

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

BRECKENRIDGE PHARMACEUTICAL, INC.

Petitioner

v.

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION

Patent Owner

Case IPR2017-_____
U.S. Patent No. 8,410,131

**DECLARATION OF ALLAN J. PANTUCK, M.D. IN SUPPORT OF
PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF
U.S. PATENT NO. 8,410,131**

Table of Contents

I. INTRODUCTION AND QUALIFICATIONS.....	1
II. UNDERSTANDING OF THE GOVERNING LAW	3
A. Invalidity by Anticipation.....	3
B. Invalidity by Obviousness	3
C. Interpreting Claims Before the Patent Office	6
D. Materials Relied on in Forming My Opinions.....	7
III. THE PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART OF THE '131 PATENT	7
IV. PERSPECTIVE APPLIED IN THIS DECLARATION.....	8
V. ALTERNATIVE NAMES FOR RAPAMYCIN AND ITS DERIVATIVES	9
VI. OVERVIEW OF THE '131 PATENT.....	13
A. Disclosure of the '131 Patent	13
B. Prosecution History of the '131 Patent	22
VII. CLAIM CONSTRUCTIONS	32
A. Legal Standard	32
B. Construction of Claim Terms	32
1. "Inhibiting Growth of Solid Excretory System Tumors in a Subject"	32
a. "Inhibiting Growth".....	33
b. "Solid Excretory System Tumors".....	34
c. "Subject ".....	36

2. "advanced solid excretory system tumor"	37
3. "kidney tumor"	39
4. "unit dosage form"	39
VIII. STATE OF THE PRIOR ART TO THE '131 PATENT.....	40
A. Rapamycin (Sirolimus).....	40
B. Rapamycin Derivatives.....	45
1. Everolimus.....	46
2. Temsirolimus.....	51
C. Activity of Sirolimus, Temsirolimus, and Everolimus.....	56
D. Understanding of Excretory System Tumors	62
E. Understanding of Metastasis.....	67
IX. TREATMENTS FOR RENAL CELL CARCINOMA AND RENAL ANGIOMYOLIPOMA.....	70
X. THE PRIOR ART RELIED UPON	73
A. Schuler	76
B. Crowe.....	80
C. Neumayer.....	82
D. Alexandre.....	86
E. Hidalgo.....	88
F. Luan	96
G. Wasik	98
1. A POSA would understand that Wasik describes using everolimus to inhibit growth of advanced kidney tumors.....	107
H. Navarro	111

XI. MOTIVATIONS TO COMBINE THE PRIOR ART.....	113
A. Motivation to Combine Wasik with Navarro	113
B. Motivation to Combine Wasik, Navarro, Crowe, and Luan.....	113
C. Motivation to Combine Hidalgo, Alexandre, Crowe, Schuler, Neumayer, and Navarro	114
D. Motivation to Combine Hidalgo, Alexandre, Crowe, Schuler, Neumayer, Navarro, and Luan.....	117
XII. GROUNDS OF INVALIDITY	118
A. Ground 1: Claims 1-3 and 5-9 of the '131 patent are invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 102(a) or §102(e)(1) on the ground that they are anticipated by Wasik.....	119
1. Claims 1-3	119
2. Claims 5-9	125
a. Claim 5	126
b. Claim 6	126
c. Claims 7-9.....	128
B. Ground 2: Claims 1-3 and 5-9 of the '131 patent are invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) on the ground that they are rendered obvious by Wasik alone or in combination with Navarro.....	130
C. Ground 3: Claims 1-3 and 5-9 of the '131 patent are invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) on the ground that they are rendered obvious by the combination of Wasik, Navarro, Crowe, and Luan	132
D. Ground 4: Claims 1-3 and 5-9 of the '131 patent are invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) on the ground that they are rendered obvious by the combination of Hidalgo, Alexandre, Crowe, Schuler, Neumayer, and Navarro	135
1. Claims 1-3	136

2. Claims 5-9143

E. Ground 5: Claims 1-3 and 5-9 of the '131 patent are invalid under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) on the ground that they are rendered obvious by the combination of Hidalgo, Alexandre, Crowe, Schuler, Neumayer, Navarro, and Luan.....145

XIII. SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS.....147

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.