

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

APOTEX INC. and APOTEX CORP.

Petitioners

v.

ABRAXIS BIOSCIENCE, LLC

Patent Owner

---

Case IPR2018-00153

U.S. Patent No. 7,923,536

---

**PATENT OWNER'S OPPOSITION TO PETITIONERS' MOTION FOR  
JOINER PURSUANT TO 35 U.S.C. § 315(c) AND 37 C.F.R. §§ 42.22 &  
42.122(b)**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES .....	ii
EXHIBIT LIST .....	iv
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
II. BACKGROUND .....	2
III. LEGAL STANDARD .....	4
IV. ARGUMENT.....	5
A. Joinder Should be Denied Because it Would Complicate and Delay, not Simplify or Expedite, the Actavis IPR .....	5
1. A Discovery Extension Would Be Required to Accommodate Discovery from Apotex .....	6
2. The Direct-Competitor Relationship Between Actavis and Apotex Would Complicate the Actavis IPR .....	7
3. The Apotex Petition Presents Real-Party-in-Interest Issues that Would Complicate and Delay the Actavis IPR.....	10
4. Joinder Would Prejudice Abraxis and the Public, But There is No Prejudice to Apotex if Joinder is Denied.....	11
B. Alternatively, a Six-Month Extension is Needed if Apotex is Joined.....	12
V. CONCLUSION.....	13

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

	<b>Page</b>
<b>CASES</b>	
<i>Abraxis Bioscience, LLC v. Actavis LLC</i> , C.A. No. 16-cv-1925 (D.N.J.) .....	2, 8, 9
<i>Actavis LLC v. Abraxis BioScience, LLC</i> , IPR2017-01103 .....	passim
<i>Apotex Corp. v. ViiV Healthcare Co.</i> , IPR2014-00876, Paper No. 24 (PTAB Apr. 2, 2015).....	6, 9
<i>Dell, Inc. v. Network-I Security Solutions, Inc.</i> , IPR2013-00385, Paper No. 17 (PTAB July 29, 2013) .....	5
<i>Samsung Elecs. Co., Ltd. et al. v. Arendi S.A.R.L.</i> , IPR2014-01142, Paper No. 11 (PTAB Oct. 2, 2014).....	8
<i>Samsung Elecs. Co., Ltd. et al. v. Arendi S.A.R.L.</i> , IPR2014-01143, Paper No. 11 (PTAB Oct. 2, 2014).....	8
<i>Sony Corp. of Am. v. Network-I Security Solutions, Inc.</i> , IPR2013-00386, Paper No. 16 (PTAB July 29, 2013) .....	4
<i>Telit Wireless Solutions Inc. v. M2M Solutions LLC</i> , IPR2016-01081, Paper No. 11 (PTAB Sept. 29, 2016).....	12
<i>Unified Patents Inc. v. Personalized Media Communications, LLC</i> , IPR2015-00520, Paper No. 16 (PTAB June 8, 2015) .....	11
<i>Unified Patents, Inc. v. PersonalWeb Tech., LLC</i> , IPR2014-00702, Paper No. 12 (PTAB July 24, 2014) .....	5
<b>OTHER AUTHORITIES</b>	
37 C.F.R. § 42.1(b) .....	5

Opposition to Motion for Joinder in IPR2018-00153  
U.S. Patent 7,923,536

37 C.F.R. § 42.20(c).....4  
37 C.F.R. § 42.51(b)(1)(iii).....7  
37 C.F.R. § 42.122(b) .....3, 4  
35 U.S.C. § 315(c) .....4  
35 U.S.C. § 316(b) .....5

**EXHIBIT LIST**

- Ex. 1 Email from Frank Calvosa, Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP to Counsel for Apotex (Dec. 6, 2017)
- Ex. 2 Email from Eimeric Reig, Winston & Strawn LLP to Andrew Chalson et al., Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP (Nov. 28, 2017)
- Ex. 3 S&P Capital IQ Filtered Corporate Tree Aggregates for Panacea Biotech Limited
- Ex. 4 *Panacea Biotech Ltd*, PHARMABIZ.COM, available at <http://saffron.pharmabiz.com/red.asp?fn=/services/comprof/Panacea.asp6/>
- Ex. 5 Panacea Biotech, Inc., B-400776 (Comp. Gen. Jan. 21, 2009)
- Ex. 6 *Department of State: Division of Corporations, Entity Details, Panacea Biotech, Inc.*, DELAWARE.GOV, available at <https://icis.corp.delaware.gov/Ecorp/EntitySearch/NameSearch.aspx>

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.