UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC.
Petitioner

v.

UNILOC LUXEMBOURG, S.A.
Patent Owner

Case: IPR2017-01802
U.S. Patent No. 7,535,890

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION 2

A. "Transmitting" / "Receiving" the "Selected Recipients and the Instant Voice Message" (Claims 1 and 40) 2

B. "Delivering the Instant voice Message to the Selected Recipients" and "Temporarily Storing the Instant Voice Message if a Selected Recipient is Unavailable" (Claims 1 and 40) 5

C. "Temporarily Storing" (Claims 1, 14, 40, and 51) 6

III. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE OBVIOUS OVER THE PRIOR ART 7

A. *Griffin* Discloses "Transmitting the Selected Recipients and the Instant Voice Message" and "Receiving the Selected Recipients and the Instant Voice Message" Under the Proper Construction. 7

B. The Combination of *Griffin* and *Zydney* Discloses "Delivering the Instant Voice Message to the Selected Recipients Over the Network" and "Storing the Instant Voice Message if a Selected Recipient is Unavailable" 8

C. *Malik* Discloses a Local/External Network Configuration. 11

D. A POSA Would Have Been Motivated to Combine *Griffin* and *Zydney* for the Reasons Explained in the Petition 13

1. *Griffin*'s and *Zydney*'s Teachings Related to Availability are Compatible 14

2. PO's Arguments Regarding *Griffin*'s Text-Only Buddies Are Misplaced 17

3. Messages Would Not Be Lost in the Combined System 20

E. PO's Redundancy Arguments Were Already Found to be Unpersuasive 21

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

IV. CONCLUSION.....21

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

Allied Erecting and Dismantling Co., Inc. v. Genesis Attachments,
825 F.3d 1373 (Fed. Cir. 2016) 15, 18

Apple Inc. v. Uniloc USA, Inc.,
No. IPR2017-00221, Paper 33 (P.T.A.B. May 23, 2018) 1

Enercon GmbH v. Int'l Trade Comm'n,
151 F.3d 1376 (Fed. Cir. 1998) 3

Hill-Rom Servs., Inc. v. Stryker Corp.,
755 F.3d 1367 (Fed. Cir. 2014) 3

In re Merck & Co.,
800 F.2d 1091 (Fed. Cir. 1986) 8

SuperGuide Corp. v. DirecTV Enters., Inc.,
358 F.3d 870 (Fed. Cir. 2004) 3

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

LIST OF EXHIBITS[1]

No.	Description	Previously Submitted
1001	U.S. Patent No. 7,535,890	X
1002	Declaration of Dr. Zygmunt J. Haas	X
1003	Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Zygmunt J. Haas	X
1004	File History of U.S. Patent Application No. 10/740,030, which issued as U.S. Patent No. 7,535,890	X
1005	U.S. Patent No. 8,150,922 ("*Griffin*")	X
1006	International Published Application No. WO01/11824A2 ("*Zydney*")	X
1007	RESERVED	
1008	WO 02/17650A1 ("*Vaananen*")	X
1009	RESERVED	
1010	RESERVED	
1011	U.S. Patent No. 7,016,978	X
1012	U.S. Patent No. 7,123,695 ("*Malik*")	X
1013 - 1023	RESERVED	
1024	Harry Newton, *Newton's Telecom Dictionary* (16th. ed. 2000)	X
1025	John Rittinghouse, *IM Instant Messaging Security* (1st ed. 2005)	X

[1] Citations to non-patent publications are to the original page numbers of the publication, and citations to U.S. patents are to column:line number of the patents.

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.