

Filed on behalf of: Nichia Corporation

Paper \_\_\_\_\_

By: Martin M. Zoltick, Lead Counsel  
Robert P. Parker, Back-up Counsel  
Derek F. Dahlgren, Back-up Counsel  
Michael H. Jones, Back-up Counsel  
Mark T. Rawls, Back-up Counsel  
ROTHWELL, FIGG, ERNST & MANBECK, P.C.  
607 14th Street, N.W., Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20005  
Phone: 202-783-6040  
Facsimile: 202-783-6031  
Emails: mzoltick@rfem.com  
rparker@rfem.com  
ddahlgren@rfem.com  
mjones@rfem.com  
mrawls@rfem.com

Date filed: January 29, 2019

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

VIZIO, INC.,  
Petitioner,

v.

NICHIA CORPORATION,  
Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2018-00386  
Patent 9,490,411

---

**PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

TABLE OF CONTENTS..... i  
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES ..... ii  
EXHIBIT LIST ..... iii  
I. Petitioner’s Construction is Inconsistent with the Intrinsic Evidence .....1  
II. Petitioner’s Extrinsic Evidence Cannot Resolve the Dispute .....3  
III. Petitioner’s Arguments Regarding Specification Support for Patent  
Owner’s Construction are Wrong.....3  
IV. Petitioner’s Construction Renders the Disputed Term Superfluous .....4  
V. Conclusion.....5

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

**Cases**

*Liebel-Flarsheim Co. v. Medrad, Inc.*, 358 F.3d 898 (Fed. Cir. 2004) .....1

**EXHIBIT LIST**

<b>Exhibit</b>	<b>Description</b>
2001	Declaration of Dr. Stanley R. Shanfield, dated June 16, 2017, in IPR2017-01608 (Ex. 1003 in that IPR).
2002	Declaration of Dr. Stanley R. Shanfield, dated June 16, 2017, in IPR2017-01623 (Ex. 1103 in that IPR).
2003	Dandan Zhu and Colin J. Humphreys, Solid-State Lighting Based on Light Emitting Diode Technology, Chapter 5 (2016).
2004	Sheng Liu and Xiaobing Luo, LED Packaging for Lighting Applications: Design, Manufacturing and Testing, Chemical Industry Press (2011).
2005	Petition for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review of U.S. Patent No. 9,537,071 in IPR2018-00437, dated January 12, 2018.
2006	U.S. Patent No. 9,537,071.
2007	Vizio Holdings, Inc.'s Amendment No. 3 to Form S-1 Registration Statement, filed with the Securities and Exchange Commission on October 22, 2015 (retrieved from <a href="http://secfilings.nasdaq.com/filingFrameset.asp?FilingID=10964392&amp;RcvdDate=10/22/2015&amp;CoName=VIZIO%20HOLDINGS%20C%20INC.&amp;FormType=S-1/A&amp;View=html%20September%2026,%202016%20Disc\Internet%20articles\FetchF%20VIZIO(4).pdf">http://secfilings.nasdaq.com/filingFrameset.asp?FilingID=10964392&amp;RcvdDate=10/22/2015&amp;CoName=VIZIO%20HOLDINGS%20C%20INC.&amp;FormType=S-1/A&amp;View=html%20September%2026,%202016%20Disc\Internet%20articles\FetchF%20VIZIO(4).pdf</a> ).
2008	Westlaw Company Investigator Reports for Vizio, Inc., AmTran Logistics Company and AmTran Logistics Inc. Company.
2009	Declaration of Dr. Stanley R. Shanfield, dated January 12, 2018, in IPR2018-00437 (Ex. 1003 in that IPR).
2010	Transcript of Teleconference in IPR2017-01608 and IPR2017-01623, dated February 28, 2018 (Ex. 2029 and Ex. 2129 respectively, in those IPRs).
2011	Declaration of Dr. E. Fred Schubert, dated September 18, 2018.

Exhibit	Description
2012	Japanese Patent Publication No. JP2007-235085 (“Urasaki”) with Certified English Translation in IPR2017-01608 and IPR2017-01623 (Exs. 1007 and 1107 respectively, in those IPRs).
2013	Transcript of Stanley R. Shanfield, Ph.D. Deposition, dated May 21, 2018, taken in IPR2017-01608, IPR2017-01623, IPR2018-00893, IPR2017-02011, IPR2017-02014 (Ex. 2710 in IPR2017-01608 and IPR2017-01623).
2014	E. Chen, “III. Wet and Dry Etching,” Harvard University Center for Imaging and Mesoscale Structures (2004) (retrieved from <a href="https://www.mrsec.harvard.edu/education/ap298r2004/Erli%20chen%20Fabrication%20III%20-%20Etching.pdf">https://www.mrsec.harvard.edu/education/ap298r2004/Erli%20chen%20Fabrication%20III%20-%20Etching.pdf</a> ).
2015	Exhibit B to Complaint for Patent Infringement, <i>Nichia Corp. v. Vizio, Inc.</i> , Case No. 2:16-cv-00246, Dkt. 1-2 (E.D. Tex. Mar. 21, 2016 ) [Copy of Memorandum Opinion and Order, <i>Nichia Corp. v. Everlight Elecs. Co.</i> , Case No. 2:13-cv-00702-JGR, Dkt. 193 (E.D. Tex. Jan. 26, 2016)].
2016	<i>EXHIBIT NUMBER NOT BEING USED</i>
2017	<i>EXHIBIT NUMBER NOT BEING USED</i>
2018	<i>EXHIBIT NUMBER NOT BEING USED</i>
2019	<i>EXHIBIT NUMBER NOT BEING USED</i>
2020	Transcript of Teleconference in IPR2018-00386 and IPR2018-00437, dated January 17, 2019.
2021	Transcript of Stanley R. Shanfield, Ph.D. Deposition, dated December 19, 2018.
2022	Exhibit S1 from December 19, 2018 Deposition of Stanley R. Shanfield, Ph.D.
2023	Exhibit S2 from December 19, 2018 Deposition of Stanley R. Shanfield, Ph.D.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.