Woodward	US Patent No. 3,208,448 to Woodward
1013	Iwasaki	Iwasaki <i>et al.</i> , <i>Implications for the Establishment of Accelerated Fatigue Test Protocols for Prosthetic Heart Valves</i> , <i>Artificial Organs</i> Vol. 26 No. 5:420-429 (2002).
1014	Reul	Reul <i>et al.</i> , <i>Durability/Wear Testing of Heart Valve Substitutes</i> , <i>J Heart Valve Dis</i> Vol. 7, No. 2: 151-157 (March 1998).

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.