

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

PAR PHARMACEUTICAL, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

HORIZON THERAPEUTICS, LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2017-01768
Patent 9,095,559

REPLY DECLARATION OF NEAL SONDHEIMER, M.D., Ph.D.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction.....1

 A. Qualifications1

 B. Scope of Work.....1

II. Ground 1 of Par’s Petition Renders the Challenged Claims Obvious.....2

 A. A POSA Would Have Increased Drug Doses for Patients Having “Normal” Ammonia Levels.....3

 B. A POSA Would Have Used Fasting Plasma Ammonia Levels to Determine Dosing.....4

 C. Dr. Enns Exaggerates the Risk of Overdosing.....6

III. Grounds 2 and 3 of Par’s Petition Renders the Challenged Claims Obvious.7

IV. The Prior Art Does Not Teach Away from the Challenged Claims8

V. Conclusion11

Reply Declaration of Neal Sondheimer, M.D., Ph.D. (Exhibit 1028)

I, Neal Sondheimer, do hereby declare as follows:

I. INTRODUCTION

A. Qualifications

1. My background and qualifications are described in Section II of my initial declaration submitted in the proceeding on July 13, 2017 (“Initial Declaration”) (EX1002, ¶¶7-13). I incorporate those qualifications by reference here. I am being compensated as set forth in my Initial Declaration (EX1002, ¶2), and I continue to have no personal or financial interest in Par or in the outcome of this proceeding.

B. Scope of Work

2. For this declaration, I was asked to review and discuss the declaration of Dr. Gregory M. Enns (“the Enns Declaration”). (EX2006.) I have also reviewed the Horizon’s Patent Owner Response (Paper 22) (“Horizon’s POR”). Nothing in the Enns Declaration or Horizon’s POR alters or changes my opinions set forth in my Initial Declaration.

3. This declaration is a statement of my additional opinions in this matter and the basis and reasons for those opinions. In forming the opinions expressed in this declaration, I have relied upon my education, experience, and knowledge of the subject matter discussed. In addition to my Initial Declaration and the materials identified therein, I have also reviewed, considered, or relied upon documents and other materials, which are cited in the table below:

Reply Declaration of Neal Sondheimer, M.D., Ph.D. (Exhibit 1028)

Exhibit No.	Description
2012	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2012/0022157, filed August 27, 2009, published January 26, 2012
2013	Tuchman & Batshaw, <i>Management of Inherited Disorders of Ureagenesis</i> , 12 <i>The Endocrinologist</i> 99–109 (2002). (“Tuchman”).
2015	Broomfield & Grunewald, <i>How to Use Serum Ammonia</i> , 97 <i>Arch. Dis. Child Educ. Pract. Ed.</i> 72-77 (2011)
2018	Kasumov et al., <i>New Secondary Metabolites of Phenylbutyrate in Humans and Rats</i> , 32 <i>Drug Metabolism and Disposition</i> 10-19 (2004)
2019	Häberle et al., <i>Suggested Guidelines for the Diagnosis and Management of Urea Cycle Disorders</i> , 7 <i>Orphanet J. Rare Diseases</i> 1-30 (2012)
2025	Colloquium, <i>Consensus Statement from a Conference for the Management of Patients with Urea Cycle Disorders</i> , 138 <i>J. Pediatrics</i> S1-S5 (2001)
2031	Cheson et al., <i>Novel Therapeutic Agents for the Treatment of Myelodysplastic Syndromes</i> , 27 <i>Seminars in Oncology</i> 560-77 (John W. Yarbrow, et al. eds., 2000)
2032	Scaglia et al., <i>Effect of Alternative Pathway Therapy on Branched Chain Amino Acid Metabolism in Urea Cycle Disorder Patients</i> , 81 <i>Molecular Genetics and Metabolism, Supplement 1</i> S79-S85 (2004)
2046	Transcript of the Deposition of Dr. Neal Sondheimer, taken April 19, 2018

II. GROUND 1 OF PAR’S PETITION
RENDERS THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS OBVIOUS.

4. From my review of the Enns Declaration and Horizon’s POR, I understand Horizon to only argue that the prior art does not teach (1) adjusting doses in patients who have plasma ammonia levels between one-half the ULN and the ULN; and (2) using “fasting” plasma ammonia levels in making decisions

Reply Declaration of Neal Sondheimer, M.D., Ph.D. (Exhibit 1028)

about drug dosing, with respect to Horizon's challenge to Ground 1 of Par's

Petition. I disagree.

A. A POSA Would Have Increased Drug Doses for Patients Having "Normal" Ammonia Levels.

5. Dr. Enns states "Fernandes only suggests that plasma ammonia levels at emergency levels (i.e., $>120 \mu\text{mol/L}$) warrant dosage increases." (EX2006, ¶66.) And he states that "Fernandes defines the normal range for plasma ammonia as $<50 \mu\text{mol/L}$," not the $<80 \mu\text{mol/L}$ presented in Fernandes's Figure 17.2. (*Id.* at ¶64.) But as I stated in my Initial Declaration, Fernandes clearly advises increasing the dosage of medication in patients with plasma ammonia levels $<80 \mu\text{mol/L}$. (EX1002, ¶59.) And while Fernandes discloses $50 \mu\text{mol/L}$ as one ULN, Fernandes also expressly discloses that "[h]ealthy neonates have slightly higher values." (EX1015, 217-18.) To that end, Blau describes hyperammonemia as being "plasma ammonia >80 in newborns or $>50 \mu\text{mol/L}$ after 28 days postnatally." (EX1006, 5.) A POSA would also understand that $80 \mu\text{mol/L}$ in Figure 17.2, therefore, is a reasonable ULN for some UCD patients, for example, newborns.

6. Fernandes's Figure 17.2 is reproduced below with a red box highlighting the branch of the treatment protocol for patients having a "normal" plasma ammonia:

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.