## UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

### BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

\_\_\_\_\_\_

DELL INC.; EMC CORPORATION; HEWLETT-PACKARD ENTERPRISE CO.; HP ENTERPRISE SERVICES, LLC; TERADATA OPERATIONS, INC.; and VERITAS TECHNOLOGIES, LLC, Petitioner,

v.

## REALTIME DATA LLC, Patent Owner.

\_\_\_\_\_\_

Case IPR2017-00176 (Patent 7,161,506 C2) Case IPR2017-00179 (Patent 9,054,728 B2) Case IPR2017-00806 (Patent 7,161,506 C2) Case IPR2017-00808 (Patent 9,054,728 B2)

> Record of Oral Hearing Held: February 20, 2018

> > \_\_\_\_\_

Before JASON J. CHUNG, SCOTT C. MOORE, SHEILA F. McSHANE, and KAMRAN JIVANI, *Administrative Patent Judges*.



## **APPEARANCES:**

### ON BEHALF OF THE PETITIONER:

MICHAEL WOODS, ESQUIRE ANDREW R. SOMMER, ESQUIRE Winston & Strawn, LLP 1700 K Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006

## ON BEHALF OF PATENT OWNER:

KAYVAN B. NOROOZI, ESQUIRE Noroozi, P.C. 1299 Ocean Avenue Suite 450 Santa Monica, California 90401

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing on Tuesday, February 20, 2018, commencing at 2:38 p.m., at the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, 600 Dulany Street, Alexandria, Virginia.



1	PROCEEDINGS
2	
3	JUDGE CHUNG: We are convened for the consolidated
4	hearing of IPR2017-00176, which has been consolidated with
5	IPR2017-00806, and joined with IPR2017-01688. The judges for that
6	panel consist of Judges Scott Moore and Sheila McShane and I. The
7	other three cases in this consolidated hearing are IPR2017-00179, which
8	has been consolidated with IPR2017-00808 and has been joined with
9	IPR2017-01690. The panel for those three cases consists of Judges Scott
10	Moore and Kamran Jivani and I. The presence of four judges here is not
11	an indication of an expanded panel. The judges will be presiding on
12	cases only as noted.
13	Because three of my colleagues are joining remotely, we
14	respectfully request counsel for each side to speak clearly into the
15	microphone and identify the slide number that they are referring to. To
16	the extent that petitioner wants to use the ELMO projection device,
17	please keep in mind that there's a chance that the remote judges cannot
18	see what you are referring to on the ELMO device and to please speak
19	clearly and describe clearly what you are referencing in the ELMO
20	device.
21	As for objections, we want the free flow of conversation of each
22	party, so to the extent that each party has an objection, please preserve
23	them until it is their time to sneak



1	At this time, will petitioner please identify themselves?
2	MR. SOMMER: Thank you, Your Honor. Andrew Sommer on
3	behalf of petitioners.
4	JUDGE CHUNG: Patent owner?
5	MR. NOROOZI: Kayvan Noroozi on behalf of Realtime Data.
6	JUDGE CHUNG: Thank you. Each party will have
7	45 minutes to present their arguments. And because petitioner has the
8	burden, petitioner will go first. Petitioner has the option of reserving
9	some rebuttal time which will be taken away from which will be part
10	of their 45 minutes total. At this time, does petitioner know how much
11	rebuttal time they would like to reserve?
12	MR. SOMMER: Yes, Your Honor, we would like to reserve
13	18 minutes for rebuttal.
14	JUDGE CHUNG: Thank you. Because there is no timer on the
15	wall, I will let petitioner know when they have a few minutes left and I
16	will also do the same for patent owner. Because petitioner reserved
17	18 minutes of rebuttal time, I set the timer for 27 minutes. At this time,
18	petitioner, you may begin.
19	MR. SOMMER: Thank you, Your Honor. Can all the remote
20	judges hear me?
21	JUDGE JIVANI: Yes, please proceed.
22	JUDGE McSHANE: Yes, we can.
23	MR. SOMMER: May it please the Board, Andrew Sommer on
24	behalf of petitioner. Today we are going to be discussing two patents,



- 1 the '506 and the '728 patent. And both share a very common
- 2 specification. I think they are identical but for some of the formalities of
- 3 cross-referencing the related applications. And there are some slight
- 4 differences in the claims, some of which matter in these proceedings.
- 5 And we'll talk about those in a bit.
- 6 So here are the topics that I would like to cover today here in
- 7 our argument. This is slide 2. And the first thing I would like to do is
- 8 give a brief overview of the '506 and '728 patents. No doubt Your
- 9 Honors are familiar with the disclosure and the claims of this particular
- 10 patent. So I will be expeditious.
- Then, I will give an overview of Franaszek, Hsu and Sebastian
- and the relevant teachings of these references with respect to the
- invalidity arguments that are presented in the petition and explained
- 14 further in the reply.
- Finally, I'll conclude about giving our explanation about why
- the evidence in this proceeding establishes that the challenged claims are
- 17 obvious over the prior art.
- So turning to slide 3, we have here Figures 13A and 13B of the
- 19 challenged patents, and it's identical between the two. What happens
- 20 here is a data stream is received by this compression device, and after
- some buffering and some counting of the blocks, there's a decision made.
- 22 It looks at the content of this data and it determines whether it recognizes
- 23 it or not. And if the system recognizes the content of the data, it sends it
- 24 into the branch called content-dependent encoders. And the idea in the



# DOCKET

## Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### **LAW FIRMS**

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### **FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS**

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## **E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS**

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

