UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ARGENTUM PHARMACEUTICALS LLC
Petitioner

v.

MERCK PATENTGESELLSCHAFT
Patent Owner

Patent No. 8,673,921
Issue Date: March 18, 2014
Title: POLYMORPHIC FORMS OF 1-[4-(5-CYANOINDOL-3-YL)BUTYL]-4-(2-CARBAMOYLBENZOFURAN-5-YL) PIPERAZINE HYDROCHLORIDE

Inter Partes Review No.: Unassigned

DECLARATION OF DR. ROBIN D. ROGERS, PH.D.

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction 1
II. My Background and Qualifications 1
III. Materials Reviewed 8
IV. Legal Principles 8
A. Anticipation 8
B. Obviousness 9
V. Summary of Opinions 10
VI. Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art 11
VII. The '921 Patent 12
VIII. Claim Construction 17
IX. Technical Background 19
A. What is a crystal? 19
B. Characterizing crystals 25
C. Identifying Crystals 28
D. Crystallization Techniques 33
X. State of the Prior Art 35
A. U.S. Patent No. 5,532,241 ('241 Patent) (Ex. 1004) 35
B. Bartoszyk (Ex. 1005) 37
C. Brittain (Ex. 1010) 39
D. Byrn, 2nd Edition (Ex. 1012) 43
E. Gould (Ex. 1011) 44
F. Lieberman (Ex. 1013) 45
G. Vippagunta (Ex. 1027) 46
H. Hancock (Ex. 1028) 49
I. Beckmann (Ex. 1029) 50
J. Zinnes (Ex. 1030) 51
K. Armarego (Ex. 1031) 51
L. Pavia (Ex. 1032) 52

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

XI. Ground 1: Claims 1, 14, and 15 Are Anticipated by the '241 Patent As Characterized by Patent Owner Admissions 52
A. Claim 1 52
B. Claim 14 57
C. Claim 15 59
XII. Ground 2: Claims 1, 14, and 15 are Obvious over the '241 Patent as Characterized by Patent Owner Admission and Bartoszyk 59
A. Claim 1 60
B. Claim 14 64
C. Claim 15 68
XIII. Ground 3: Claims 1 and 11 are Obvious over the '241 Patent as Characterized by Patent Owner Admissions, Byrn, and Pavia 70
A. Why the Test or Data is Being Used 70
B. Comparing the Designed Experiments with Example 4 of the '241 patent and the Patent Owner Admissions of the '921 patent 71
C. How the Tests Were Performed and the Data Was Generated 74
1. First Experiment 74
2. Second Experiment 77
3. Third Experiment 80
4. Fourth Experiment 80
5. Fifth Experiment 81
D. How the Data was Used to Determine a Value 82
1. Data Generated from the First Experiment 86
2. Data Generated from the Second Experiment 92
3. Data Generated from the Third Experiment 103
4. Data Generated from the Fourth Experiment 105
5. Data Generated from the Fifth Experiment 107
E. Claims 1 and 11 are Obvious in view of the 241 Patent as characterized by Patent Owner Admissions, Byrn, and Pavia 110
1. Claim 11 110
2. Claim 1 130

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

XIV. Ground 4: Claims 1, 12 14, and 15 are Obvious over the '241 Patent as Characterized by Patent Owner Admissions, Bartoszyk, Byrn, and Pavia .. 132
1. Claim 12 132
2. Claim 1 135
3. Claim 14 137
4. Claim 15 141
XV. No Objective Evidence Supporting Non-Obviousness 144
XVI. Conclusion 145

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

I, Robin Rogers, do declare as follows:

I. Introduction

1. I am over the age of eighteen (18) and otherwise competent to make this declaration.

2. I have been retained as an expert witness on behalf of Argentum Pharmaceuticals LLC for an *inter partes* review ("IPR") for U.S. Patent No. 8,673,921 ("'921 patent") (Ex. 1001). I am being compensated for my time in connection with this IPR at my standard consulting rate, which is $700 per hour. I understand that my declaration accompanies a petition for *inter partes* review involving the above-mentioned U.S. Patent.

II. My Background and Qualifications

1. I am currently a Research Professor at The University of Alabama, Tuscaloosa, AL USA and an Adjunct Professor at McGill University, Montreal, Quebec, Canada. Formerly, I was Canadian Excellence Research Chair in Green Chemistry and Green Chemicals at McGill University (2015-2017) and Distinguished Research Professor, Robert Ramsay Chair of Chemistry, and the Director of the Center for Green Manufacturing at the University of Alabama (1996-2015). I am also Honorary Professor in the Institute for Process Engineering at The Chinese Academy of Sciences in Beijing, China. In addition to my academic

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.