

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

RUIZ FOOD PRODUCTS INC.,
PETITIONER,

v.

MACROPOINT LLC,
PATENT OWNER.

Case IPR2017-02018
Patent 9,429,659

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	A PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART (“POSITA”).....	2
III.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	6
	A. Broadest reasonable interpretation of claims does not limit claims to a “freight-carrying vehicle”	6
	B. Scope of “freight-carrying vehicle”	8
IV.	CLAIMS 1-30 ARE UNPATENTABLE	9
	A. Patent Owner Does Not Dispute Enzmann Renders Obvious Monitoring Location of a Vehicle.....	10
	B. Enzmann Renders Obvious Monitoring the Location of a Freight-Carrying Vehicle	12
	C. Enzmann renders obvious monitoring the location of a vehicle of a freight service provider (claims 6, 18 and 27).	20
	D. Enzmann renders obvious an indication of consent in the form of receipt of location information from location information provider (claim 7).....	21
	E. Claims 5, 7 and 26 under 35 U.S.C. § 103 are unpatentable over Enzmann in view of King.....	25
	F. Claims 11 and 16 under 35 U.S.C. § 103 are unpatentable over Enzmann in view of Dhanni.....	25
V.	CONCLUSION.....	26

LIST OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit 1001	U.S. Patent No. 9,429,659 (“the ‘659 patent”)
Exhibit 1002	Expert Declaration of Scott Denning
Exhibit 1003	Scott Denning CV
Exhibit 1004	U.S. Patent No. 7,130,630 to Enzmann et al. (“Enzmann”)
Exhibit 1005	U.S. Patent No. 8,045,995 to King et al. (“King”)
Exhibit 1006	U.S. Patent No. 8,395,547 to Dhanani et al. (“Dhanani”)
Exhibit 1007	Prosecution File History of the ‘659 Patent (“the ‘659 prosecution history”)
Exhibit 1008	CTIA, Best Practices and Guidelines for Location-Based Services, May 23, 2012
Exhibit 1009	U.S. Design Patent No. D580,387 to Andre et al. (“Andre”)
Exhibit 1010	U.S. Patent No. 6,833,811 to Zeitfuss et al. (“Zeitfuss”)
Exhibit 1011	U.S. Patent No. 7,864,163 to Ording et al. (“Ording”)

Exhibit 1012	Order Dismissing Complaint Without Prejudice, <i>FourKites, Inc. v MacroPoint, LLC</i> , Case No. 1:16-cv-02703-CAB (N.D. Ohio) (entered on June 27, 2017)
Exhibit 1013	Proof of Service of Complaint of Patent Infringement, <i>MacroPoint, LLC v Ruiz Food Products, Inc.</i> , 6:16-cv-01133 (E.D. TX) (served on August 31, 2016)
Exhibit 1014	Complaint of Patent Infringement, <i>MacroPoint, LLC v Ruiz Food Products, Inc.</i> , 6:16-cv-01133 (E.D. TX)
Exhibit 1015	U.S. Patent No. 4,736,290 to McCallion (“McCallion”)
Exhibit 1016	U.S. Patent No. 4,467,420 to Murakami (“Murakami”)
Exhibit 1017	U.S. Patent No. 4,768,150 to Chang et al. (“Chang”)
Exhibit 1018	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2008/0186166 to Zhou et al. (“Zhou”)
Exhibit 1019	Rebuttal Expert Report of Ivan Zatkovich

Exhibit 1020	Deposition Transcript of David H Williams
Exhibit 1021	Joint claim construction chart, submitted in <i>MacroPoint, LLC v Ruiz Food Products, Inc.</i> , 6:16-cv-01133 (E.D. TX) (submitted on September 14, 2017)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.