

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS COMPANY, LTD.  
Petitioner

v.

DANIEL L. FLAMM  
Patent Owner

---

U.S. Patent No. 5,711,849

---

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW  
OF U.S. PATENT NO. 5,711,849**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	<b>Page</b>
1. INTRODUCTION .....	1
2. REQUIREMENTS FOR PETITION FOR INTER PARTES REVIEW .....	1
2.1. Grounds for Standing (37 C.F.R. § 42.104(a)) .....	1
2.2. Notice of Lead and Backup Counsel and Service Information.....	2
2.3. Notice of Real-Parties-in-Interest (37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(1)).....	3
2.4. Notice of Related Matters (37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(2)).....	3
2.5. Fee for <i>Inter Partes</i> Review .....	5
2.6. Proof of Service.....	5
3. IDENTIFICATION OF CLAIMS BEING CHALLENGED (§ 42.104(B)).....	5
4. OVERVIEW OF THE 849 PATENT.....	5
5. 849 PATENT PROSECUTION HISTORY .....	13
6. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....	15
6.1. Applicable Law .....	15
6.2. Construction of Claim Terms.....	15
6.2.1. “surface reaction rate constant” (all claims).....	16
7. PERSON HAVING ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART .....	19
8. DESCRIPTION OF THE PRIOR ART .....	20
8.1. Alkire (Ex. 1005).....	20
8.2. Kao (Ex. 1006) .....	24
8.3. Flamm (Ex. 1007).....	29
8.4. Motivations To Combine: Alkire in Combination with Kao .....	30
8.5. Motivations To Combine: Alkire in Combination with Kao and Flamm.....	32
9. GROUND #1: CLAIMS 1-29 OF THE 849 PATENT ARE UNPATENTABLE AS OBVIOUS OVER ALKIRE IN VIEW OF KAO.....	34
9.1. Claim 1 is obvious over Alkire in view of Kao .....	34

9.1.1.	[1.P] “A device fabrication method comprising the steps of:” .....	34
9.1.2.	[1.1] “providing a plasma etching apparatus comprising a substrate therein, said substrate comprising a top surface and a film overlying said top surface, said film comprising a top film surface;” .....	35
9.1.3.	[1.2] “etching said top film surface to define a relatively non-uniform etching profile on said film, and defining etch rate data comprising an etch rate and a spatial coordinate which defines a position within said relatively non-uniform etching profile on said substrate, said etching comprising a reaction between a gas phase etchant and said film; and” .....	37
9.1.4.	[1.3] “extracting a surface reaction rate constant from said etch rate data, and using said surface reaction rate constant in the fabrication of a device.” .....	41
9.2.	Claim 10 is obvious over Alkire in view of Kao .....	46
9.2.1.	[10.P] “A method of designing a reactor comprising the steps of:” .....	46
9.2.2.	[10.1] “providing a first plasma etching apparatus comprising a substrate therein, said substrate comprising a top surface and a film overlying said top surface, said film comprising a top film surface” .....	47
9.2.3.	[10.2] “etching said top film surface to define a relatively non-uniform etching profile on said film, and defining etch rate data comprising an etch rate and a spatial coordinate which defines a position within said relatively non-uniform etching profile on said film of said substrate, said etching comprising a reaction between a gas phase etchant and said film; and” .....	47
9.2.4.	[10.3] “extracting a surface reaction rate constant from said etch rate data, and using said surface reaction rate constant in designing a second plasma etching apparatus.” .....	48
9.3.	Claim 20 is obvious over Alkire in view of Kao .....	49

9.3.1.	[20.p] “A substrate fabrication method, using a plasma etching apparatus, said method comprising:”	49
9.3.2.	[20.1] “providing a substrate selected from a group consisting of a semiconductor wafer, a plate, and a flat panel display, said substrate comprising a top surface;”	49
9.3.3.	[20.2] “forming a film overlying said top surface, said film comprising a top film surface;”	50
9.3.4.	[20.3] “etching said top film surface to define a relatively non-uniform profile on said film, and defining etch rate data comprising an etch rate and a spatial coordinate which defines a position within said relatively non-uniform etching profile of said film on said substrate, said etching comprising a reaction between a gas phase etchant and said film; and”	50
9.3.5.	[20.4] “extracting a surface reaction rate constant from said etch rate data, and using said surface reaction rate constant.”	51
9.4.	Claim 22 is obvious over Alkire in view of Kao	51
9.4.1.	[22.P] “A method of fabricating an integrated circuit device, using a plasma etching apparatus, said method comprising:”	51
9.4.2.	[22.1] “providing a uniformity value and a surface reaction rate constant for an etching reaction, said etching reaction including a substrate and etchant species;”	52
9.4.3.	[22.2] “defining etching parameters providing said uniformity value; and”	
9.4.4.	[22.3] “adjusting at least one of said etching parameters using said surface reaction rate constant to produce a selected etching rate”	55
9.4.5.	[22.4] “wherein said etching rate providing an etching condition for fabrication of an integrated circuit device.”	57
9.5.	Claim 26 is obvious over Alkire in view of Kao	58
9.5.1.	[26.P] “A process for fabricating a device using a plasma etching apparatus, said device being fabricated	

	by use of a surface reaction rate constant, said surface reaction rate constant being derived from a method comprising:” .....	58
9.5.2.	[26.1] “providing a plasma etching apparatus comprising a substrate therein, said substrate comprising a top surface and a film overlying said top surface, said film comprising a top film surface” .....	58
9.5.3.	[26.2] “etching said top surface at a temperature to define a relatively non-uniform etching profile on said film, and defining etch rate data comprising an etch rate and a spatial coordinate which defined a position from said relatively non-uniform etching profile on said film of said substrate, said etching comprising a reaction between a gas phase etchant and said film; and” .....	59
9.5.4.	[26.3] “extracting from said etching rate data a surface reaction rate constant for said temperature.” .....	59
9.6.	Dependent Claims 2 and 11 are obvious over Alkire in view of Kao .....	60
9.6.1.	[2.0] “The method of claim 1 wherein said etching step is diffusion limited.” .....	60
	[11.0] “The method of claim 10 wherein said etching step at a position [sic] on said relatively non-uniform etching profile is diffusion limited.” .....	60
9.7.	Dependent Claims 3 and 12 are obvious over Alkire in view of Kao .....	60
9.7.1.	[3.0] “The method of claim 1 wherein said spatial coordinate includes a radius and an angle.” .....	61
	[12.0] “The method of claim 10 wherein said spatial coordinate which defines said position along said relatively non-uniform etching profile includes a radius and an angle.” .....	61
9.8.	Dependent Claims 4 and 13 are obvious over Alkire in view of Kao .....	63
9.8.1.	[4.0] “The method of claim 1 wherein said spatial coordinate includes an x-direction and a y-direction.” .....	63

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.