

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC.
Petitioner

v.

UNILOC LUXEMBOURG, S.A.
Patent Owner

Case: IPR2017-01799
U.S. Patent No. 8,199,747

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION1

 A. “Node” (Claim 2)1

 B. “Instant Voice Message” (All Challenged Claims)1

 1. The IVM Is a Message Containing Digitized Speech2

 2. “Instant” Means Capable of Being Transmitted in Real Time to a Recipient Device.....5

III. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE OBVIOUS OVER THE PRIOR ART7

 A. *Griffin* Discloses an “Instant Voice Message”7

 B. *Zydney* Discloses “Controlling a Method of Generating” an Instant Voice Message8

 1. *Zydney* and the ’747 Patent Disclose “Controlling a Method of Generating” an Instant Voice Message in the Same Way8

 2. PO Does Not Accurately Characterize Petitioner’s Arguments or *Zydney*’s Two Modes of Generating13

 3. The Board’s Reasoning in IPR2017-01257 Is Not Applicable Here14

 C. The Combination of *Griffin* and *Zydney* Discloses “Attaching One or More Files to the Audio File”15

 D. The Combination of *Griffin* and *Zydney* Discloses the Limitations of Claim 218

 1. PO Improperly Attacks the Teachings of *Griffin* and *Zydney* Individually Instead of the Combined Teachings of these References18

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(continued)

	Page
2. <i>Griffin</i> 's Buddy List Update Message 600 Includes the Status of Each Node.....	21
3. <i>Griffin</i> Alone or in Combination with <i>Zydney</i> Discloses "Nodes Within the Packet-Switched Network," Even If "Within" Requires a Direct Connection	22
IV. CONCLUSION.....	24

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

Facebook, Inc. v. Uniloc USA, Inc.,
IPR2017-01257, Paper 8 (P.T.A.B. Dec. 4, 2017)14, 15

In re Katz Interactive Call Processing Patent Litig.,
639 F.3d 13033

In re Merck & Co.,
800 F.2d 1091 (Fed. Cir. 1986)20

Ruiz v. A.B. Chance Co.,
357 F.3d 1270 (Fed. Cir. 2004)23

Ultratec, Inc. v. CaptionCall, LLC,
872 F.3d 1267 (Fed. Cir. 2017)4

LIST OF EXHIBITS¹

No.	Description	Previously Submitted
1001	U.S. Patent No. 8,199,747	X
1002	Declaration of Dr. Zygmunt J. Haas	X
1003	Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Zygmunt J. Haas	X
1004	File History of U.S. Patent Application No. 12/398,076, which issued as U.S. Patent No. 8,199,747	X
1005	U.S. Patent No. 8,150,922 (“ <i>Griffin</i> ”)	X
1006	International Published Application No. WO 01/11824A2 (“ <i>Zydney</i> ”)	X
1007	RESERVED	
1008	International Published Application No. WO 02/17650A1	X
1009 - 1012	RESERVED	
1013	N. Borenstein et al., Request for Comments (RFC) 1521: <i>MIME (Multipurpose Internet Mail Extensions) Part One: Mechanisms for Specifying and Describing the Format of Internet Message Bodies</i> (Sept. 1993)	X
1014 - 1017	RESERVED	
1018	U.S. Patent No. 8,724,622	
1019	RESERVED	

¹ Citations to non-patent publications are to the original page numbers of the publication, and citations to U.S. patents are to column:line number of the patents.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.