

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.

Petitioner

v.

UNILOC LUXEMBOURG S. A.¹

Patent Owner

IPR2018-00394

PATENT 6,622,018

PATENT OWNER RESPONSE TO PETITION

PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. §42.120

¹ The owner of this patent is Uniloc 2017 LLC.

Table of Contents

I.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
II.	THE '018 PATENT	1
III.	RELATED PROCEEDINGS	3
IV.	PETITIONER DOES NOT PROVE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF UNPATENTABILITY FOR ANY CHALLENGED CLAIM	4
	A. Level of ordinary skill in the art	5
	B. Claim construction	5
	C. No proof of obviousness for “broadcasting a message, said message for locating remote devices within range of said transceiver”	8
	D. The Petition fails to prove sufficient motivation to combine the cited portions of the <i>Ben-Ze’ev</i> and <i>Idiot’s</i> <i>Guide</i> references as proposed	12
	1. The Petition’s reliance on “PalmRemote” lacks the required analysis or explanation of how or why it would have been obvious to combine the cited of the <i>Ben-Ze’ev</i> and <i>Idiot’s Guide</i> references as proposed.....	13
	2. The <i>Idiot’s Guide</i> does not support making the proposed combination by a POSITA	17
	3. Petitioner impermissibly relies upon mere speculation	21
V.	CONCLUSION.....	22

List of Exhibits

Exhibit No.	Description
2001	Declaration of William C. Easttom (previously filed)

I. INTRODUCTION

Uniloc 2017 LLC (“Uniloc” or “Patent Owner”) submits this Response to Petition IPR2018-00394 for *Inter Partes* Review (“Pet.” or “Petition”) of United States Patent No. 6,622,018 (“the ’018 patent” or “EX1001”) filed by Apple, Inc. (“Petitioner”). The instant Petition is defective for at least the reasons set forth herein.

II. THE ’018 PATENT

The ’018 patent is titled “Portable Device Control Console With Wireless Connection.” The ’018 patent issued August 15, 2006, from U.S. Patent Application No. 09/727,727 filed September 16, 2003 and originally assigned to 3Com Corporation (3Com).

The inventors of the ’018 patent observed that remote control devices at the time had a number of shortcomings. For example, a separate remote control device may be required for each device to be controlled. In some instances the separate remotes could be replaced with a universal remote control; however, universal remotes still had their shortcomings. EX1001, 1:31-36. Generally, universal remotes at the time often did not have the resources (e.g., memory and computational logic) to allow them to be used with all devices, or they might not be capable of controlling a new device. *Id.*, 1:37-40. In addition, in order to accommodate the variety of devices to be controlled, universal remotes usually had a multiplicity of buttons and thus could be difficult to use. *Id.*, 1:40-43.

According to the invention of the ’018 Patent, a system and method for controlling remote devices over a wireless connection is provided. In one

embodiment, a portable computer system having a transceiver is used to control compliant devices. *Id.*, 2:17-22. When it is necessary to locate and identify compliant devices, portable computer system transmits a broadcast message that is received by compliant remote devices. *Id.*, 8:32-35. Each of the remote devices is manifested on a display device of the portable computer system, and one of the devices is selected using, for example, a stylus element. *Id.*, 2:27-30. The stylus element can also be used to specify commands for controlling the remote device. A position where the stylus element makes contact with a surface of the display device of the portable computer system is registered.

The particular position where the stylus element makes contact with the display device is translated into a particular command for controlling the remote device. The command is then transmitted to the remote device over the wireless connection. *Id.*, 2:31-39. Additionally, a rendering of the remote device or of a mechanism that can be used to control the remote device is displayed on the display device. The contact of the stylus element with a position in the rendering is translated into a particular command for controlling the remote device. *Id.*, 2:40-49. Alternatively, a menu of commands for controlling the remote device is displayed on the display device. The contact of the stylus element with a position in the menu is translated into a particular command for controlling the remote device. *Id.* Furthermore, the movement of the stylus element over the surface of an input device is recognized and translated into a particular command for controlling the remote device. By moving the stylus element over the surface of the input device, motion is imparted to the rendering on the display device of the remote device or the

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.