

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

WESTERN DIGITAL CORPORATION
Petitioner

v.

SPEX TECHNOLOGIES, INC.
Patent Owner

Case No. IPR2017-_____
Patent 6,088,802

DECLARATION OF MARTIN KALISKI, Ph.D. IN SUPPORT OF
PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW

Mail Stop **Patent Board**
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. INTRODUCTION AND QUALIFICATIONS	1
II. PROFESSIONAL QUALIFICATIONS	1
III. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	4
IV. APPLICABLE LEGAL STANDARD	5
A. Claim Construction	5
B. Obviousness.....	6
V. TECHNOLOGICAL BACKGROUND	9
VI. THE '802 PATENT.....	13
VII. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	15
VIII. PRIOR ART RELIED UPON	16
IX. ANALYSIS.....	16
A. Ground 1: Claims 1–2, 6–7, 11–12, 23–25, and 38–39 are Rendered Obvious by Harari in view of <i>PCM CIA System Architecture</i>	16
1. Summary of Harari	19
2. Summary of <i>PCM CIA System Architecture</i>	24
3. Motivation to Combine	26
4. Independent Claim 1	29
5. Dependent Claim 2	57
6. Independent Claim 6	59
7. Dependent Claim 7	72
8. Independent Claim 11 and Dependent Claim 12	73
9. Independent Claim 23	74
10. Independent Claim 24 and Dependent Claim 25	74
11. Independent claim 38	75
12. Independent claim 39	78
B. Ground 2: Claims 1–2, 11–12, 23, and 39 are Rendered Obvious by Harari in view of Wang	81
1. Summary of Wang	81
2. Motivation to Combine	82
3. Dumas Discloses Mediating Communication of Data Between the Host Computer Device and the Target Means So That the Communicated Data Must First Pass Through the Security Means (Elements [1F], [11E], [23E], and [39C])	84

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
C. Grounds 3-4: Claims 1–2, 11–12, 23, and 39 are Rendered Obvious for the Same Reasons as Grounds 1-2 when Considered Further in View of Dumas.	88
1. Summary of Dumas	89
2. Motivation to Combine	91
3. Dumas Discloses Mediating Communication of Data Between the Host Computing Device and the Target Means So That the Communicated Data Must First Pass Through the Security Means (Elements [1F], [11E], [23E], and [39C])	93
X. CONCLUSION.....	95

I. INTRODUCTION AND QUALIFICATIONS

1. I have been retained on behalf of the Petitioner Western Digital Corporation to provide this Declaration concerning technical subject matter relevant to the *inter partes* review of U.S. Patent No. 6,088,802 (“the ’802 Patent”).

2. I am over 18 years of age. I have personal knowledge of the facts stated in this Declaration and could testify competently to them if asked to do so.

II. PROFESSIONAL QUALIFICATIONS

3. I hold a doctoral degree (PhD) in Electrical Engineering, granted by the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (“MIT”) in 1971, as well as a Master’s degree in Electrical Engineering from MIT and two Bachelor’s degrees (Electrical Engineering and Mathematics), also from MIT. I received my Bachelor of Science in Electrical Engineering in 1966, and my Bachelor of Science in Mathematics in 1968. I received my Master of Science also in 1968.

4. I taught at Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo, from 1986 to 2007 in its Electrical Engineering Department. I was active in its Computer Engineering program since its inception in the early 1990s. My main areas of interest encompassed computer systems, software systems, industrial systems, control systems, digital logic, and embedded systems. I taught extensively in the latter areas in recent years, at both the undergraduate and graduate levels. My courses included undergraduate courses based upon FPGAs and CPLDs, digital logic courses, and

graduate design courses in embedded system design, oriented about microcontrollers, using both wireless and wired technologies. I also taught graduate courses in asynchronous hardware design and in computer arithmetic. I have a special interest in both software and hardware design recovery.

5. I was involved in both contract research and private consulting for close to thirty-five years. Typical project areas included software and hardware design reconstruction, software quality assurance, remote tracking technologies, algorithm development for CAD/CAM systems and expert systems in industrial automation applications, trouble-shooting fault detection microcode, software engineering for advanced signal processing applications, development and implementation of algorithms for finite-state controller design, design of disk head assembly fault diagnostics, development of expert systems for verification of design standards for PC board design and for component testability, documentation and analysis of BIOS software, development of training manuals, classical expert system design, software design recovery research in transportation engineering and expert system approaches to telephone system reliability, to name a few.

6. I have been engaged as an expert witness in numerous technology based matters for the past sixteen years, with a focus on patent infringement, trade secret misappropriation and copyright infringement. My cases have covered such diverse areas as machine vision, electronics packaging, data encryption, mainframe and

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.